<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Page</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Author</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>CRITICAL EVALUATION AND INTERPRETATION OF CANNIBALISM IN THE</td>
<td>Mercedes Hunter</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>ARCHAEOLOGICAL RECORD</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12</td>
<td>A CHRONOLOGICAL REVIEW OF SCALP-TAKING IN PRE- AND POST-CONTACT</td>
<td>Matthew Jensby</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>AMERICA</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>19</td>
<td>AN ANALYSIS OF THE POTTERY FROM THE FLOODWAY VILLAGE SITE</td>
<td>Garth Sutton</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>EaLf-09 IN SOUTHERN MANITOBA</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>34</td>
<td>MEDICAL SYMBIOSES: A COLLABORATIVE APPROACH TO HIV/AIDS IN SOUTH</td>
<td>Christian Barritt-Cleary</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>AFRICA</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>44</td>
<td>DISABILITY RIGHTS: HISTORY, TERMINOLOGY AND ADVOCACY</td>
<td>Hannah Oudenaar</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>53</td>
<td>SAFE ROAD PROTEST: YOUTHS’ POLITICAL CONSCIOUSNESS AND PROTEST</td>
<td>Mahfuzar Rahman</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>FOR JUSTICE IN EVERYDAY LIFE</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>63</td>
<td>THE CULTURE OF IMPURITY IN POST-WAR GUATEMALA</td>
<td>Adriana Nelsen-Gross</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>71</td>
<td>EXPLORING ONLINE INCEL SUBCULTURE</td>
<td>Candice Guild</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>77</td>
<td>YOUTH AND POWER IN MOONRISE KINGDOM</td>
<td>Tracey Turner</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>82</td>
<td>ANTHROPOLOGY IN IRAN AND IRAQ: WAR AND WOMEN</td>
<td>Mina Dousti</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>91</td>
<td>CLIMATE CHANGE AND HUMAN RIGHTS: US AGAINST THE WORLD (AND OURSELVES)</td>
<td>Kylie Nicolajsen</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>99</td>
<td>IN PURSUIT OF JUSTICE: INDIGENOUS EXPERIENCE &amp; THE CANADIAN CRIMINAL</td>
<td>Kaitlyn Martin</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>JUSTICE SYSTEM</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>111</td>
<td>CUBAN WOMAN PARADOX: THE CONDITIONAL ADVANCE OF WOMEN’S RIGHTS</td>
<td>Elizabeth Walker</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>THROUGH THE REVOLUTION &amp; ITS REPERCUSSIONS</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>118</td>
<td>GOVERNMENTALITY AND MANAGING RISK THROUGH THE YOUTH JUSTICE SYSTEM</td>
<td>Victoria Stagg</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Weaving in and out of this year’s UMASA conference theme, “The Future of Anthropology,” this journal represents the collective inspirations, passions, and interests of University of Manitoba students from the 2018-2019 academic year. As comrades, we frequently wonder amongst ourselves: what is the future of anthropology, and what is our future in this field? No clear answer ever emerges. Yet, as aspiring anthropologists, archaeologists, world-engagers, and world-changers, we know we are on a lifelong journey of learning. We also know that to learn is to adapt. The future is our adaptation.

This issue contains fourteen essays from students at varying levels of study that are at once highly diverse and complexly interconnected. In the pages that lie ahead, students explore archaeological wonders, history, human rights, political conflicts, war, indigeneity, issues concerning youth, and more…

A special thanks goes out to those whose effort, enthusiasm, and support made this journal possible.
A CRITICAL EVALUATION AND INTERPRETATION OF CANNIBALISM IN THE
ARCHAEOLOGICAL RECORD

Mercedes Hunter | University of Manitoba

keywords | cannibalism, cut marks, the Aztec, Cowboy Wash, Gran Dolina, Moula-Guercy, biochemical

abstract | Cannibalism, also known as anthropophagy, is a cultural behaviour that has captured the interest of biological anthropologists for decades and has been the focal point for a countless number of anthropological projects both past and present. Throughout its popularity as a research topic, cannibalism has come to produce a widely accepted set of features on human osteological remains which include cut marks, fractures, as well as burning and pot polishing. These outdated characteristics are still heavily relied upon in contemporary analyses but have not been subject to revision in several decades. Often neglected are the many taphonomic processes and perimortem activities, like carnivore processing and weathering, that have the potential to create identical damage to osteological remains. This has resulted in many studies, such as the ones undertaken at Cowboy Wash, Gran Dolina, and Moula-Guercy, producing a positive identification of cannibalism based on evidence, that at most, can only be classified as circumstantial. Therefore, new methods including biochemical analysis, molecular variation, and comparing archaeological cases to historical references are explored in the hopes of discovering more reliable techniques to assess potential cases of cannibalism. For future analyses to become more consistent it is critical to understand that cannibalism itself is a cultural behaviour that is variable in nature and therefore has no correlation to any specific treatment of the body.

Finding evidence of cannibalism, within the archaeological record, has become a sensationalized diagnosis which many bioarchaeologists wish to make during their career. So much so that it has become the focal point in many recent studies whether conclusive evidence is present or not. Meanwhile, during the late 1970s it was determined by Arens (1979) that cannibalism was never as prevalent as it has been portrayed to be. It is also a controversial topic from a non-academic, cultural point of view as many individuals may find it difficult to admit their ancestors were cannibals or practiced cannibalism. Furthermore, to label past people as cannibals can create long-lasting negative connotations that can later be difficult to refute as the label itself is such a distinct one. For an academic field that purports itself to accurately represent the past through the meticulous analysis of the material culture, these misrepresentations may greatly upset the field’s reputation.

With this in mind, this paper will critically evaluate examples of contemporary anthropological literature that employs a narrow-minded analytical approach when examining the alleged physical manifestations of cannibalism on osteological remains. An obvious trend within these papers are their blatant disregard of any differently diagnosis to cannibalism such as the involvement of nonhuman agents and other taphonomic processes. They also overestimate their ability to correctly identify such an ambiguous practice by using poor evidence such as cut marks, dismemberment, and fractures that are not particularly diagnostic of cannibalism. This paper’s goal is not to dispute the idea that cannibalism occurred in the past, as this would be misguided, but rather to critically analyze the evidence that many popular papers use to identify such an act, in an attempt to distinguish between fact and fiction. Personal biases often run rampant in these research papers as archaeologists mistakenly use the skeletal evidence to fit their predetermined hypotheses instead of conducting unbiased research. Problems also arise when researchers attempt to define cannibalism and distinguish the motives behind it (White 2014). Particularly within the arena of archaeology, which
focuses on the material manifestations of the past, it is often difficult to determine the intangible and abstract behaviour that prompted past individuals to revert to cannibalism. Therefore, papers that claim to be able to indisputably identify behavioural motivations such as ritualism or a survival instinct should be more cautious with their statements.

One reoccurring problem made by many archaeologists in their pursuit to identify cannibalism within an assemblage of bones is the complete ignorance of taphonomy and the many unique ways in which nonhuman agents modify bone. This is critical to any bioarchaeological analysis as many of these nonhuman agents can mimic marks created by humans or can even obscure any perimortem damage (White 2014, 100). Bone alteration from carnivores often resemble trauma caused by humans; while weathering, sediment crushing, and natural burning are all common taphonomic agents that also similarly affect bone. Instead of treating the evidence interpreted to reflect cannibalism as a common taphonomic process, researchers should first run through a checklist of the most likely causes before even taking it into consideration (White 2014, 101-102). Only after all possible nonhuman agents are eliminated should other possibilities be investigated. Alas this is often not the case, as researchers hope to interpret the data in a more interesting and sensational way than what most likely occurred.

The Aztec

This sensationalizing of evidence is blatantly done in a paper written by Harner, who does not utilize skeletal samples as his primary evidence for his interpretation of cannibalism within the Aztec empire, but rather bases his theories on environmental factors. The osteological evidence that is used cannot serve as irrefutable evidence of cannibalism as they are simply described as dismembered and associated with obsidian blades, which could be a result of a multitude of processes and is not unique to cannibalism (Harn 1977, 126). Rather than analyzing any bones for traces of trauma, Harner determined that population pressure coupled with ecological degradation led to the Aztecs participation in cannibalism as they must not have had any other choice (1977, 118-119). Not only is this theory presumptuous, but Harner then goes on to add more unsubstantiated evidence to his theory in an attempt to strengthen it.

As secondary evidence Harner (1977) states that unlike the Inca, the Aztecs were known to partake in a staggering number of human sacrifices, proven by the higher number of temples within the Aztec empire, therefore he states that it is only rational to assume that cannibalism was the reason behind the increased number of sacrifices (119). Creating assumptions such as these should be done sparingly, especially when describing an entire culture in a scholarly manner, one in which the public trusts to be unbiased and true. This quickly becomes a problem as the Aztecs have historically been labelled as notorious cannibals, much to the credit of these kinds of unsupported claims. Moreover, Harner (1977) then cites letters written by conquistadors claiming to witness the results of ritualistic cannibalism (120). This is in and of itself problematic as records written by conquering parties, like the conquistadors, are often known to be heavily biased and paint the dominated in a less than ideal way. Therefore, these letters and other texts written by Cortés and his men should be taken with a grain of salt and should not be used as undeniable evidence of cannibalism within the Aztec empire.

This strategic misrepresentation was not restricted to letters written by conquistadors, though, as this tactic was often beneficially utilized by any colonizers to justify their imperialistic domination. Representing the cannibal as the ‘other’ quickly became an overarching theme in many ethnologies and became a useful tool in creating a superior narrative, one in which the West was portrayed as the epitome of civilization and culture. This hierarchy simplified the process of colonization as it portrayed these ‘cannibals’ as individuals or societies in need of humanizing. It is only with the advent of postcolonial literature that the true motivations of these early explorers were revealed, these “accounts of cannibalism by missionaries,
administrators, and adventurers, as well as the allegations of neighboring groups, might be seen as derogatory or ethnic stereotypes” (Lindenbaum 2004, 476). This recognition of falsity in many primary sources has led to several reinvestigations of precolonial reports of cannibalism as their validity is now being heavily scrutinized. Although these reevaluations have created a more reliable database, it has also created wariness in ascribing cannibalism as a diagnosis in any circumstance. This reluctance to label evidence as depicting cannibalistic behaviour is also not a proper solution as it has led to many researchers distorting their professional opinions in the hopes of not being accused of sensationalizing evidence. Therefore, this discrepancy between colonial and postcolonial anthropological literature has made comparisons nearly impossible as true diagnostic evidence of cannibalism, unbiased by researchers, is virtually unknown. Moving forward, prudence should be taken with any archaeological interpretation of questionable evidence but not so much as to label cannibalism as an impossibility.

Soon after Harner published his piece on the Aztec many academics such as Ortiz de Montellano (1978) came out and claimed his research as invalid and unsupported. Within his work, Ortiz de Montellano focused most of his attention on the ecological claims Harner used to argue that the Aztec elites began consuming the underprivileged. According to Ortiz de Montellano (1978), even if population pressure began to degrade local ecological zones, the Aztec had a very wide dietary breadth and would not have had to rely solely on domesticated herbivores as their main source of protein. Rather “in addition to a wide list of tropical fruits and vegetables...Aztecs ate armadillo, pocket gopher, weasels, rattlesnakes, mice, and iguanas...several varieties of grasshoppers, ants and worms” (Ortiz de Montellano 1978, 612). Therefore, even in times of hardship where large herbivores were no longer bountiful, the Aztec would have had a long list of alternatives before they would have had to rely on consuming human flesh for survival. It is also revealed that Harner neglected to mention that the Aztec also had supplementary methods of feeding themselves including all the food brought to them as tribute as well as chinampas; “crops [which] were grown on artificial structures in the lake surrounding the city, chinampas, built of mud scooped from the lake bottom” (Ortiz de Montellano 1978, 612). This additional food would have been enough to not only feed the Aztec elite but also a large portion of the general population.

The Aztec were an innovative and resilient culture that for nearly a century thrived in diverse environmental conditions because of their many adaptive skills. Cortés and his men were oblivious to their diversity and reported a culturally biased “version designed to appeal to Spain's King Charles' cupidity and to provide him with an excuse to conquer Mexico (that is, in order to convert and save pagan Indians)” (Ortiz de Montellano 1978, 616). To successfully overthrow the Aztec, the Spanish had to do so not only with the King's consent but also with favour from the public, and to do so the Aztec had to be portrayed as bloodthirsty cannibals that were to be feared. Unfortunately, this narrative was believed, and the Aztec Empire soon fell at the hands of the Spanish. From a 21st century perspective, there is a lesson to be learned about believing wholeheartedly in colonial ethnographic accounts especially with concern to such extravagant claims such as cannibalism.

The Anasazi-Cowboy Wash

Although cut marks or fractures found on human skeletal remains may suggest the occurrence of alterations to the bones, it is difficult to ascertain with absolute positivity whether the damage was done by human hands, or merely a result of a wide variety of taphonomic agents such as carnivore consumption, trampling or secondary internments. For their research of a “prehistoric Puebloan site in Southwestern Colorado” (2000, 74), Marlar et al., used several traditional diagnostic bony alterations, such as extreme fragmentation and burning, as a key to their interpretations of the osteological assemblage at Cowboy Wash. Early investigations of the site showed ‘classic’ signs of violence as “the bodies of seven people
of both sexes and various ages were disarticulated, defleshed and apparently cooked as if for consumption by other humans” (Marlar et al. 2000, 75). Along with trauma found on the remains, the disarticulated bones were strewn haphazardly in non-burial contexts, as were valuable items, tools, cooking vessels, and ornaments which the research team took as diagnostic of a rushed abandonment of the site itself (Marlar et al. 2000, 25).

The lack of care for the skeletal remains, regarding the absence of formal burials, demonstrated to Billman et al. (2000) that the evidence at Cowboy Wash fit nicely into previously established criteria for cannibalism (164). Moreover, the perimortem trauma found on all the bones is thought of as a classic diagnostic tool for cannibalism; “the disarticulation of bones at joints and heavy fracturing of skeletal elements… no skeletal elements remained articulated, and perimortem breakage was apparent in many, including the cranial vault bones, ribs, marrow-rich long bones, and fat-laden vertebra” (Billman et al. 2000, 165). Further theorized was the cause for the abandonment of the site, which was thought to be an extremely violent raiding party that took advantage of the small size of this settlement and attacked (Billman et al. 2000, 146). Raids and cannibalism were thought to be increasingly common in the Mesa Verde region especially in the 12th century as severe droughts caused many socio-cultural systems to collapse and famine to set in (Billman et al. 2000, 146).

Billman et al.'s (2000) use of evidence for cannibalism does not come fully accepted though, as Dongoske et al. (2000) states that their results were based on weak evidence and therefore lead to an inadequate investigation of the site's assemblage. Like many before them, Billman et al. (2000) quickly glossed over their taphonomic interpretation of the site and this resulted in a lack of detail in the report. As mentioned previously, burned and fractured bones should not automatically be considered evidence of cannibalism. Rather, there are numerous taphonomic agents that can mimic these results and labelling the trauma on the remains as marrow extraction and tool marks resulted in a misinformed conclusion (Dongoske et al. 2000, 182). Furthermore, Billman et al. (2000) claimed that the lack of proper burial of the bones denoted a similarity to the disposal of animal bones therefore the human remains must have been consumed and treated in a similar fashion. Dongoske et al. (2000) counter this theory by calling their evidence suggestive and equivocal as well as unclear by declaring what ‘could’ or ‘may’ have happened instead of what did (184).

**Moula-Guercy**

Much like other studies, the Neanderthal cave-site of Moula-Guercy in southeastern France used “bone spatial distributions, modifications by stone tools, and skeletal part representations” (Defleur et al. 1999, 128) as evidence for cannibalism. Particularly useful to their diagnosis was the comparative ways hominid and non-hominid skeletal remains seemed to be processed (Defleur et al. 1999, 131). This is a repeating theme in many archaeological reports of cannibalism as it has been greatly accepted that similar treatments of human and animal bones must unequivocally mean that the human remains were consumed in a similar fashion. Although this is possible, it should not be relied upon as concrete proof of human consumption. Both assemblages had remains with cut marks crossing fracture edges or refit pieces that were discovered in different sections of the cave. Percussion pits, flakes, crushing of spongy bone, and peeling were all found on all ungulate and hominid remains while relatively no carnivore modification was present on any bones (Defleur et al. 1999, 131). Even if the human skeletal elements were distributed in a similar way to the non-human bones and the assemblage was an equal representation of both human and non-human (Defleur et al. 1999, 131) this does not signify that they were treated the same. The authors also neglected any differential diagnoses and did not explore any other possible explanations for the particular osteological assemblages at Moula-Guercy. The dismemberment and trauma on the human remains could have been a result of mortuary practices or secondary internment where the remains are often disarticulated to ease transferability. The more pressing issue is in relation to
many archaeologists freely comparing the two assemblages without considering the biases.

Bioarchaeology and zooarchaeology are two distinct fields requiring specialized individuals to properly analyze the differing skeletal material. Although a faunal assemblage is very useful to a bioarchaeological analysis of a site, it should not be used as a comparison. Rather, they should be examined separately with the faunal remains being used to "elucidate dating and past environments, to determine the use of animal products in material culture, and to understand human activity" (White 2014, 100). Although it may be tempting to liken the two assemblages, they should be kept separate unless all biases within methodology is recognized beforehand. Biases within the two assemblages often begin at the recovery process as they are often recovered using different analytical techniques and criteria (White 2014, 102). This creates a chasm between the collections as comparisons are only possible if a fully integrated, identical recovery and recording system is utilized from the beginning. For example, if only fragments more than 3 cm are collected from the human assemblage and all fragments less than 1 cm are collected from the faunal assemblage then there will be some very apparent discrepancies between the two collections. Moreover, fragmented and commingled assemblages are often very difficult to differentiate, therefore it is highly possible that many of the smaller faunal remains were misidentified as such and are in actuality human, which again skews the results (White 2014, 103). Standardization in recovery methods is thus imperative when investigating a commingled site such as Moula-Guercy to avoid biases. There seems to be no such consistency within Defleur et al.'s (1999) paper and therefore their comparisons of human and non-human assemblages are rendered useless.

Gran Dolina-Level TD6

The interpretations of motivations behind cannibalism are also questionable as human decision making is difficult to judge through osteological remains. TD6 level of Gran Dolina in Spain represents one of the oldest examples of cannibalism through the collection of Homo antecessor skeletal remains. The evidence itself is not new as this article also references cut marks and fractures on the bones to signify butchering, therefore their practicality will not be discussed again (Carbonell et al. 2010, 539). Rather, the unique classification of cultural cannibalism with a nutritional motivation will be critically evaluated. Osteological elements with trauma were stated to be found in every stratigraphic layer at Gran Dolina, which Carbonell et al. (2010) interpreted as a repetitive cultural phenomenon rather than an isolated event (547). This classification is further explained as a habitual nutritional supplement to Homo antecessor's already protein-orientated diet. On level TD6, along with the human and animal remains, were found nearly 850 lithic artifacts comprised mostly of “flint, quartzite, sandstone, quartz, and limestone” (Carbonell et al. 2010, 542). The inclusion of such a grand array of stone tools within the co-mingled archaeological assemblage was also taken to be evidence of anthropophagy being an integral part of life for Homo antecessor as they did not separate these avenues of their lives but rather combined them. The sequential appearance of anthropogenically modified human remains in the sublevels of TD6 at Gran Dolina is also taken as a sign that cannibalism was such a successful adaptive strategy that it was transmitted through multiple generations of Homo antecessor groups (Carbonell et al. 2010, 542). In terms of success, it was not only for nutritional benefits but also competition for resources; defending the group’s territory and expelling any future competition (Carbonell et al. 2010).

To include such a practice in their social systems there must have been motivations behind such actions rather than simply being part "of a culinary tradition" (Carbonell et al. 2010, 540). Nutritional stress is unlikely as “the TD6 hominids had a high diversity of vegetal and animal resources available, and they could perform raising strategies to exploit preys of different sizes” (Carbonell et al. 2010, 547). Through this statement it can then be determined that Homo antecessor conceivably did not participate in
cannibalism to supplement protein into their already diverse and adaptive diets. It is then possible that perhaps degrading ecological systems led to population pressure and a depleted resource bank, but this is also refuted. Data representing optimal environmental conditions “consisting of a temperate climate with a landscape similar to that of a present-day Holarctic [Nearctic and Palearctic regions] forest with a large potential pool of resources” (Carbonell et al. 2010, 547) were reported for TD6. It is not enough to simply state that cannibalism was an accepted and repetitive part of Homo antecessor’s diet especially if there is no faunal or environmental data to strengthen the theory. The data that Carbonell et al. (2010) presented within their paper is not enough to corroborate the assumption of cultural cannibalism, perhaps a more in-depth analysis of the stratigraphic layers of Gran Dolina will uncover hidden motivations, such as inter/intra group violence, that are able to further explain this phenomenon as the evidence thus presented does not do so. Simply labelling an act as ‘traditional’ does not justify its existence.

A different interpretation of the evidence at Gran Dolina was reported by Saladié et al. (2012) in their paper on intergroup violence and its relation to cannibalism. This paper closely investigated the age distribution pattern of the individuals that were cannibalized and compared their results to modern counts of cannibalism in chimpanzee populations to deduce behavioural motivations (Saladié et al. 2012, 682). Saladié et al. (2012) begin their research with a look into violence and cannibalism within chimpanzee groups to determine whether the violence was intra- or inter- specific. The main explanation for intergroup violence was competition for resources/range expansion, it “suggests that aggression would occur in areas where food is abundant and where encounters with others are highly likely” (Saladié et al. 2012, 684). The victors would also gain more access to food and better mates as their territory expanded and competition greatly diminished. Intragroup violence was not heavily examined as it was quickly established that the victims did not fit the age distribution pattern found of TD6 at Gran Dolina, but the intergroup distribution did (Saladié et al. 2012, 682). From these comparisons, the authors established that the type of cannibalism at Gran Dolina more closely resembled instances of cannibalism among chimpanzees and were not comparable to other cases of Pleistocene cannibalism. Their main point of evidence for this was the ages of the victims, which “in the H. antecessor group at TD6 suggest that the individuals that were captured involved the least risk for the predators, which implies a low-cost territory control strategy” (Saladié et al. 2012, 692). This likening to chimpanzee behaviour is expressed throughout the research paper but what is lacking is any comparison to other Pleistocene groups. The authors simply stated that the age distribution of the victims does not correlate with other examples from this time period and immediately rejected this possibility.

Every archaeological site is unique and although patterns may arise explaining general behaviours, it is essential to recall that no two sites will be a perfect match. There will always be inconsistencies within the contextual data, but comparison is still possible. Furthermore, the author’s comparison of Pleistocene hominids to chimpanzees is problematic as these groups differed greatly in socio-cultural contexts. Their motivations and concepts of the world were vastly different, and this should have been acknowledged by the authors. Instead, the authors stated that this comparison was made possible as the two groups shared similar motivations, including being “driven purely by ecological circumstances” (Saladié et al. 2012, 693). The authors gave no explanations to support this statement while White (2014) stated that although cannibalism within primates and humans may resemble each other, humans have a much wider and more diverse range of motivations for cannibalizing their peers (9). Although all human motives for cannibalism will encompass those of primates, the same cannot be said from the other perspective. The observation by White thus renders any comparisons between the two groups moot as group complexity differs too significantly for an accurate assessment.
**Moving Forward-Biochemical Analysis**

Marlar et al. (2000) took an interdisciplinary approach to their study of a "prehistoric Puebloan site in Southwestern Colorado" (2000, 74) and included a biochemical investigation of human coprolites. Although not a new method, it depends greatly on the preservation of human waste, which is extremely rare especially from prehistoric sites therefore, the usefulness of this diagnostic tool is relatively low. With this being said, in the few cases that preservation has occurred, it has been a great asset to any study researching palaeodiet.

All previous data brought forth to discuss cannibalism has been in the form of particular trauma found on osteological remains which has been proven to not be as reliable or definitive as previously assumed. Although it may be able to show the physical manifestations of human agency, skeletal evidence "alone does not document the actual ingestion of human flesh" (Marlar et al. 2000, 75). A more thorough examination of the Anasazi site at Cowboy Wash was undertaken after a preliminary interpretation of the archaeological evidence was established, where after the coprolites were found a more credible diagnosis of cannibalism was reached. Macroscopic analysis of the sample revealed no traces of plant or starch, instead human myoglobin was detected (Marlar et al. 2000, 26). This is irrefutable evidence of human consumption because unlike cells and blood which can normally occur in human stool, myoglobin is only found in "skeletal and cardiac muscle cells...therefore, human myoglobin should only be present in faecal material if it is consumed and passed through the digestive system by the depositor of the faeces" (Marlar et al. 2000, 76-77). With this secondary evidence, researchers were able to definitively state the occurrence of cannibalism at this prehistoric Puebloan site.

With the publication of this direct evidence of cannibalism, the debate of whether or not cannibalism occurred amongst our ancestors can finally be put to rest in relation to this particular site. Marlar et al. (2000) are exemplary in their quest to find unquestionable evidence of cannibalism instead of solely relying on previously established insubstantial signs. Future studies looking to emulate their work should focus on biochemical analysis rather than the classic burning or cut marks so heavily relied upon by our predecessors. Although coprolites are rarely found and should not be depended on for a positive diagnosis, biochemical analysis can also take place on cooking vessels, which are much more common and would produce the same positive result for cannibalism.

This incorporation of both traditional and new evidence and methodologies should be used as a precedent in all future archaeological interpretations of cannibalism as it leads to a more thorough and concrete evaluation of any site. Material evidence that was once used as diagnostic for cannibalism should now only be used as supporting evidence or secondary data when these new methodologies cannot be applied. Physical manifestations of cannibalism on human remains should first be analyzed with other taphonomic agents in mind as they are more commonly found to affect osteological remains and are present in any environmental setting and therefore varied in appearance.

**Utilizing Historical Records as Reference**

As comparing human and nonhuman cases of cannibalism are potentially inaccurate, Rautman and Fenton (2005) have instead focused on comparing two cases of human cannibalism; one historic and the other archaeological. Their divergence in research tactics stems from the notion that the "[study of] cannibalism would benefit from the addition of other anthropological perspectives, particularly those concerning the human body as a vehicle for the expression of cultural ideas and values" (Rautman & Fenton 2005, 321). Consistently using the same evidence in any archaeological investigation never renders any new insights or results, therefore this venture will aid in the growth of a more inclusive and interdisciplinary field.

Like many others before them, the authors first began by investigating the pre-Hispanic American Southwest, specifically the Anasazi, as there is adequate
archaeological evidence demonstrating cannibalism within this cultural group. From there Rautman & Fenton (2005) differentiate themselves from their contemporaries as they explore the problems with finding undisputable evidence of cannibalism with the nature of these finds being variable and rare (323). Much to their credit they also discuss in detail the issues with equifinality and the variability of, “different cultural behaviors, including perimortem violence, corpse mutilation, burial ritual, cannibalism and the general problem of deriving explanations from the data “up” rather than exploring the range of variation involved in a certain cultural behavior” (Rautman & Fenton 2005, 322). This inconsistency between cultures makes any comparison, whether archaeological or historical, rather difficult as interpretations that fit one situation may not fit the other. Therefore, it is critical to realize these inequalities with regards to cultural behaviour, like cannibalism, and the fact that different processes may represent the same results even if there seems to be no similarities in the evidence.

With this in mind, the authors went forward with their comparison of the Anasazi and the historical case of Alfred Packer, a well-known and documented case of cannibalism in 19th century Colorado (Rautman & Fenton 2005, 322). After Packer’s confession and subsequent sentencing, the remains of his victims were found with perimortem trauma and postmortem processing (Rautman & Fenton 2005, 324). Such trauma included a mixture of sharp and blunt-force trauma to all recovered crania, consistent with hatchet/axe marks, as well as the arms (radius, ulna) demonstrating hacking trauma and defensive wounds (Rautman & Fenton 2005, 326). As for the postmortem processing, the cut marks and their distribution pattern, “are found on bones with the largest muscle units” (Rautman & Fenton 2005, 327) which would be expected if Packer were butchering his victims. From a relative standpoint, the Packer case is very different from the examples of cannibalism within the highly fragmented Anasazi remains but there are some important similarities that allow for comparison.

More specifically, the Packer case demonstrates the particular way in which cut marks will be distributed if cut from an articulated body for the express purpose of what is referred to as ‘survival cannibalism’ which is meat being “removed (filleted) as discrete units over a period of time, a finding that is consistent with a strategy of meat removal on an “as-needed" basis” (Rautman & Fenton 2005, 331). This historical case also showed that disarticulation and fragmentation are not always diagnostic of cannibalism, as was previously thought, which is especially relevant to the Anasazi as many of their assemblages were highly fragmented. Their assemblages were often fragmented to such a high degree that identification of the skeletal element was not possible (Rautman & Fenton 2005, 334). This point alone does not disprove cannibalism within the Anasazi as it does not account for the larger number of consumers and the more extensive butchering needed to feed these larger groups.

They chose to use the Packer case because the authenticity of the occurrence of cannibalism had never been questioned, as Packer himself admitted to eating his five companions to survive the winter (Rautman & Fenton 2005, 323). This situation then is one of the very few unquestionably documented cases of cannibalism. Therefore, the Packer case “provide[s] valuable baseline evidence of what one type of cannibalism—mass murder followed by short-term survival cannibalism—might look like” (Rautman & Fenton 2005, 323). Having this additional contextual information is critical to establishing concrete evidence for this kind of cannibalism. It also establishes the validity of comparing historical, and well-documented, cases of cannibalism to archaeological cases, that often lack that essential contextual information. Although the Packer case cannot be used as a comparison for every archaeological case suspected of cannibalism, it demonstrates that other such historical cases can be utilized, with great success, as comparisons to help interpret the skeletal remains in a culturally specific framework.
Molecular Variation

Mark Stoneking (2003) argues that cannibalism, rather than being cautiously considered, should be fully embraced as an adaptive act that was widely practiced by our ancestors (490). He argues that instead of analyzing the data with our contemporary cultural biases and thinking of cannibalism as a disgusting and horrifying practice we should conduct our research with an emic mindset. Moreover, as bioarchaeologists we have a duty to impartially investigate the evidence brought before us and accept what it is trying to tell us instead of always refuting the most obvious of evidence. Stoneking (2003) utilizes “molecular variation at the prion protein gene locus” (489) to argue that our ancestors were unapologetically participating in cannibalism. He then explains that this protein causes spontaneous masses to grow in the brain which causes “neurodegenerative ‘prion’ diseases, such as Creutzfeldt-Jakob disease, kuru (a rare progressive fatal encephalopathy), bovine spongiform encephalopathy (BSE) and scrapie” (Stoneking 2003, 489).

To examine the effects of prion proteins, Stoneking examined Mead et al.’s (2003) earlier work with modern Fore (a remote Papa New Guinean tribe) populations known to consume human flesh and detected patterns within their pathologic histories. Although all contemporary Fore participate in multiple mortuary feasts it was discovered that elderly survivors of the previous kuru epidemic were not re-infected even after consuming endocranial matter (Mead et al. 2003, 640). This was due to these particular individuals being heterozygote “for a particular amino acid polymorphism…at codon 129” (Stoneking 2003, 489). This heterozygosity has been reported to show relative resistance to prion diseases like kuru while homozygotes quickly perished from this disease. This process referred to as ‘balancing selection’, by both Stoneking (2003) and Mead et al. (2003), began contemporarily with “the age of the codon 129 polymorphism [which] is ~500 000 years, suggesting that the selection could be this old” (Stoneking 2003, 489). This event was not only detected in populations from Papa New Guinea but also samples from Africa, Japan and certain areas of Europe, meaning that balancing selection was not an isolated event but rather suggests that many, if not all, prehistoric populations experienced it (Stoneking 2003, 489).

As for the reasons behind the balancing selection Mead et al. (2003) determined several possible explanations. For instance, heterozygosity could have been achieved by attaining resistance to other infectious diseases or prion diseases transmitted through consuming animal meat (Mead et al. 2003). Although possible, these scenarios don’t account for the selective nature of the immunity. Therefore, the most likely situation was “that balancing selection arises because heterozygosity at the prion protein gene imparts resistance to human prion diseases, for which the exposure is the regular consumption of human flesh” (Stoneking 2003, 489). These papers allow for the rejuvenation of belief in cannibalism as a regular part of our ancestor's diets. Although there is some variation in the explanation for the occurrence of balancing selection, future studies of prion proteins and selective immunity to these pathologies should elucidate those factors. Even if those results are not as expected, it is refreshing to see a unique take on studies of cannibalism. Rather than simply looking at the physical manifestations on the skeletal remains, innovative studies are taking advantage of new technologies and exploring beyond the expected to unveil new avenues of research that can potentially be applied to a multitude of different disciplines.

Concluding Remarks

In conclusion, the misinformed labelling of cut marks, fragmentation, and burning of human remains as key diagnostic references for cannibalism is one of the many setbacks of contemporary anthropological reports. It should be deemed critical that “cannibalism has no necessary correlation with any particular postmortem treatment of the human body” (Rautman & Fenton 2005, 338). This leads many archaeologists to misidentify cannibalism in the archaeological record or
confuse it with other postmortem practices such as defleshing or secondary interments.

Misrepresentations of cannibalism, although detrimental to archaeological literature, have also served to elucidate misconceptions about foreign lands and their people. In the widely known instance of cannibalism at the Jamestown settlement in Virginia, evidence of mass starvation led to only a handful of residents surviving by reverting to their most instinctual behaviour (Herrmann 2011). The many depictions of cannibalism are evidenced solely by myth as their only indication for such an occurrence was starvation itself and the desperation seen through the extremely depleted food sources (Herrmann 2011). When Herrmann’s article was published in 2011, no physical evidence had yet been found to prove accounts of cannibalism at the settlement, but the accusations had still never been refuted, “By the early eighteenth century, Americans did not argue about whether cannibalism had taken place; they assumed that it had and pointed to it as the ordeal that forced lazy Virginians to become industrious producers” (Herrmann 2011, 62). Whether the claims for cannibalism are true or not was not of importance for Herrmann’s research as she was rather only interested in critically analyzing the effects that such a claim had on the reputation of the settlement. Even if cannibalism never occurred in Jamestown, such allegations of “The Starving Time functioned as a fortunate fall that allowed leaders to reassert control over unruly settlers and to impose laws controlling food production, dissemination, and consumption. Tales from the time also dictated refined rules for future English settlement” (Herrmann 2011, 72). The allegations of cannibalism also guaranteed that any of the interconnected problems and shortfalls that led to mass starvation at Jamestown would never happen again, at least not to such a dire extent, as settlers learned from these experiences and never wanted them repeated.

Gone were the early assumptions that the New World was “a food-filled paradise…characterization of the New World abundance shifted from limitless to attainable only via hard work and strict regulations enforcing industrious behavior” (Herrmann 2011, 61). Therefore, even though cannibalism may never have occurred at Jamestown it secured future prosperity of American settlements by warning of the pitfalls of greed and arrogance in an unforgiving land. This is only one of the many examples of cannibalism in a historical or archaeological context that implores caution with regards to interpretations of cultural behaviours. These accounts should be read with apprehension, instead of merely being accepted, readers should rather criticize why such claims became relevant in the first place and what purpose, if any, they served in influencing past sociocultural behaviours.

Cannibalism is ultimately a cultural behaviour and should be interpreted as such. A certain level of variation should be kept in mind when interpreting possible cases of cannibalism within the archaeological record. Cultural biases as well as societal prejudices can often mislead the interpretation of archaeological data. Typically used signatures of cannibalism like burning, pot polishing, fragmentation, cut marks and missing vertebrae (Turner & Turner 1999) should not be taken as the sole pieces of evidence as they depict only a very small range of possible scenarios. Comparing archaeological assemblages to historical examples, like the Packer case, focusing on biochemical analysis or investigating molecular variation within prion diseases are instrumental in future research as they pose a new and refreshing take on outdated studies that have nothing new to offer.

References


A CHRONOLOGICAL REVIEW OF SCALP-TAKING IN PRE- AND POST-CONTACT AMERICA
Matthew Jensby | University of Manitoba

keywords | scalping, trophy-taking, bounty, conflict, documented

abstract | The practice of scalp-taking in the context of cultural conflict is well-documented throughout the history of the United States, yet claims and disputes regarding the origins of scalp-taking still surfaced over the 20th century. Today, contemporary historians and anthropologists have widely come to agree that scalp-taking was introduced to North America by indigenous groups long before 15th century European contact. To recognize this conceptual debate in literary history, a chronological review of archaeological and cultural evidence, as well as documented historical events after European arrival, provides clear evidence of scalp-taking as originating in North America with a rapid evolution of the practice over centuries following European contact.

Beginning with the mass 20th century production of American western television shows, movies, and novels depicting fictional (or at least embellished) heroics of the Wild West, entertainment media has displayed the practice of scalping as a brutish invention of Native American culture used to signify bravery and instill fear (Price 1973, 153). While it is widely acknowledged that scalping was not an act solely practiced by North American indigenous cultures, it is true that numerous Native American societies utilized the custom of scalp-taking in their struggles with colonial and American expansionists (Axtell and Sturtevant 1980, 461-65; Young 1957, 208-18; Smith 1963, 34-64; Smith 1964, 1-22). Indeed, reports as far back as the late 19th and early 20th centuries concluded that scalping was an existing practice long before Columbian-era Europeans first landed in the New World, and was likely just one aspect of trophy-taking customs that centred around forms of dismemberment (Burton 1864, 50; Neumann 1940, 287). However, historians also recognize that scalping became a common practice among Europeans soon after their arrival in North America, and that these newcomers may very well have been responsible for bringing the act into historical prevalence (Abler 1992, 15). As such, scalping origins and development have become topics worth exploring, as the implementation of trophy-taking tactics (such as scalping) by colonials and the young American government may have altered the traditional paradigm of the practice among indigenous cultures in North America.

Reviewing the major research surrounding this specific topic provides a chronological history of scalp-taking, focusing on the social variables that impacted the practice among indigenous cultures. There have been several publications over the past century that focus on conveying historical accounts of scalping, cultural reasons behind scalp-taking, and the archaeological process of identifying and interpreting scalped victims. Each independent article reviewed here can be analyzed to construct a contextual history, as this paper attempts to chronicle such reports and provide a timeline of scalp-taking in the U.S. based on existing literature and specific examples of archaeological evidence.

Scalping in Pre-Contact North America

By parsing through the existing literature, it is readily noticeable that when anthropologists study the concept of scalp-taking, it is generally with the locale of modern-day United States in mind. The conflict between European immigrants and indigenous groups propelled the practice into prevalence, and thus, many anthropologists have sought to identify evidence suggesting where this act of aggression originated (i.e., Miller 1994; Axtell and Sturtevant 1980; Axtell 1974; Young 1957). Beginning in the latter half of the 19th and continuing through the 20th century, the bloody history of scalping and its portrayal in popular culture originally came under scrutiny through media such as NBC...
television and The New Yorker magazine, as well as through interviews with moralists, writers, and outspoken Native American groups (Axtell and Sturtevant 1980, 453). This collective pushed the notion of cultural evidence suggesting Europeans developed the act of scalping and were the first to introduce the practice in North America. Stemming from advocates of indigenous equality, statements from numerous historians and tribal chiefs were referenced to make the argument that indigenous groups were relatively peaceful before Europeans settled in North America, and thus had little reason for scalping prior (Axtell and Sturtevant 1980, 451-53).

However, such conclusions are contradictory to archaeological evidence, as remains dating long before the Columbian era have been discovered that display traditional scalping marks (Smith 1995, 61-64; Miller 1994, 212-18; Neumann 1940, 287-88). Given these findings, it has become widely accepted among anthropologists that scalping was prevalent among certain indigenous groups prior to contact with 15th century Europeans (Smith 1995, 65; Milner, Anderson and Smith 1991, 584). This enhances curiosity regarding the history of scalp-taking in native warfare, yet little documentation outside of oral history exists on the subject predating this period of European arrival (Abler 1992, 7). Therefore, archaeological data (and interpretation of that data) is the most reliable option to analyze in studying the history of scalping prior to colonization of North America.

**Evidence of Scalping Prior to 15th Century European Arrival**

Scalping occurrences are determined based on non-random cut marks evident on the cranium, and even though every scalping incident varies in cut placement, the non-random marks are the primary indicator of whether or not the victim had his/her scalp removed (Ortner 2003, 172; Smith 1995, 61). However, it is possible to remove a scalp without leaving legible cut marks on the cranium, which means that scalping could have taken place at a higher frequency than the archaeological record indicates (Miller 1994; 216). There have been several publications detailing archaeological evidence of cranial cut marks discovered in North America prior to the Columbian era (i.e., Smith 1995; Owsley and Berryman 1975; Neumann 1940), and perhaps the earliest evidence of systemic scalp-taking in the region can be archaeologically traced to the Late Archaic period.

In 1995, Dr. Maria Smith detailed her discovery of pre-Columbian scalping victims in the area of modern-day Tennessee (60-68). She outlined the archaeological evidence of three victims who had been scalped, and who she has identified as “the earliest examples of the [scalping] practice in the eastern United States” (1995, 61). Smith notes that the cut marks observed from these three separate crania each coincide with other reported scalping victims at later dates, such as those found from the Crow Creek Massacre in North Dakota, as well as experimentally duplicated cranial cut marks. Smith’s interpretation of such evidence is that warfare must have been present in this area of Tennessee during the Late Archaic period, as scalping is recognized as a form of trophy-taking. Trophy-taking, Smith notes, is a means for “prestige enhancement” (1995, 66). Therefore, if an individual takes a body part from a slain enemy, that individual will advance in a hierarchical society where warfare plays an integral role in social stratification. This occurrence of trophy taking at such an early period in North American history is significant because it may mark a paradigm change in hunter-gatherer groups, as warfare is generally associated with an increase in social complexity (Smith 1995, 66). If Smith’s interpretation is correct and the Archaic period did, in fact, serve as a paradigm-shifting era towards an increase in social complexity among hunter-gatherer groups, then it may explain where and when certain North American indigenous people in prehistory developed or embraced the tendency to hinge social status on achievement in warfare.

According to research from Dr. Elizabeth Miller, evidence of scalping was primarily associated with warfare on the Great Plains prior to European arrival (1994; 211-12). Miller has detailed four separate remains found in a large burial site from prehistoric northeastern Nebraska that displayed similar marks to the crania noted
by Smith. Furthermore, Miller’s analysis indicates that these four victims were scalped while still alive, as subsequent infection was evident where these wounds occurred (1994, 213-16). However, she finds it strange that only four of two hundred sixty-seven skeletons uncovered at the burial site showed signs of scalping. Miller deduces that four possibilities could have led to this odd result:

1) the scalping methods used by the enemy left no marks if the individual did not survive the event; 2) all scalping events took place away from the villages excavated, and the scalped dead were not brought back to the villages for burial; 3) scalping was actually a very rare occurrence among the St. Helena/Nebraska phase peoples of northeastern Nebraska; and 4) scalped individuals were generally buried away from the main ossuaries and have simply not yet been excavated. (Miller 1994, 216)

If any of Miller’s first, second, or fourth theories are correct, then it would seem that hunter-gatherer societies around modern-day Nebraska (and likely throughout the region) had either fully implemented a trophy-taking practice of scalping as a societal custom or at least were familiar with the occurrence.

In agreement is historian, author, and researcher of Pawnee warfare Mark van de Logt, who confirms that scalp-taking was a signature activity of warfare for most indigenous groups on the Great Plains prior to European contact (Logt 2008, 72-73). However, van de Logt views the influences behind indigenous warfare differently, as he believes an overabundance of research attention has focused on social status (as Smith’s interpretation suggests) and that theological influences should not be ignored (2008, 75-76). Scalp-taking was historically part of the Pawnee tradition, which justified the act as a means of connecting to spiritual powers (Logt 2008, 83). For this reason, van de Logt suggests that the Pawnee people would actively search for scalps to take among rival tribes, and thus religion could be a cause for war in itself. While in such a context scalps would still be considered trophies of warfare, van de Logt believes these scalps were not gathered strictly for the use of touting individual status (2008, 73-77).

The prehistoric Pawnee religion believed that sacrificing an enemy scalp to the sacred powers was a way of increasing individual spiritual power, as the scalp and hair represent a person’s essence (Logt 2008, 82). There are several Pawnee ceremonies and traditions associated with scalps (described throughout Logt 2008; Fletcher 1898; Grinnell 1893), further bolstering van de Logt’s claim that the trophies were not taken strictly to increase societal standing. Instead, he believes that the majority of Plains tribes had a more complex reason for collecting scalps than simply to show prestige, such as religious/superstitious connotations, revenge strategies, and to intimidate the enemy. To convey this point, van de Logt has outlined the role that scalping played in other Plains tribes beyond the use of personal prestige; for example, the Crow people took scalps, which was not considered a prestigious act in that particular society. Rather, scalping was a way to honour their creator, Old Man Coyote (who was believed to take the scalps of enemies), and therefore did not signify a sole deed of relevance, but also duty (Lowie 1956, 131). Among the Comanches, scalps were primarily taken to avenge tribal members who had been killed by enemies (Logt 2008, 95-96). In the Lakota culture, taking an enemy’s scalp essentially represented taking a spirit. These enemy scalps were often presented to relatives of tribesmen who died in battle as a way of avenging their tribe member, and the scalp was considered a symbol of the passed member’s spirit (Hassrick 1982, 90).

Upon analyzing such literature, both archaeological and cultural reports begin to paint a picture of scalp-taking evolution from scattered/isolated instances, to evidence of systemic scalping, to becoming a staple of warfare, society, and tradition among the majority of indigenous groups throughout midwestern North America. It is clear that before the arrival of Europeans, scalping was not considered overly brutish or barbaric by those committing the act; rather, it was simply a strategy used to increase one’s social prestige by displaying bravery, to gain favour from greater powers
through the offering of a scalp of an enemy, or to utilize/deter the spirit of the person previously associated with that scalp.

**Post-Columbian Scalp-Taking**

When Europeans arrived in the New World, they were supposedly shocked by the indigenous act of desecrating slain enemies, and historical statements suggest that initial Europeans who landed in North America were scared and anxious regarding such indigenous lifeways (Axtell 1974, 17). Presumably, the act of scalping was at least a partial cause of this fear. Thomas Abler writes, “Clearly in European eyes, a deviant, incredible, or at least strange, Indian practice was the taking of scalps” (1992: 6). However, this may have been an overreaction considering the bloody history of European warfare. Long before 15th century contact with the indigenous inhabitants of North America, there is documented evidence of trophy-taking forms (such as decapitation) throughout the history of Asian, African, and European conflicts (Burton 1864, 49-50; Abler 1992, 6-8).

**Impacts and Evolution of Scalp-Taking Post-Contact**

Consequently, European military knowledge and experience in organized warfare is likely the reason they were able to adopt the indigenous strategy of scalping so quickly. Abler claims that Europeans were awe-struck by the cultural custom of scalping, to the point where they developed a “ghoulish fascination with the practice” (1992, 7). Based on the written account of perhaps the first European (Simon Rodrigues of De Soto’s expedition) being scalped in 1540, Abler believes it was a relatively short time before Europeans adopted the practice as their own. Taking the custom even further, local governments in colonial America actually turned scalping into a business, which ultimately marked the beginning of scalp-taking as a staple in conflicts among and between indigenous groups and white frontiersmen. While payment for scalps of enemies would be awarded to white soldiers/citizens and Indians alike, it seems that bounty systems were originally designed to exploit indigenous familiarity with scalp-taking, and as such, during the colonial period of U.S. history, American Indians largely continued to take scalps both for payment and traditional/cultural purposes (Abler 1992, 8).

Initially, the governmental bounty system was relatively docile and was likely never meant to be a means of purging indigenous people of an area. An example suggesting this passivity is the specific retelling of accounts in the northeast colonies by Henry J. Young, who reviewed the history of such bounties and how they came to be implemented in both Native and Colonial societies from the written record of events that took place in Pennsylvania territory (1957). Young points out that initial bounty acts were meant to merely frighten indigenous peoples and bolster the courage of the frontiersmen, and indeed, the government of Pennsylvania reported that very few scalps were exchanged each time a bounty was enacted in the mid-18th century (1957, 209-212). Yet even though the early scalp bounty system was relatively non-lethal towards indigenous groups in the northeast as a whole, it clearly formed a basis for subsequent bounty implementations.

While the United States of America was still in its infancy and settlers began pushing westward towards the Great Plains, the associated indigenous populations began feeling geographically pressed from these invaders. Increasingly fewer lands were available for both indigenous groups and American expansionists to thrive on, which caused tensions and conflicts to flare, and
ultimately influenced territory/state-level governments to enact scalp bounty hunting in the relatively lawless western frontier of the U.S. (Smith 1963, 34-36). Such decrees subsequently resulted in the mid-19th century burgeoning of professional scalp hunters (Smith 1964, 7-8; Smith 1963, 39). One example of such population-restricting pressure and subsequent scalp hunting comes from the southwest region near the U.S./Mexico border where members of the Apache tribe began aggressively moving into Mexican territory (modern-day New Mexico) in an attempt to shift their roaming lands. To counter this territorial invasion, the Mexican government utilized a scalp bounty system to influence Americans, Mexicans, and Indians alike to hunt Apache members in an effort to reduce their population (Smith 1964, 5-9).

In fact, the Apache, Navajo, and Comanche presence in the southwest was so large that the only way the Mexican government could hold their claimed territory was to pay exorbitant amounts of money to bounty hunters and to employ other indigenous tribes to fight the aggressors (Smith 1963, 55-56). Ralph A. Smith studied documentation of bounty hunters from the mid-19th century in his detailed article "The Scalp Hunter in the Borderlands: 1835 – 1850," in which he recalls the escapades of James Kirker, a bounty hunter in this area who hunted down and scalped Apache, Comanche, and Navajo members who posed a threat to civilians in Mexican territory between 1837-1841 (1964). According to Smith, Kirker came to run one of the most successful businesses in American history as he made a fortune off killing indigenous tribesman and exchanging their scalps with the local Mexican governors (Smith 1964, 8). However, in true Wild West fashion, the same government that supplied his fortune would ultimately displease Kirker, influencing his temporary retirement in 1841. Being the sell-sword he was, Kirker then offered his services to the Apache cause following his retirement, and briefly even came to be regarded as "the chief of the Apache nation" by some (Smith 1963, 51). Yet in 1846, Kirker rejoined the Mexican government and once again became regarded as the most renowned bounty hunter of the time (Smith 1964, 16-17). Kirker and others paved the way for many Americans and Natives alike to take advantage of the scalp bounty system in the West, both as a way of earning a profit and killing without consequence. Smith notes that this period marked the peak of scalping in the United States, as more people from different cultures than any other time in U.S. history joined in on the hunt for hair (1964, 19).

The southwestern Indian tribes served as the final widespread territorial threat regarding indigenous groups in the U.S. American utilization of scalping had a quick decline after this peak, as once indigenous populations were under their control, the bounty system was no longer needed (Smith 1963, 64). In the 1890 census, the U.S. officially suggested it could not expand any further (Lang et. al. 1998, 378), while indigenous groups were either relocated to reservations or struck deals with the government to remain on their lands, and the practice of scalping faded into practical nonexistence as the American population dwarfed that of the indigenous.

After the government had culturally and physically subdued Native American peoples to the point where they were no longer a significant obstacle to the country's growth, and after U.S. expansion had reached its completion, reflections began regarding the history of U.S. conflict. This included scalp-taking and where the practice originated. In 1980, James Axtell and William C. Sturtevant suggested "white guilt" as a fitting term to describe the surfacing of European descendants who disliked the historical treatment of indigenous groups and decided to speak against it (Axtell and Sturtevant 1980, 455). In their writing, Axtell and Sturtevant explain how new versions of certain events in history developed from this "white guilt" as a means of building an even viler case for the gross historical mistreatments of indigenous people; and in doing so, advocates of indigenous justice began arguing that Europeans introduced scalp-taking to North America in the 15th century (1980, 451-53). In fact, the authors provide several examples throughout their article detailing statements from indigenous spokespeople, indigenous rights activists, and even historians, who fueled the idea of scalping as originating from Europe (Axtell and Sturtevant 1980, 451-55).
The fact that scholars and the general public bought into this new version of history is disappointing to Axtell and Sturtevant, as they point out that no credible evidence is available to support such a claim. Even reports from the 19th century detail the obvious implementation of scalping long before Europeans arrived (Fletcher 1898, 443; Grinnell 1893, 316; Burton 1864, 50-51). Through historical documentation and archeological evidence, Axtell and Sturtevant effectively douse the idea of Indians adopting the craft of scalp-taking from Europeans (1980, 455-68). Their conclusion on the pertinence of scalping in Native American cultures prior to contact has since been supported by cultural and physical evidence, such as van de Logt’s research on the Pawnee culture (2008), Miller’s theories on scalping in Nebraska (1994), and Smith’s analysis of some of the earliest examples of scalping victims in North America (1995). Each of these specific articles noted above has cited Axtell and Sturtevant’s publication from 1980, making it a staple in the research of scalp-taking origination.

**Conclusion**

After Axtell and Sturtevant’s work, the argument for European-introduced scalping has largely subsided, and most research involving scalp-taking in North America revolves around archaeological data. Essentially, the practice of scalp-taking is now grouped into an encompassing history of cultural violence and conflict that transpired across the U.S. during colonization and westward expansion. Outside of discovering and studying victims of scalping that provide examples of cranial cut marks, the current state of research being solely published on scalping is practically obsolete, as most controversy regarding origination seems to be settled among scholars in the fields of anthropology and archaeology.

As a result of the lack of new or controversial reports on scalping, this paper has focused primarily on detailing the history of the practice and how each article written on the subject has helped to strengthen the next. Also, by connecting these writings in a chronological order based on their contents, this paper acts as a small compilation of authors from the past few decades who all agree that scalping was present among indigenous traditions long before Europeans landed in North America. Still, such analysis of archaeological and historical documentation makes it clear that Europeans adopted scalp-taking and modified the practice to fit their own needs, largely in conflict against indigenous peoples. Such an adoption, as represented by the bounty systems outlined previously, most definitely altered traditional reasons for scalp-taking (such as religious or cultural purposes as noted by van de Logt (2008)). So, while researchers on the subject have come to agree that scalping was already an established practice in North America before 15th century European contact, it is clear that Europeans adopted, intensified, and revolutionized the practice, which would subsequently become a famous and recognizable concept in both historical and fictitious conflicts of American Western lore.

**References**


AN ANALYSIS OF THE POTTERY FROM THE FLOODWAY VILLAGE SITE EaLf-09 IN SOUTHERN MANITOBA

Garth Sutton | University of Manitoba

Keywords | Floodway Village Site, Lockport East Site, Red River, pottery, Laurel, Blackduck, Alexander Fabric Impressed, Sturgeon Falls Fabric Impressed

Abstract | The Floodway Village Site (EaLf-09), situated on the east side of the Red River in southern Manitoba, is a multi-component site, spanning the Middle Period (ca. 4500-1008 BCE) to the Historic period. There has been little analysis conducted on the recovered pottery assemblage. This is vital in the absence of any chronometric dates, to establish a site chronology. Using the identified attributes of the pottery, a chronology is tentatively constructed, vessel count established, and predominant pottery type outlined. The data generated from the research is compared with the assemblage from the Lockport East Site, 500 meters to the south, to establish a case for site contemporality.

This paper provides an analysis of the pottery recovered from the Floodway Village Site (EaLf-09) during the Winnipeg Floodway Salvage Project during the summers of 1963 and 64. Up to now, the assemblage from the site has not been looked at in any capacity, and no cultural chronology developed for the site. It should be noted that this is not an inter-site analysis, but an exercise in the development of an initial cultural chronology based on the diagnostic attributes of the pottery recovered. The pottery assemblage is quite large and due to the inadequate diagnostic nature of body sherds, only rim sherds were selected for analysis. There are four main questions I want to address;

1. What is the dominant pottery type at the Floodway Village Site?
2. What is the total vessel count for the site?
3. What is the dominant decorative motif/attribute at the site?
4. How does the assemblage compare in terms of type and decoration with the pottery recovered from the Lockport East Site (EaLf-01) during the 2016 University of Manitoba Field school?

Site History

The Floodway Village Site (EaLf-09), is situated on the east bank of the Red River, approximately 30 km north of Winnipeg, Manitoba (Figure 1). It was originally discovered as part of the mitigative measures of the Fidler Mounds (EaLf-03) during the Winnipeg Floodway Salvage Project conducted by the University of Manitoba under the direction of Timothy Fiske. The funding for the project was provided through a joint grant by the Province of Manitoba, the University of Manitoba and the National Museum of Canada (Fiske 1963, 3; 1964, 3). The collection from the mitigation is housed in the Anthropology Laboratory at the University of Manitoba.
The field methodology they employed was the excavation of three 20x20 meter and eighteen-meter trenches within a 150m block running in a north-south direction. The excavations were 45m in from the 1964 river margin on a secondary terrace (Fiske 1964, 3). The rate of erosion is difficult to determine but based on the erosion that has impacted the Lockport East Site, approximately 500m to the south, it is safe to assume that erosion has had a detrimental effect on the site (Syms et al. 2017, 9). Another significant impact to site integrity was the excavation and construction of the Winnipeg Floodway, which destroyed a large portion of the site.

One challenge in the analysis was the lack of provenience of the sherds. The system utilized for the curation and cataloguing is unknown, or lost, and made assigning the sherds to specific levels impossible. Due to these impediments, the assemblage is treated as a surface collection. However, the stratigraphy as reported by Fiske (1964), is measured in depth below surface (dbs) and is comprised of; 5-6cm of overlaying sod, followed by 15-25cm of dark topsoil, underlaid by a heavy clay subsoil. Most of the artifacts were recovered from the dark topsoil horizon, approximately between 25-35cm dbs and within a 10cm level. Some recoveries from the sod layer and the subsoil horizon were also reported as well. The recoveries from the sod and subsoil horizons were possibly the result of post-depositional processes such as cryoturbation and bioturbation (Schiffer 1983, 685). The cataloging system used for this assemblage is unfamiliar resulting in loss of provenance of the recovered artifacts.

The site is multi-component with Laurel, Blackduck and “Selkirk” pottery identified within the assemblage as well as some historic. But upon further analysis, the pottery assemblage is much more diverse that originally postulated. The lithic assemblage is large and varied with a large assortment of projectile points, representing different cultural horizons as well as bifaces, scrapers, adzes, gauges mauls etc. (Fiske 1965, 4). The faunal assemblage is large and numerous species are represented within the collection. A bone armband was recovered that is very similar to a band recovered from one of the Fidler Mounds that lay adjacent to the site (Saylor 1976, 100). The analysis of the other assemblages lay outside the scope of this analysis and will be deferred to a later point in time.

A burial was discovered under 50 slabs of limestone and boulders. It contained the remains of 4...
individuals ranging in age from child to adult, there are no rough age estimations to date. The remains were found at 40cm dbs and had few associated grave goods. A nodule of hematite or red ochre along with 2 brown chalcedony (Knife River Flint?) side scrapers were recovered (Fiske 1964, 3; Mayer-Oakes 1964, 4-5).

**Climate, Ecoregion, Flora and Faunal**

The site lies within the Manitoba Lowlands on the Red River Plain. The area has little relief and is bounded on the west by the Escarpment and to the north and east by the Precambrian Shield. The area is directly on top of limestones and dolomites, developed in the Paleozoic epoch and has extensive glacial deposits from Lake Agassiz (Corkery 1997, 14-15). The climate is best described by short warm summers and long cold winters with precipitation highest in late spring and summer (Scott 1997, 44; Smith et al. 2001, 260-61).

The banks of the river would have been gallery forest, consisting of maple, elm and ash with stands of oak and aspen, with clearings consisting of open prairie. Dense stands of tamarack, and alder would have predominated in the low laying, water saturated areas, and in the areas with slightly higher elevation, poplar and spruce would have been available. Along the margins of the river, willow would have been abundant. Some of the understory would have consisted of snowberry, hazel nut and red-osier dogwood, with ferns, high bush cranberry, nannyberry along the lower terraces (Deck 1989, 22-23; Smith et al. 2001, 260-61) (Figure 2). The area has been significantly altered through intensive agriculture, the development of infrastructure and other man-made disturbances.

![Figure 2 Vegetation along Red River](www.winnipegfoundation.com)

There was a diverse range of economically valuable animals present in the area as well. The primary one of course was the bison. There would have been large herds present during the warm season, as well of some diffuse herds present in the river valleys during the cold season (Arthurs 1975, 73). Deer, white and mule, would have been available as well as elk or wapiti and pronghorn would have been valued. Smaller furbearing resources would have included the beaver and muskrat as well as rabbits (Reid 2006). The Red River would have yielded sturgeon, goldeye, catfish, trout, whitefish and various clams. Waterfowl would have been abundant in the Netley Marsh as well as the migratory birds such as Canada Geese would have been available on a seasonal basis (Reid 2006).

**Culture History**

For the duration of this report I will be referring to the assemblage as pottery, not ceramics. Ceramics are vitrified, wheel thrown wares that are fired at higher temperatures and are predominantly glazed. The
Indigenous pottery in the assemblage have different manufacturing techniques, are fired at lower temperatures (unvitrified) and are hand made, primarily recovered from Middle Woodland to Protohistoric (Taylor-Hollings 2017, 29-30; Rice 1987, 3).

There is evidence that the area was occupied during the Middle Period (ca. 4500-100 BCE), before the adoption of pottery. Corner notched projectile points, such as Oxbow (ca. 4500-2500 BCE), and Pelican Lake (ca. 2000-100 BCE) (Syms 2014, 66), have been recovered, indicating an earlier occupation. Since this paper focuses on Woodland groups who utilized pottery, an in-depth summary is not warranted.

The Middle Woodland Period (ca.100 BCE-1000 CE) is represented by groups who manufactured Laurel Pottery (Figure 3). Laurel has a very wide geographic distribution, ranging from Michigan all the way to Saskatchewan (Mantey & Pettipas 1996, 5; Stoltman 1973, 24-25) (Figure 4). The primary method of manufacture is the coil method, where cylindrical roles of clay are layered on top of each other starting at the mouth of the vessel and working towards the base (Budak 1995, 14). The shape of the vessel is usually conical or "coconut shaped", all though there are some examples of semiglobular forms as well (Brandzin-Low 1997, 88; Saylor 1989, 140-41). There are many different decorative motifs present on Laurel pottery, they include; dentate stamps, stab and drag, incised lines, bosse and punctate, pseudo-scallop shell and plain. Dentate stamps consist of small rectangular impressions in the clay, usually made with either a piece of bone with notches carved into one side or possibly antler (Syms 2014, 79). The stab and drag motif were executed with a dentate stamp, dragged back and forth on the wet clay. Incised lines were made with a piece of bone that was dragged either vertically or horizontally across the surface of the wet clay. Impressing either a bone or the end of a reed or stick into the clay created a punctate, on the opposite side of the punctate was usually a bosse, which is an elevated section of surface. On Laurel pottery the punctates were usually rectangular or elongate (Mantey and Pettipas 1996, 5). Pseudo-scallop shell is made by impressing the edge of a dentate stamp at an angle, either vertically or horizontally on the surface of the vessel (Syms 2014, 79-80). There are cases where Laurel pottery exhibits decorative motifs usually found on Late Woodland pottery wares. One common Late Woodland motif on Laurel pottery is cord wrapped object impressions (CWOI). This decoration was made using either a piece of bone, stick or reed with plant fibers or animal sinews wrapped lengthwise around it. This shared trait indicates interaction between Middle and Late Woodland groups (Mantey & Pettipas 1996, 1-2; Peach et al. 2006, 5-6). Paddy Reid and Grace Rajnovich (1991, 206-217) developed 4 Laurel composites based on radiocarbon dating and seriation of the different decorative attributes.

The Laurel toolkit consists of side and end scrapers, a variety of stemmed and notched projectile points, barbed bone harpoons, hafted beaver incisors, a variety of cold-hammered copper tools and the construction of burial mounds, primary in the Boundary Waters area of southern Ontario/Minnesota (Janzen 1968, 37-38; Stoltman 1973, 27). There are some
indicators that Laurel were not the first pottery bearing peoples in Manitoba. Excavations at the Lockport East site (EaLf-01) as well as re-interpretations of assemblages from the Rock Lake area and the Winnipeg River drainage suggest an earlier pottery bearing peoples made incursions into southern Manitoba from the southeast (Norris 2007, 5-6). Below the Laurel level at the Lockport East Site, net-impressed pottery has been recovered. This pottery has been identified as being similar to Brainard Ware, which is common in Minnesota and has been dated to the Early/Middle Woodland Period in Minnesota (Hohman-Caine & Syms 2012, 61). However, there are no dates from Manitoba currently.

Blackduck belongs to the late Woodland period (ca. 800-1000 CE) and is characterized by pottery vessels with globular or rounded bodies, excurvate or flaring rims or necks, splayed or wedged lips and textile impressed surface finish (Figure 5). These vessels were manufactured within a textile bad, usually made from plant fibre, and placed in a leather mold, to provide stability during the manufacturing process (Syms 2014, 83-84). The primary decoration is CWOI, punctates, interior bosses and horizontal brushing (Anfinson 1979, 26-27). Blackduck has a wide geographic range, found in northern Minnesota, NW Ontario, Manitoba and eastern Saskatchewan (Figure 4). The toolkit is like that found in the Laurel assemblage, however, in most Blackduck assemblages, copper is rare.

The Floodway Village Site EaLf-09

The site is situated on the East bank of the Red River, approximately 30km north of the city of Winnipeg. The Lockport East Site (EaLf-01) is 500m south and the Fidler Mounds were directly adjacent to the site. The size of the Floodway Village Site is unknown and little archaeological work has been undertaken between the Lockport and Floodway Village Sites, in order to test the contemporaneity of the two sites. Erosion has played a significant role in site disturbance in the area with major impacts occurring at the Lockport East Site.
The Research Design

As mentioned in the introduction, this study was to create a chronology and to establish a vessel count for the Floodway Village Site, as well as, to possibly make the case for site contemporaneity with the Lockport East Site. Rim sherds from both the sites were analyzed, looking at decorative motifs in order to determine vessel types as well as the cultural origins. Due to time restraints and the fact that body sherds are not considered diagnostic, rim sherds were only analysed. The sherds must be a minimum of 2cm in height and diameter to delineate the attribute as it appears on the sherd (Carmichael 1977, 8). Sherds that have two sides exfoliated, and no lip were excluded from the study because of the impacted nature of the sherd. The sample was determined using a judgement sampling methodology, where the author used his familiarity with the assemblage to collect the units, and to focus on the decorative motifs of the vessels (Sinopoli 1991, 47-48).

A mixed methods approach was implemented because of the nature of the questions, the different types of data utilized, and the different types of data analysed. The collection and analysis of both quantitative and qualitative data was completed in a concurrent manner and was integrated simultaneously (Gray 2009, 122). Metric and non-metric attributes were analysed including; neck form, lip form, surface treatment, zone of decoration, decorative technique, method of manufacture, temper and paste. During the analysis, the author used the manual developed by Syms and Dedi (2007) for the Manitoba Museum. The total sample size for both sites is 119 sherds, 88 for the Floodway Village Site and 31 for the Lockport East Site.

There were some limitations discovered through the course of this study. The sample size for the Lockport East site was quite a bit smaller than the Floodway Village Site, due to the small size, no meaningful statistical analysis was attempted. Some of the sherds in the Lockport assemblage were smaller than the 2cm cut off, they were accepted on the grounds that the sample had to be of adequate size in order for the project to continue. However, the decorative techniques were still discernible on the sherds.

The assemblage from the Floodway Village site, lacked any provenience due to the excavation methodology employed as well as the cataloging system that was implemented then misplaced. In the Mayer-Oakes progress report (1964, 5-6), it was noted that most of the artifacts were recovered from a 10cm level at approximately 25-35cm dbs. However, it is unclear which artifacts were recovered from this level and not from the upper or lower level, because of this, the assemblage was treated as a surface find.

Results EaLf-09

There was a total of 88 vessels from the Floodway Village Site that were analysed as part of this study. The Middle and Late Woodland Periods were represented, with most vessels belonging to the Laurel Configuration, with Blackduck well represented as well. There was a wide range of decorative motifs with cord wrapped object impressed the most common. The vessels were compared with 31 vessels from the Lockport East Site in order to infer the contemporaneity of the sites, the sample size from the Lockport Site was smaller than the Floodway Village site, but still had numerous vessels from the same cultures.

Pottery Types (Figure 6)

The dominant pottery type recovered from the Floodway Village is Laurel with 21 vessels in the assemblage, representing 24 percent of the total. The decorative motifs consisted of dentate stamp, stab and drag, plain, pseudo-scallop shell, bossed and bossed and punctates.

Blackduck is the second most prolific pottery present at the site with 16 vessels representing 18 percent of the total assemblage. The primary decoration consists of right oblique cord-wrapped object (CWOI) on the lip with right oblique CWOI below the lip, with multiple horizontal bands of CWOI bisected by round punctates forming interior bosses, which is a common motif.

The third type is Alexander Fabric Impressed and Sturgeon Falls Fabric Impressed 9 (10%), which is now part of the Rainy River Composite, previously in the
Selkirk Composite (Lenius & Olinyk 1990, 82-84; Meyer & Russell 1987, 7-10). Alexander Fabric Impressed lacks any decoration and Sturgeon Falls has decoration on the lip surface, usually CWOI, which is present in the assemblage. Sandy Lake is represented by 7 vessels making up 8 percent of the total assemblage. The walls of the vessels are thin, between 5 and 7mm, the exteriors have vertical fabric/cord impressions and one vessel has shell temper. There are three miniature vessels (3%) in the assemblage, they have been interpreted as ritualistic vessels, based on their size and the possibility that the surfaces of the vessels have been covered with red ochre. The vessels are finely made with well consolidated paste and uniform wall thickness. It doesn’t look like the work of children, which is sometimes the case. There was one rim sherd (1%) recovered that has been identified as belonging to the Middle Missouri Randal Phase. The remaining consist of unidentified Rainy River 5 (6%), Birdlake 2 (3%), Duckbay 1 (1%) and undetermined 18 (20%). There are several sherds that are either moderately exfoliated or missing the lip to determine type, they are, Blackduck/Birdlake 2 (3%), Selkirk 1 (1%), Laurel 1 (1%) and Sandy Lake 1 (1%).

Neck Form (Figure 7)

The most common observable neck or rim profile is excursive at 27 percent of the total representing 24 vessels, incursive representing 11 percent of the total with 10 vessels in the assemblage and straight with 7 vessels and 8 percent of the total. There were 2 incipient S-rim profiles, representing 3 percent of the total, which is exciting, because this is a plains derived trait. A total of 45 vessels, representing a total of 51 percent were unidentifiable due to the size of the sherd.

Lip Form (Figure 8)

There were 11 forms identified within the assemblage, wedged predominated 20 (23%), followed by rounded at 19 (22%), with Square at 18 (20%) and exterior wedged at 13 (15%). The remaining 18 is comprised of interior wedged 1 (1%), interior beveled 1 (1%), exterior beveled 2 (3%), pointed 1 (1%), in-sloped 1 (1%), out-sloped 1 (1%) and undetermined 10 (11%). There was one sherd (1%) that had a braced rim, which is uncommon in the area, it is common in Minnesota, Iowa, North and South Dakota and Illinois (Holley & Michlovic 2013).

Surface Treatment (Figure 9)

A total of 6 surface treatments were observed in the assemblage with fine smoothed predominating 29 (33%), sandy smoothed 26 (30%) and textile impressed-partially obliterated 11 (13%). The remainder is comprised of undetermined 9 (10%), vertical cord-
roughed 7 (7%), textile impressed 5 (6%) and textile impressed-obliterated 1 (1%). In some cases, the decorations completely destroyed the surface finish, rendering the inference undetermined. In some cases, it is unclear whether the sandy smoothed finish was a result of post-depositional processes, such as weathering or water rolling, or intentional.

Zone of Decoration and Decorative Technique (Figures 10 & 11)

The zone of decoration is the area on the vessel where the motifs occur. In this study there are 7 areas where motifs predominately occur, three on the lip and two on the rim. There are 7 rims (6%) with the inner lip decorated, 6 (5%) with the outer lip decorated and 33 (28%) vessels with the surface of the lip decorated. The predominant decoration on the lip surface is CWOI 22 (69%), followed by incised lines 4 (13%) and notches 3 (9%). The remaining are comprised of various forms of stamps 1 (3%), dentate stamps 1 (3%) and a possible castellation 1 (3%). The “castellation” is directly on the edge of the sherd, which has been broken, leaving very little of the anomaly left. There are 32 (36%) vessels that have decoration on the lip.
Rim has two areas of decoration, the interior and the exterior. There are 19 (17%) sherds that have decoration on the interior of the rim and 51 (44%) with decorations on the exterior. The predominant motif is CWOI 22 (31%), various forms of stamps 13 (18%), dentate stamp 11 (15%) and punctates 9 (13%). The remainder consists of stab and drag 6 (8%), bosse 5 (7%), incised lines 3 (4%), pseudo-scallop shell 2 (3%) and possible figure-nail impressed 1 (1%).

**Method of Manufacture (Figure 12)**

The method of manufacture is how the vessel was constructed. As mentioned above, there were two predominant types of manufacturing that were prevalent during the Middle and Late Woodland Periods. The Middle Woodland Period saw the development of the coiling method, where the vessels were made from the top down by layer cylindrical pieces of clay on top of each other, then smoothing them using a flat, hard object, such as a stone. When a vessel was constructed using the coiling method, there are “coil breaks” or weak unconsolidated paste, that left a recognizable, rounded break at the ends of some sherds (Mantey and Pettipas 1996, 5).

The other form of manufacture was using a leather mold, usually suspended on a wooden frame. The clay was formed inside a fabric bag, usually made from
the inner bark of basswood trees or from a variety of
nettles (Maclean 1995, 40-42). The bag would expand,
and this would facilitate the construction of very thin
walled vessels. The method was very prevalent during the
Late Woodland Period. Vessel wall thickness,
consolidation of the paste, presence/absence of coil
breaks and surface finish are factors that differentiate
between the two methods (Syms 2014, 83-84).

There are three types of manufacturing
methodologies identified in the assemblage. The
predominant type is container molded 59 (67%),
container coiled 26 (30%) and a third one, container
molded and pinched 3 (3%). The last method is usually
reserved for smaller vessels, possibly used in some sort of
ceremonial or ritualistic context. It is hard to ascertain to
any degree of certainty the manufacturing technique, but
ethnohistoric sources indicate that some northern plains
groups roughed out a basic shape, expanded the inside
using their hands, then finished it off in a fabric bad. The
surface finish is usually smoothed (Syms 1977, 61-62).

**Temper and Paste (Figures 13 & 14)**

Temper and paste constitute the body of the
vessel, they make up the “flesh and bones” of the pot. The
paste consists of clay and the temper, which I will explain below. One can infer the construction technique by the composition of the past, whether it is laminated (molded) or compacted (coiled), well worked or loose. Temper can be made of crushed rock, shell, or pieces of old pottery called grog. The most predominant is crushed rock, it can consist of metamorphic, igneous or sedimentary and can be either prepared (grit), or just natural. The predominant form of paste in the assemblage is laminated 63 (72%) and compacted 25 (28%). This is a good indication that the most prevalent form of manufacture was the container molded technique. Grit temper predominated the assemblage with a total of 79 (90%) vessels, followed by natural 8 (9%) with 1 (1%) shell tempered sherd present. The majority of the grit and natural temper consists of quartz and granite. The shell temper is common in Minnesota, Illinois, Wisconsin and the Dakotas. There are some sites in southern Manitoba that have vessels with shell tempering, usually associated with Sandy Lake ware (Taylor-Hollings 1999, 51-54).

**EaLf-01**

The pottery assemblage was compared with the assemblage recovered from the 2016 University of
Manitoba Field School conducted at the Lockport East site, approximately 500m south from the Floodway Village Site. The reason for this is to test the contemporaneity of the two sites, using the pottery assemblages at time markers. The pottery from the Lockport East Site, represents the Middle and Late Woodland Periods and has a total vessel count of 31. The same attributes as the Floodway Village Site was analysed.

**Pottery Types**

The two predominant types from the Lockport East Site are Laurel 5 (16%) and Blackduck 5 (16%). The Laurel types are represented by Dentate Stamped 2 (40%), Plain 2 (40%) and Pseudo-Scallop Shell 1 (20%). The most common decoration on the Blackduck is CWOI on lip surface with vertical CWOI below the lip, followed by several horizontal bands of CWOI bisected by round punctates. Alexander Fabric Impressed and Sturgeon Falls Fabric Impressed have 4 vessels (13%). The remainder consist of unidentified Rainy River 3 (10%), Birdlake 3 (10%), Duckbay 1 (3%), Randel Phase 1 (3%), Ritualistic/Ceremonial 1 (3%) and undetermined 8 (26%).

**Neck/Rim Form**

The rim form for the Lockport assemblage lacks the variety seen in the Floodway Village assemblage. The predominant is excurvate 8 (26%), incurvate 3 (9%) and undetermined 20 (65%). The small sample size and lack of adequately size sherds contribute to this problem.

**Lip Form**

The most prolific lip form is wedged 9 (29%), rounded 5 (16%), with the remainder comprised of exterior beveled 2 (7%), square 1 (3%), interior beveled 1 (3%) and undetermined 13 (42%). There was a lot of lips missing or exfoliated in the assemblage, this accounts for the high number of unidentified lip forms.

**Surface Treatment**

The predominant surface finish is fine smoothed 18 (58%), textile impressed-partially obliterated 5 (16%), textile impressed 1 (3%) and undetermined 7 (23%). Once again, the decorations on the exterior often destroy the surface finish making it difficult to infer surface finish.

**Zone of Decoration and Decorative Motifs**

The outer lip on 3 (7%) vessels have decorations, the inner lip has the same, there are 14 vessels or 32 percent of the total with decorations of the lip surface. There are 14 (45%) vessels with decorations of the lip, with CWOI 12 (86%) predominating and notches 2 (14%). There are 3 (7%) vessels with decorations on the interior of the rim and 21 (47%) vessels with decorations on the exterior of the rim. The predominant decoration consists of CWOI 11 (41%), various stamps 7 (26%), punctates 3 (11%), the remainder are dentate stamps 2 (7%), incised lines 2 (7%), pseudo-scallop shell 1 (4%) and trailed lines 1 (4%).

**Method of Manufacture**

The predominant method of manufacture in the assemblage consists of container molded 25 (81%), followed by container coiled 4 (13%) and container molded/pinched 2 (6%). The molded/pinched method represent vessels that could have served in a ceremonial or ritualistic manner.

**Temper and Paste**

Grit 31 (100%) is the only type of temper evident in the analyzed assemblage, primarily of prepared quartz and granite. The paste is primarily laminated 27 (87%) with the rest 4 (13%) compacted.

**Discussion**

The Floodway Village Site's assemblage's provenience is unknown because the data from the cataloging has been either lost or discarded. This and the fact that the site lacks any chronometric dating makes establishing a chronology very difficult, but by using the identified pottery wares, a rough chronology based on relative dating can be established. All the pottery types have been dated in other contexts, at different sites. The number of vessels identified (see above for numbers) as well as the total vessel count (88) are impressive and
there seems to be a case to be made for the contemporaneity of the Floodway Village Site with the Lockport East Site.

Both the Middle and Late Woodland Periods are represented in the assemblages, with the Late Period predominating 41 (46%), the middle 21 (24%) and undetermined 26 (30%). Compare this with the assemblage from the Lockport East site, which is predominated by the Late Period 17 (55%), with the Middle Period 5 (16%) and undetermined 9 (29%) represented (Figure 15).

There are high numbers of Laurel, Blackduck, Alexander Fabric Impressed and Sturgeon Falls Fabric Impressed at both the Floodway Village Site as well as the Lockport Site, suggesting that the sites were in use at the same time (Figure 16). Both sites have a similar frequency of vessel types, except for Sandy Lake, which is absent from EaLf-01. Randal Phase rim sherds were recovered from both sites, adding weight to the fact that both sites were contemporaneous.

This is significant because Randal Phase is from the Middle Missouri Tradition, the type site is the Dirt Lodge Village Site in South Dakota (Haberman 1993, ). There have been few recoveries of this type of pottery in Manitoba. In South Dakota, the Randal Phase is
associated with horticulture and bell-shaped storage pits and dates to approximately 1050 to 1250 CE.

Conclusions

Up until this point, no meaningful analysis of the assemblage from The Floodway Village Site has been attempted. There has been no cultural chronology developed, based on the diagnostic material culture recovered. The sites distance from the Lockport East Site, might suggest some degree of contemporaneity, which would change the interpretation of the functionality of the Lockport East Site.

Based on vessel attributes within the Floodway Village pottery assemblage analysed, which totaled 88, Laurel is the most common, with Blackduck, Alexander Fabric Impressed and Sturgeon Falls Fabric Impressed comprising the majority of the total.

The pottery assemblage analysed from the Lockport East Site, totalling 31 vessels, indicates that Laurel was the predominant type with Blackduck, Alexander Fabric Impressed and Sturgeon Falls Fabric Impressed comprising the baulk of the total diagnostic assemblage. Comparing the results from the Floodway Village Site with the analysed pottery recovered from the 2016 field school tentatively suggests that the two sites are contemporaneous. Laurel is the predominant pottery type with in the two assemblage, with Blackduck, Alexander Fabric Impressed and Sturgeon Falls Fabric Impressed comprising the baulk of the diagnostic types.

The pottery identified, spans the Middle and Late Woodland Periods for site occupation.

More lines of evidence are needed to substantiate the data generated by this research, but the initial results are indicative of contemporaneity between the Floodway Village Site and the Lockport East Site.

References


MEDICAL SYMBIOSES: A COLLABORATIVE APPROACH TO HIV/AIDS IN SOUTH AFRICA

Christian Barritt-Cleary | University of Manitoba

**keywords** | HIV, AIDS, South Africa, traditional medicine, biomedicine, healers

**abstract** | The introduction of Western Medicine into the HIV/AIDS devastated regions of South Africa has been fraught with difficulty due to a widespread belief that biomedical and traditional medical models are incompatible. In the midst of a growing epidemic, alternative measures are necessary to ensure diagnosis, treatment and counselling for those impacted by the disease. Successful collaborations between Western biomedicine and Traditional Health Practitioners have proven to be an effective strategy that increases the likelihood of early diagnosis and sustained adherence to treatment. A continued and enhanced cooperative approach between traditional and biomedical models may provide the key to reducing the HIV/AIDS burden in South Africa. The goal of such a collaboration is the production of a more patient centered therapy that is both more widely available and accessible to those afflicted with HIV/AIDS.

Traditional health practitioners have, for centuries, been an enduring source of medicinal and spiritual support for the people of South Africa. With the introduction of Western medicine into Sub-Saharan Africa traditional medicine has often been portrayed as inconsequential when compared to its seemingly more enlightened brethren: Biomedicine. This paper aims to demonstrate that a symbiotic relationship, which incorporates the strengths of both medical models, is not only possible, but will prove to be a tremendous step forward in South Africa’s struggle against HIV/AIDS. First, this paper will provide a brief discussion of symbioses. This paper will then provide an overview of HIV/AIDS and South African demographics followed by an analysis of male circumcision and concurrent sexual relationships as some of factors posited to have a casual role in the HIV/AIDS epidemic. Following this, an examination of unsuccessful collaborations between traditional medicine and Western biomedicine will be undertaken. Finally, this paper will argue in favor of a symbiotic approach to medicine in South Africa by examining cases in which collaborations have been effective and considering the factors necessary for a successful merging of the two practices.

Over the course of evolution, Earth’s organisms have developed remarkable strategies which have enabled them to adapt to the often-uncertain conditions of this ever-changing planet. Perhaps one of the greatest innovations and greatest contributors to the success and longevity of a species is the capacity for symbiosis. Symbiosis describes a mutually beneficial relationship between two organisms and is powerfully demonstrated by the harmonious relationship exhibited between the Scleractinian coral and Zooxanthellae algae. This relationship has served not only to protect the algae from predators in marine environments, but because the algae provide the coral with a direct source of organic nitrogen and carbon, has enabled the Scleractinian to remain the dominant reef building corals throughout the Cenozoic era (Benton and Harper 2009: 280,285).

Throughout the furrowed history of human evolution, the concept of symbiosis seems to have eluded humankind in many ways. Human history is marked by the construction of hierarchical categorization systems and metaphoric lines in the sand resulting in turmoil, dissonance and strict dichotomies that separate good from bad, right from wrong, and science from fantasy. Traditional and Western biomedical practices have long been depicted as opposite ends of an uncompromising continuum which places traditional medicine on the end of spirituality, tradition and prescientific thought and Western biomedicine on the end of science, modernity and empirical knowledge (Batisai 2016, 114).
A medical model based on the principles of symbiosis would be one in which the strengths of both parties could be used advantageously to produce a cohesive approach to treatment that, together, is stronger than the sum of its individual parts. The resulting medical symbiosis may prove to be the most successful strategy in South Africa’s fight against HIV/AIDS.

Demographics of HIV/AIDS

Acquired Immune Deficiency Syndrome (AIDS) is a disease, caused by the Human Immunodeficiency Virus (HIV), resulting in a breakdown of the immune system and making an affected person vulnerable to opportunistic infections and certain forms of cancer. The virus is spread via bodily fluids including semen, vaginal secretions, blood and breast milk and may be transmitted via sexual activity, needle sharing, unsafe blood handling practices or, from mother to infant, either in utero or through breastfeeding activities (HIV, CDC and Long 2012, 874). As of 2015, HIV/AIDS had a worldwide adult prevalence rate of 0.80% with 36,710,700 people living with HIV/AIDS and 1,107,600 people dying from HIV/AIDS. With an estimated 6,984,600 people living with HIV/AIDS, South Africa exhibits the highest number of individuals effected by the condition (CIA 2016).

South Africa is the southernmost country on the African continent which, as of 2016, boasted a population of 54,300,704 people. The life expectancy, at birth, for the total population is approximately 63.1 years owing, in part, to a relatively high infant mortality rate (32/1000 live births) and health burdens including HIV/AIDS and other infectious diseases. South Africa has the second greatest HIV/AIDS related mortality rate worldwide with approximately 138,400 AIDS related deaths in 2014 and an estimated adult HIV/AIDS prevalence rate of 18.92% (CIA 2016). To date, there is no vaccine or cure for HIV/AIDS, but remarkable progress has been made regarding treatment. The introduction of Antiretroviral Therapy (ART) has reduced worldwide AIDS related morality rates and has led to a decrease in the number of new infections. As a result, in regions where such biomedical innovations are available and accessible, AIDS has been transformed from a fatal disease to a more chronic and controllable affliction (Kharsany and Karim 2016, 34).

HIV/AIDS in a South African Context

In order to fully appreciate the HIV/AIDS burden it is important to situate oneself within the South African context and to consider some of the factors posited to be influential in the growing epidemic. Recent studies in South Africa have revealed that awareness regarding the spread of HIV is in decline, high risk sexual behaviors are increasing and, consequently, the rate of new infections remains high (LeClerc-Madlala et al. 2016, 186). In general, HIV/AIDS related stigma, which may affect diagnosis and treatment, in conjunction with sexual violence and sexual coercion may help further the spread of the infection. Additionally, the use of injectable drugs, unprotected homosexual activity and involvement in the sex trade are thought to promote a rapid spread of the virus within these high-risk sub-populations (Kharsany and Karim 2016, 34). Within the general population, low rates of male circumcision as well as high rates of concurrent sexual relationships have been posited as the two key factors behind the high incidence of HIV/AIDS (Williams et al. 2006; Halperin et al. 2007).

Circumcision

According to Halperin et al., (2006, 1038) a wealth of biological and epidemiological evidence has established a high correlation between rates of HIV and a lack of male circumcision; a position further strengthened by a 2005 study which concluded that male circumcision, while not guaranteed to prevent infection, does result in 60% reduction in female to male transmission. Women tend to exhibit higher rates of HIV, but male circumcision may indirectly benefit the female population by reducing rates of HIV amongst the males with whom they are intimate. It is important to acknowledge, however, that increases in risk taking behavior amongst circumcised males could undermine any advantage incurred from circumcision (Williams et
In recent years, male circumcision has become increasingly common and more accepted in South Africa yet people’s knowledge concerning the connection between HIV risk and circumcision remains low (Peltzer et al. 2014, 128). The current rate of circumcision in South Africa is approximately 42.80% and the HIV prevalence rate is approximately 18.92% (Peltzer et al. 2014, 128; HIV, CDC and Long 2012, 874). An analysis of data concerning circumcision rates and HIV frequency reveals mixed results. For instance, the prevalence rate of HIV in Kwa-Zulu Natal is 18.00% with a male circumcision rate of approximately 20.70%. However, when one looks to Northern Cape with an HIV prevalence of 6.80% and a circumcision rate of 19.80%, it is clear that there are lurking variables influencing disease transmission (Peltzer et al. 2014, 128). While circumcision may provide some protection, the spread of the infection is also strongly influenced by age at first sexual encounter, risky sexual behavior, extent of urbanization, rural poverty and racial structure. Additionally, traditional circumcisions performed “in the bush,” with a lack of measures to protect against infection, may actually increase HIV risk (Connelly et al. 2008, 793-794).

Transmission

Cultural factors and traditional policies are also noted to be an aspect influencing South Africa’s HIV epidemic. Males are often encouraged to engage in multiple sexual relationships while females, within an impoverished post-apartheid context, may engage in multiple relationships as a means for security or support (Halperin et al. 2007, 22). Studies indicate that HIV spreads more rapidly when engaging in concurrent sexual relationships and results in an epidemic that is ten times greater when compared to contexts in which serial monogamy is the norm. Moreover, a 2002 study revealed that 20% of males and 10% of females in Southern Africa have engaged in sexual relationships with two or more partners within a 4-week period (Halperin et al. 2007, 20). HIV transmission within these concurrent relationships is amplified by two factors: First, upon initial infection individuals experience an Acute Infection period. This typically lasts three weeks and, during this time, infectivity is augmented. While engaging in a monogamous relationship, this window of heightened infectivity typically wanes throughout the course of the relationship thus keeping disease transmission confined between the two partners. Engagement in contemporaneous sexual relationships, however, places every individual within the sexual network at risk (Halperin et al. 2007, 20). Secondly, these concurrent relationships tend to be long term and studies indicate that condom use tends to decline over the course of a long-term relationship. As a result, every sexual act that takes place within the confines of these relationships places an individual at greater risk for infection, and indeed, it is generally within the context of these relationships that HIV transmission occurs (Halperin et al. 2007, 20-22).

Tensions between Dominant Medical Models

When one considers the health care system in South Africa one would be remiss to discount the damaging effects of apartheid, a race-based system of segregation and structural violence that ranged from 1948 until its abolishment in 1994 (Nesbitt 2017). It has been noted that apartheid was a contributing factor to the disparagement of Traditional Medicine wherein “traditional healers were ousted by White Man’s medicine” (Baleta 1998, 554). As of 1994, the South African government has been seeking ways in which to integrate Traditional Medicine into the Western based public health care system, but as of 2016, a complete and successful integration has yet to be realized.

Traditional medicine and biomedicine encompass different world views regarding disease causation. While the biomedical model maintains a scientific approach to etiology, traditional medicine is entrenched with traditional African beliefs concerning ancestors, prayer, witchcraft and contamination from polluting objects and practices (Dickinson 2008, 282). Ultimately, many of the problems between the two models stem from their widely different medical philosophies in conjunction with a lack of empirical
evidence to support the methods and diagnostic practices of traditional healers (Zuma et al. 2016, 2). In addition to the different theoretical approaches, the lasting effects of both colonialism and apartheid have influenced the manner in which traditional healers construe medical collaborations. Healers may feel as though these collaborations will parallel experiences of the past by placing the healers in a subservient position to western authorities. Additionally, some healers feel that collaborations could result in the theft of traditional knowledge (Dickinson 2008, 282).

**Traditional Health Practitioners**

Traditional healers play an integral role in the lives of many African people and there are an estimated 150,000 to 400,000 Traditional Health Practitioners in South Africa alone. Furthermore, it is estimated 70% to 80% of black South Africans use Traditional Healers either alone or in conjunction with Western Medicine (Zuma et al. 2016, 2). Throughout many urban and rural African contexts access to biomedical health care may be limited and, as a result, many people rely on traditional medicine and faith healing due to its widespread availability. Additionally, because traditional medicines are in large part natural, plant-based products these medicines prove to be more affordable than their biomedical counterparts (Batisai 2016, 115). Traditional Health Practitioners (THP) include diviners, traditional surgeons, herbalists, birth attendants as well as spiritual and faith healers (Moshabela et al. 2016, 25). The World Health Organization (WHO) recognizes all forms of healers and defines a traditional healer as “a person who is recognized by the community where he or she lives as someone competent to provide health care by using plant, animal and mineral substances and other methods based on social, cultural and religious practices” (WHO 1978 cited in Moshabela et al. 2016, 25). Traditional Health Practitioners, despite their numerous roles and acceptance by the WHO, occupy a somewhat liminal position in terms of recognition from many other health authorities including the Department of Health and Health Professions Council of South Africa (Zuma et al. 2016, 2). Although traditional surgeons, birth attendants and herbalists were officially recognized as healers under the 2007 Traditional Health Practitioners Act, the Act fails to acknowledge spiritual and faith healers who engage in more divinatory forms of healing (Moshabela et al. 2016, 25). The significance of their exclusion represents biomedicine’s tendency to focus on the objectified body rather than the individual as subject and disregards the significant role that these types of healers play in terms of spiritual enhancement (Zuma et al. 2016, 2).

South Africa has been noted to take a more holistic approach to medicine by incorporating some traditional healing practices into the biomedical system. For instance, *Celosia leptostachya*, a plant used in traditional medicine, has been empirically demonstrated to offer some therapeutic value and may be useful as an alternative antibiotic (Batisai 2016, 115). This holistic approach, however, has been criticized for being inadequate and unidirectional, to the extent that, while traditional healers may refer patients to western clinics, there is limited reciprocity in terms of western clinics referring patients to traditional health practitioners (Batisai 2016, 115).

The health care system in South Africa continues to bear traces of the apartheid system and is criticized for a continued unequal division of health resources between the public and private sectors. This lack of resources including water, sanitation, transportation, drugs and health care workers results in an ineffective system that may be neither affordable nor accessible to lower income citizens. Furthermore, the cost of treatments such as antiretroviral medicines, which are to be taken for the remainder of an individual’s life, may prove to be too expensive to utilize as a long-term treatment plan. From this perspective, traditional medicine offers a more cost effective and accessible route to treatment to those whose access to biomedical intervention is limited by geographic or monetary means (Batisai 2016, 117). It is important to note, however, that the use of traditional medicine is not limited to those with financial burdens and that individuals from middle to upper class contexts will also turn to traditional medicines when, for instance, they
feel that biomedical intervention has been ineffective (Batisai 2016, 118).

**A Lack of Resources**

South Africa is home to approximately 2% of the world’s population yet carries 66% of the global HIV/AIDS burden (Halperin et al. 2007, 19). One of the biggest obstacles in the face of achieving a decline in HIV rates is a lack of health care workers (LeClerc-Madlala et al. 2016, 187). The physician to patient ratio of South Africa, as of 2015, was 0.78 physicians per 1000 individuals (CIA 2016). The Joint United Nations Programme on HIV/AIDS (UNAIDS) suggests that one way to solve the issue of a human resource gap is to train, employ and deploy squads of health care workers into various regions in sub-Saharan Africa, however, the workforce necessary to allow for the scale and scope of such a program may not be feasible in some locations. Alternatively, the patient to traditional healer ratio in much of Africa is estimated to be 1 healer to every 500 people and given that healers are generally more affordable, accessible and culturally in sync, recruiting traditional healers into the biomedical sphere may prove to be a much-needed resource if the gap is to be reduced (LeClerc-Madlala et al. 2016, 187).

**Healers in Biomedicine**

In some cases, traditional healers do work within the biomedical field, yet the denigration of their traditional belief systems has led to a forced suppression of traditional knowledge (Naidu and Dong 2015, 293). For instance, five nurses working in a hospital in Kwa-Zulu Natal, South Africa were trained as both Western nurses and traditional health practitioners. When interacting with patients, however, the nurses were expected to subscribe to the biomedical model of medicine. The nurses felt pressured to refrain from offering their traditional knowledge out of fear of job loss or “compromising the medical practice” (Naidu and Dong 2015, 290,293). Such an approach is in stark contrast to an integrative model; it denies the potential to benefit from the strengths of traditional medicine, particularly in terms of patient-centered psychosocial support. Additionally, this silencing of local voices fosters mistrust between the two sectors which ultimately reinforces the traditional-biomedical dichotomy (Furin 2011,854; Dickinson 2008, 286).

Despite having a long history of involvement in community-based health care programs, traditional healers have occasionally been posited as an obstacle to health care in South Africa. Traditional healers have been generally seen as a hindrance to biomedical intervention and more specifically as a barrier to the effective implementation of antiretroviral therapy (ART) programs (Furin 2011, 849; Pantelic et al. 2011, 137,142). Since their introduction in 1996, ART programs have proven successful in reducing AIDS related morbidity and mortality. Presently, over 75% of ART patients reside in sub-Saharan Africa and approximately 2 million HIV positive South Africans are currently receiving ART (Kharsany and Karim 2016, 41). A 2006 study in South Africa, examined the factors that effected the treatment outcomes for urban community and rural workplace patients enrolled in ART programs. The study concluded that, for males in the workplace program, a consultation with a traditional healer, within one year of beginning ART, was correlated with poorer ART adherence than for those who had either not consulted with the traditional healer or who were living within an urban context (Dahab et al. 2010, 6). The individuals in the workplace context tended to have a poorer education, come from rural backgrounds that were associated with alternative beliefs regarding disease etiology, and displayed an increased likelihood of a reliance on traditional medicine (Dahab et al. 2010,10). However, it is important to note that a contributing factor to this poorer adherence may have been what has been called the ‘healthy worker effect’ in which the patients are more physically fit, feel more physically well and therefore question their need for ART. It is plausible that this healthy worker effect may have had more influence over ART adherence than simply the consultation with the THP (Dahab et al. 2010, 10).
One must also question whether the poorer adherence is not, in fact, related to a lack of coalition between the two medical models. While the authors note that tensions between Western biomedicine and Traditional Medicine are limited patients, particularly those in a rural context, often oscillate between the two treatments strategies (Dahab et al. 2010, 10). These patients are advised by both traditional healers and Western physicians to not combine ART with traditional medicines and, as a result, some patients may choose to discontinue ART altogether. The authors note that, given the first-line role of traditional healers in the treatment of individuals suffering from HIV/AIDS, it is imperative that Western physicians be trained in counselling patients on the importance of a strict adherence to ART even if the patients choose to also seek counselling from a traditional healer (Dahab et al. 2010, 10). According to Zuma et al. (2016, 187), the depiction of culture or traditional health practices as either nonexistent or as obstacles to surmount is not uncommon when attempting to implement effective HIV prevention and treatment programs. According to a study by Dahab et al. (2010, 11), healers are perceived as a barrier to biomedical interventions, yet the authors offer no suggestion towards an approach that could integrate the two practices. Most notably, the authors encourage Western practitioners to insist upon adherence to an ART program but fail to consider the potential positive consequences that could emerge from recruiting traditional healers to do the same. The authors note that poor adherence to the ART program, in the rural workplace context, was largely affected by alternative beliefs regarding disease causation, outcome and a patient’s uncertainty regarding the efficacy of ART use (Dahab et al. 2010, 11). These barriers could likely be overcome by incorporating THPs within the ART programs as THPs are often highly regarded in their communities and often are the go-to person when illness strikes. When used alone consultations with THPs, for HIV infected individuals, could result in delayed or inconsistent treatment. But studies have noted that healers, when treated with respect, are often eager to participate, learn and share their knowledge (Furin 2011, 852, 855; LeClerc-Madlala et al. 2016, 190). In a biomedical context, THPs could prove to be a valuable resource in the improvement of prevention and treatment (Zuma et al. 2016, 187).

**Successful Collaborations**

Despite attempts at suppressing cultural knowledge or an enduring reputation that THPs hinder biomedical intervention, successful collaborations between the two medical models have been implemented throughout the continent.

The Rural Health Initiative (RHI), launched in Lesotho in June of 2006, was a community-based ART program that integrated Traditional Healers and demonstrated just how effective a collaboration between the biomedical and traditional health sectors can be. The rugged mountain terrain, an absence of infrastructure and shortage of health care workers (estimated at 0.5 physicians per 10,000 people) in Lesotho contributes to the burdens of a population heavily impacted by HIV/AIDS by limiting both access and availability to health care (Furin 2011, 849-850). From the onset of the program, traditional healers understood how HIV could be both transmitted and prevented and most healers stated that they carried and distributed condoms to their clientele. The healers, however, felt that those in the biomedical sector had a general lack of knowledge concerning the social factors involved in the HIV epidemic and, as such, were eager to share their insights with the Western medical authorities. The healers also expressed a basic mistrust of biomedical practitioners, were concerned over a loss of income resulting from biomedical intervention and were apprehensive about the impact that ART may have on their patients (Furin 2011, 852). To resolve many of these concerns the RHI program took a cooperative approach to HIV prevention by educating healers about ART, training healers in HIV prevention strategies and counselling techniques and providing condoms for dispersal. Some of the healers were also trained to conduct HIV testing within the communities. Additionally, THPs were invited to share their knowledge concerning patient counselling and herbal remedies in
joint learning sessions. The program also trained THPs to treat patients away from the clinical context and to identify symptoms that signified an individual's health was failing and that the individual needed to be directed to the clinic (Furin 2011, 852, 849, 853-854). Overall, the experience was described as positive. One healer reported being happy to have been both trained and educated by the RHI, to receive payment for his referrals to the clinics and most importantly to feel that he had an active role in contributing to the fight against HIV (Furin 2011, 852). When interviewed, a biomedical practitioner confided that he was advised at the outset of the collaboration, that the THPs would "get in the way". After having worked amongst them, the practitioner acknowledged that he had learned a great deal from the THPs and believed that the spiritual and emotional support they provided to patients was particularly valuable (Furin 2011, 854). From these accounts, one can see how the RHI moved beyond simply training THPs to follow biomedical practices. Instead, the program developed into a mutually beneficial relationship in which both parties involved felt they had learned something of value and contributed to HIV prevention. Despite a small sample size of only 17 traditional healers, this study demonstrated that THPs could prove to be a valuable resource in community-based HIV prevention programs. Additionally, this study emphasized that the key components of a successful partnership are reciprocal training and education, mutual respect and sense of community spirit (Furin 2011, 855).

An obstacle which was previously discussed described the perceived negative impact that a consultation with a traditional healer had in terms of an individual's likelihood of adhering to an ART program (Dahab et al. 2010, 4). Findings of this study indicated that, for individuals in a rural workplace context, consultation with a traditional healer, within one year of beginning an ART program, was associated with a greater likelihood of poor ART adherence (Dahab et al. 2010, 6). A criticism of this study, however, considered whether it was a lack of collaboration between the two models that effected an individual's adherence to the program as opposed to something inherent within the traditional model that dissuaded individuals from pursuing ART. In contrast to this study, an analysis of the iTcEACH program found that integrating traditional healers into the biomedical model actually increased adherence to ART, particularly for individuals who would not normally have access to, or seek the assistance of, biomedical practitioners (LeClerc-Madlala et al. 2016, 190).

The iTcEACH program, initiated in Kwa-Zulu Natal South Africa, was designed to explore the benefits of a collaborative effort between the traditional and biomedical models. The program sought to use the networks of the Traditional healers as an avenue through which high rates of HIV and tuberculosis (TB), within the healer's communities, could be managed (LeClerc-Madlala et al. 2016, 189). Through workshops, traditional healers were trained to collect medical histories, keep records and recognize the symptoms of HIV and TB. A consequence of this model was a realization, on the part of biomedical practitioners, of just how valuable a resource the traditional healers were, particularly in terms of the psychosocial support they extended to their patients. Overall, the iTcEACH program was successful in increasing HIV testing and allowing for more immediate treatment. Additionally, and in contrast to Dahab et al. (2010) findings, the collaboration with the traditional healers improved adherence to ART because the traditional healers could connect with people who may normally have had limited access to clinics. By both encouraging the use of ART and emphasizing that the patients need not choose between ART and traditional medicine, traditional healers proved that they were not a barrier to biomedical intervention but instead an avenue to its effective implementation (LeClerc-Madlala et al. 2016, 190).

**Stigma**

One of the biggest factors thought to be influencing diagnoses and treatment seeking behavior of individuals living with HIV/AIDS is stigma. In the past, stigma and discrimination against people living with
HIV/AIDS was so pervasive that it had been considered one of the driving elements of the HIV epidemic (Treves-Kagan et al. 2016, 2). Recent studies, however, indicate the stigma is declining but “anticipated stigma” remains constant and continues to be an obstacle to HIV treatment and prevention (Treves-Kagan et al. 2016, 8). Individuals infected with the virus fear moral judgement and social sanctions generally in the form of social isolation wherein the afflicted individual is shunned from either the community or the family (Treves-Kagan et al. 2016, 5). A traditional health practitioner stated, in reference to a refusal by some to undergo HIV testing or reveal their HIV positive status, that “it is better to die with dignity than live with shame” (Moshabela et al. 2016, 26). Stigma, or the fear of stigma, not only delays HIV testing but may also interfere with the implementation of HIV interventions (Treves-Kagan et al. 2016, 2). Stigma remains particularly pervasive in high risk groups including sex workers, men who engage in sexual activities with men and intravenous drug users. Within these high-risk subgroups, the likelihood of seeking treatment and diagnosis is greatly reduced which puts these individuals at risk for developing an HIV super infection. HIV super infections occur when individuals who already carry the virus become infected with another variant of the HIV virus which leads to complex forms of transmission wherein the carriers may pass on either variant or a hybrid form of HIV (Kharsany and Karim 2016, 38).

Interestingly, once an individual begins treatment stigma has little effect on whether or not the person will adhere to the regime. ART treatment may actually reduce stigmatization by reducing the physical indicators of HIV/AIDS and allowing individuals to appear, at least superficially, that they are not infected. The iTEACH study demonstrated that collaborations with traditional healers increased adherence to ART programs. From this perspective, an alliance between traditional medicine and biomedicine could inadvertently work to reduce HIV/AIDS related stigma by controlling the outward manifestations of the disease that function as a source of shame (LeClerc-Madlala et al. 2016, 190).

Traditional health practitioners are not immune to the fear of stigmatization. However, many are aware of the importance of testing and seeking treatment, and advocate that education is necessary to alleviate the shame associated with an HIV diagnosis. The reduction of HIV/AIDS related stigma and anticipated stigma is an obstacle in the face of HIV/AIDS treatment and prevention that is yet to be resolved. The social influence of THPs in South Africa, however, places them in a prime position to set an example for community members by openly testing themselves for HIV and encouraging others to do the same. Similarly, given that traditional healers are frequently more accessible and culturally attuned, healers may serve as the best candidates for developing social support networks within their communities which may later be utilized to increase community involvement in HIV prevention strategies (Moshabela et al. 2016, 28-29; LeClerc-Madlala et al. 2016, 187).

Ensuring Success

What are the factors that differentiate successful traditional-biomedical partnerships that are lacking in the studies that have found traditional medicine to be a hindrance to biomedical intervention? What steps should be taken to ensure a successful partnership?

According to Dickinson (2008, 286), there are two general approaches to collaborations between biomedical and traditional medicine that are most likely to fail. First, is an attempt to convert traditional healers to a strict western biomedical understanding of HIV/AIDS. Such an approach may result in a refusal, on the part of traditional healers, to participate in the programs because doing so may create a situation in which the healer feels as though they are simply an assistant to biomedical practitioners, that they are subservient to biomedical practitioners or that they are required to abandon their traditional belief systems (Dickinson 2008, 286, 282, 287). The second method destined for failure is to insist that traditional healers do not have a cure for HIV/AIDS. Such an approach may create distance between the two groups, cause traditional healers to
allude to instances in which ART has failed, or encourage and draw attention to healers who adamantly claim that they do have a cure. Neither of these strategies will prove particularly helpful when attempting to form a partnership (Dickinson 2008, 287).

According to LeClerc-Madlala et al., (2016, 190) factors necessary to ensure a successful integration of traditional medicine and biomedicine are patience, tolerance, community involvement, seminars and educational workshops. However, the key factor, and first step in any integrative model, is mutual respect, particularly on the part of biomedical authorities who, historically, have sustained a more negative mind-set regarding these collaborations. Within the context of educational workshops and seminars both sensitivity and respect should be extended; biomedical practitioners should refrain from lecturing traditional healers and instead structure a learning environment built on “culturally appropriate adult education principles” that foster discussions and encourage questions which are, in turn, given meaningful answers (Green et al. 1995, 511). Additionally, initial meetings between traditional and biomedical practitioners may prove beneficial in that they allow participants to become acquainted with each other and with an unfamiliar medical ideology (Dickinson 2008, 287). Finally, within these initial meetings it is imperative the participants from both sectors look for the strengths in both medical models and seek “windows of compatibility”, areas of connection between the two sectors which may subsequently serve as a starting point from which to initiate the collaborative program (Dickinson 2008, 286; LeClerc-Madlala et al. 2016, 190). A model which could be born from such an approach may be one that is more patient-centered and utilizes the strengths of both practices. Within this framework, biomedical practitioners may focus on HIV testing and ART and traditional practitioners may focus on patient support, stigma reduction, strengthening of the immune system and the treatment of opportunistic infections (Dickinson 2008, 286).

Conclusion

Traditional Health Practitioners remain a staple in the daily lives of many South African people by offering both medical aid and spiritual support. With the introduction of Western medicine into the region, traditional medicine has frequently been posited as an obstacle in the face of biomedical advancement (Furin 2011, 849; Pantelic et al. 2011, 137,142). This paper has addressed the heavy burden of HIV/AIDS in South Africa and provided an analysis of male circumcision and concurrent sexual relationships as potential influential factors in the epidemic. While some studies suggest that traditional healers act as hinderance to biomedical intervention an abundance of research counters this position with integrative models that have proved effective in increasing rates of HIV diagnosis, treatment and ART adherence. Drawing on the bond formed between the Scleractinian coral and the Zooxanthellae algae as an analogy for symbiosis, this paper has advocated for a symbiotic approach to medical intervention. This approach would combine the strengths of both models to form a cohesive treatment strategy that, together, is stronger than the sum of its individual parts. A successful collation, however, is not possible without mutual respect, sensitivity, culturally appropriate adult education programs and an earnest effort to acknowledge the strengths within both medical models. When the above conditions are met, successful collaborations are not only possible but, through the deployment of domestic resources, may prove to be a tremendous step forward in South Africa’s battle against HIV/AIDS.

References


Moshabela, Mosa, Thembelihle Zuma, Joanna Ome-Gliemann, Collins Iwuji, Joseph Larmarange, Nuala McGrath, and on Belhalf of the ANRS12249 TasP Study Group. 2016. "It is Better to Die" The Experience of Traditional Health Practitioners with the HIV Treatment as Prevention Trial Communities in Rural South Africa (ANRS 12249 TasP Trial)." AIDS Care 28 (3): 24-32.


The United Nations Convention on the Rights of Persons with Disabilities has been in effect since 2008 as the primary basis for human rights of persons with disabilities. The convention arose after years of struggle to overcome harmful models of disability. There is much to discuss in the creation of the convention, as well as on the language choices the convention and other disability policies use. Those with disabilities argue that specific terminology changes can more accurately represent how they view themselves and in turn can change how they are perceived by the wider society. Simple changes in phrasing can allow disability to be viewed as coming from society, rather than something existing inherently within individuals. There is a disconnect between the language those with disabilities use to describe themselves and the language used by those who do not have disabilities. This paper begins with the history of disability struggle at the UN, including the efforts to shift away from harmful views of disability, but continues by looking at terminology and varying forms of advocacy from family advocacy, to self-advocacy, and accessibility efforts. Various official documents are examined as well as academic examinations of disability rights and some anecdotal evidence from those who are themselves a person with a disability, in the hopes of giving a well-rounded introduction to the rights of those with disabilities.

History of Disability Rights

The Convention on the Rights of Persons with Disabilities (CRPD) was adopted at the end of 2006 and was entered into force May 3rd 2008. This was after eight negotiation sessions over the course of four years, which "in UN terms...is lightening quick [sic]" (Degener and Begg 2017, 1). While the negotiations for the CRPD arrived at results quickly, it was only after decades of struggle in order to have disabilities recognised as within the scope of human rights in the first place. Prior to any sort of disability recognition at the UN, the Universal Declaration of Human Rights mentioned disability only as an event like it would mention sickness (Degener and Begg 2017). There were only very infrequent mentions of persons with disabilities during the first two decades of the United Nations’ existence and “disabled persons in general were regarded as objects of rehabilitation, while as citizens and rights holders, they remained invisible” (Degener and Begg 2017, 3). Proceeding this invisibility was a focus on the medical model of disability, which “saw impairment ... as a potential barrier to holding and exercising rights” (Degener and Begg 2017, 4). This ended when the General Assembly decided 1981 would be the ‘International Year of Disabled Persons’ which resulted in the ‘Programme of Action’ (Degener and Begg 2017). The Programme of Action was still based on traditional disability models, but “added a new dimension by calling for equalisation of opportunities” (Degener and Begg 2017, 6). Finally, disability activism arrived at its current phase which is uniquely marked by organisations of persons with disabilities rather than organisations for persons with disabilities (Degener and Begg 2017). Out of this activism and political climate arose demands for the UN to adopt a convention for the human rights of those with disabilities (Degener and Begg 2017). Calls for a convention came
from both “disabled persons’ organisations [who] were turning themselves into human rights organisations [while] the mainstream human rights community was also taking some first small steps to look at disability as a wider human rights issue” (Degener and Begg 2017, 13). The wider scope of human rights organisations was mainly to look at issues other than solely looking at the detention of individuals on the grounds of mental health (Degener and Begg 2017). When it came time for the actual negotiations of the convention, it quickly became apparent that scepticism existed as to whether a convention was necessary in the first place. Mexico, Chile and Norway, among others, felt a convention was more than necessary; the United States, however, questioned whether a convention was the best way to strengthen the rights of persons with disabilities and Canada suggested that it may be more effective to update pre-existing human rights treaties to the claims of persons with disabilities (Degener and Begg 2017). Eventually, however, the view of a new convention changed, and many of the delegates with reservations were able to see the benefits and shifted to being in favour, including Canada. While issues arose while drafting and working the convention, “for the most part there was little controversy, and all delegates agreed on the need to promote inclusion for persons with disabilities” (Degener and Begg 2017, 27). Degener and Begg conclude their summary of the history of the CRPD with the assertion that never had those with disabilities been so influential when it came to international lawmaking and that they finally became “true subjects of human rights” (Degener and Begg 2017, 37).

Disability Policies

The CRPD is the overarching agreement on disability rights; at the various state levels, however, exists policies derived from the CRPD. The Canadian Charter of Rights and Freedoms for example, does not have any specific mention of disability except to list it in amongst the factors that should not lead to discrimination (Government of Canada 1982). In Manitoba, however, is the Accessibility for Manitobans Act, a local policy that is derived from the CRPD. The CRPD talks of the human rights of persons with disabilities in a broad, more general sense, offering overarching criteria that states are required to follow. Including, for example, that states have to have policies in the first place: “to take all appropriate measures, including legislation, to modify or abolish existing laws, regulations, customs and practices that constitute discrimination against persons with disabilities” (United Nations 2006, 5). The statements are so broad they could be applicable to not only persons with disabilities but to any marginalized group of people. Many of the articles in the CRPD are more specific, but the CRPD does not seek to offer specific ways in which states can go about following these statements. Local policies on the other hand, stress more specific criteria to be followed and list the consequences that will arise if policies are broken. The Accessibility for Manitobans Act begins with broad statements in the vein of the CRPD but continues by defining barriers and describing the mandate of the minister responsible for the act. From there the act has more specific statements than the CRPD, such as: the advisory council must consult with “persons disabled by barriers or representatives from organizations of persons disabled by barriers” (Province of Manitoba 2014, 5) and even as specific as how many people should be on the advisory council. Local policies, such as the Accessibility for Manitobans Act, need to be more specific as they are the ones ultimately implementing changes in order to improve accessibility. Thus, they need to know specifics such as the consequences for those who refuse to meet accessibility recommendations. As a comparison of other disability rights that exist within the country, Saskatchewan’s Human Rights Commission has the Accessibility Rights of Persons with Disabilities General Overview. While a much smaller document, it defines disability as covering a wide range of conditions (listing several) and states that it is an evolving concept (Saskatchewan Human Rights Commission 2010). Primarily however, the document is a list of laws under which disability rights are protected, such as the Canadian Charter of Rights and Freedoms and the CRPD and does not list specific requirements like the Accessibility for Manitobans Act.
Terminology

While both the CRPD and the Accessibility for Manitobans Act, use certain words to describe disability rights violations, such as ‘barriers’, the tone and language is different. For example, this quote from the preamble of the CRPD: “concerned that, … persons with disabilities continue to face barriers in their participations as equal members of society and violations to their human rights” (United Nations 2006, 2) has a similar intention as, “whereas achieving accessibility will improve the health, independence and well-being of persons disabled by barriers” from the Accessibility for Manitobans Act (Province of Manitoba 2014, 1). Both talk of barriers, but the Accessibility for Manitobans Act talks of barriers as what is disabling the individual, the CRPD talks of barriers as what is keeping the individual with a disability from participating as an equal member of society. The difference is subtle, but the former makes barriers the disabling factor whereas the latter makes barriers the excluding factor. The language in the Accessibility for Manitobans Act fits with what Rodman and Cooper, citing Higgins suggest: that “society ‘makes disability’” (1995, 589). Rodman and Cooper continue saying, “individualizing disability is a sleight of hand that blames each person with a so-called disability for what is a socially constructed problem” (1995, 589). The language in the Accessibility for Manitobans Act would suggest that it follows this theory, that individuals are disabled because the society they live in is not accessible. It is interesting then to consider what this means for how the CRPD frames disability. There is no questioning the importance of the CRPD as a framework for all other disability legislation, there is just the question to consider as to whether the language in the CRPD accurately frames how those with disabilities view themselves; and whether this is simply something that has changed since the CRPD was written in 2006. To also be considered is why a different meaning can be read from the slightly different phrasing in the Accessibility for Manitobans Act when it draws from the CRPD and acknowledges this within its first few statements: “under the United Nations Convention on the Rights of Persons with Disabilities, in which Canada ratified in 2010, member states are expected to take appropriate measures to ensure accessibility and independent living” (Province of Manitoba 2014, 1). This difference could be down to the eight year span between the writing of these two documents; the framing of disability may have changed. Neither the Canadian Charter of Rights and Freedoms nor the Accessibility Rights of Persons with Disabilities General Overview mention barriers. These considerations can be kept in mind during the rest of the paper.

Another terminology difference to consider: the use of ‘persons with disabilities’ rather than ‘disabled persons’; this is known as ‘person first’ versus ‘identity first’ language. The CRPD and other official documents use ‘persons with disabilities’ as that is considered the official terminology. Shuttleworth and Kasnitz state however, that those with disabilities prefer ‘disabled persons’ as it reflects “that disability is not a part of the impaired person but is a social process that disables” (2004, 141). This phrasing difference is also related to the above theory, from Rodman and Cooper (1995), that disability comes from society. Rodman and Cooper are not alone in suggesting that society disables as Turner (2006) also ruminates on the point. Turner comes to this position, which he calls the ‘social model of disability’, as a way to continue disability theory away from the biomedical model of disability, which according to Degener and Begg (2017) was the first phase of disability struggle at the UN. According to Turner “there are obvious negative consequences of the medicalization of patients and the use of a biomedical model in the definition of disability and in regimes of rehabilitation” (2006, 100). This idea is not new, since before the negotiation of the CRPD there have been efforts from disability rights organizations to move away from the medicalization and rehabilitation of disability (Degener and Begg 2017). The biomedical model of disability comes from a societal view that bases effective citizenship on elements of society, such as work, war and reproduction, that are limited for those with disabilities (Turner 2006). The social model of disability instead views “people with impairment [as] disabled because in an ‘ableist culture’ they suffer from lack of rights, but this does not mean we can ignore the physical or embodied
dimensions of their pain and vulnerability” (Turner 2006, 101). Most literature points to this argument, that inaccessible society is what disables those with impairments. This includes Fyson and Cromby (2013) in their discussion of intellectual disabilities and neoliberalism. Neoliberal societies are not designed for those with intellectual disabilities, because they require individuals to be able to make their own decisions, unaided or unconvinced by others in the process (Fyson and Cromby 2013). Individuals with intellectual disabilities are disabled by society requiring this of them, because it is not something that is always possible. This is not the conclusion Fyson and Cromby arrive at; they argue that “current conceptualisations of personhood in relation to human rights excludes people with [intellectual disabilities]” (2013, 1164). However, it is possible to also read an argument for neoliberal society disabling those with intellectual disabilities in their paper as they do discuss neoliberal social policies as “impacting” on those intellectual disabilities (Fyson and Cromby 2013, 1165). Interestingly, of the authors of these texts, only one identifies themselves as a person with a disability within their paper (Kasnitz does this in order to establish her position in the disability discussion), and that is the only paper to use ‘disabled person’ rather than ‘person with disability’. While the other papers cited above make the same argument as Shuttleworth and Kasnitz (the sole authors to use ‘disabled person’), that society is what disables, none of the papers make the same terminology decision. They alone, are the sole paper to be identified as written by someone with a disability, and to make the decision to say ‘disabled person’. In order to include additional perspectives from those with disabilities, below are some anecdotal and non-academic accounts from individuals who identify as having a disability in order to include their perspective in the ‘person first’ versus ‘identity first’ discussion.

Non-academic sources state that the choice to use ‘person first’ or ‘identity first’ language is a matter for decision by each individual for whom the language may apply. Despite the sentiment of wanting to see the person first rather than the disability first, or seeing solely the disability, in ‘person first’ language, many continue to identify as ‘disabled’ rather than ‘with a disability’ (Liebowitz 2015). Liebowitz acknowledges that this sentiment is understandable, however, she also states that there is no way to see the person without the disability, as it is an integrated part of who they are (2015). Others mirror this sentiment, Smith argues that by placing the identity (in this instance ‘disabled’) first, there is recognition of it being an important part of someone’s experience (2016). Sinclair uses the analogy of someone with various coloured shirts; you can take away the shirts and they would remain the same person, if the disability were taken away they would not, he argues (1999). Leibowitz makes a similar comparison with other identities, such as being Jewish or female, these are both identities you phrase using ‘identity first’ language rather than using ‘person first’ language (which would involve saying ‘person with’ either), because they are neutral; by saying ‘person with’ whichever identity, you are separating it, which insinuates that it is something you would want to be separated from (2015). Leibowitz concisely summarises her reasoning for preferring ‘identity first language’: “my wheelchair is not the problem. The inaccessibility . . . is. Saying I am disabled more accurately highlights the complex biosocial reality of disability” (2015, paragraph 7). This is the same argument Turner (2006) makes regarding the social model versus the medical model of disability. Despite all this, I will continue to use ‘person with disability’ throughout this paper not just to match with the language in disability policy and the CRPD, but also since I myself am not disabled, I do not feel right making the decision to use ‘disabled person’.

**Intellectual Disabilities, Accessibility, and Advocacy**

Returning to Fyson and Cromby’s article, in more detail it is questioning whether human rights are effective for those with intellectual disabilities as human rights law imagines a very specific view of personhood that is not necessarily inclusive of those with intellectual disabilities (2013). By nature of the way human rights function, it is required that there are people who the rights apply to;
however, “a person with rights has the capacity for reason and conscience. This immediately creates difficulties in relation to the human rights of people with intellectual disabilities...who by definition have, to a greater or lesser degree, an impaired capacity for reason” (Fyson and Cromby 2013, 1164). Added to this is the fact that welfare services follow neoliberal approaches which “further emphasise the requirement for ‘reason’ as enacted through autonomous decision-making” (Fyson and Cromby 2013, 1165). The capacity for reason also varies tremendously within people with intellectual disabilities, further complicating the problem (Fyson and Cromby 2013). Fyson and Cromby demonstrate, with several examples, how human rights law does not properly function for those with intellectual disabilities (2013). Evaluating Schelly’s ethnography, Fyson and Cromby demonstrate the occasional difficulty of those with intellectual disabilities to make their own meaningful choices with the example of a young man with an intellectual disability who, if making his own choices, would remain in the house all the time watching TV and who’s social worker is eventually forced to intervene (2013, 1167). When given completely free decision-making, there is the possibility that those with intellectual disabilities will make choices that are not in their own best interests (Fyson and Cromby 2013). Rather than completely free decision-making, Fyson and Cromby talk of supported decision-making as an alternative and as “one potential solution to the ‘problem’ of neoliberal service structures which require people with [intellectual disabilities] to be autonomously ‘in control’ of their lives and support” (Fyson and Cromby 2013, 1168). With supported decision-making however, comes the possibility of substitute decision making being used instead. This is where support workers judge those with intellectual disabilities to be incapable of decision-making and make decisions themselves for the individual or only offer the right to make decisions when the support worker feels that the individual is capable (Fyson and Cromby 2013). This can result in individuals with intellectual disabilities being “encouraged to make choices about what to wear or what to eat, while being excluded from participation in more fundamental choices about where or with whom to live” (Fyson and Cromby 2013, 1168). Fyson and Cromby do not offer a conclusive alternative for those with intellectual disabilities, but instead simply hope for better understandings of the problematic nature of considering reason as a requirement for personhood (2013). They conclude their paper wanting to ensure that what is taken from it is not “a reversion to more paternalistic models of care for people with [intellectual disabilities]. Nor...an attempt to deny individuals with [intellectual disabilities] a right to be involved in decisions which will affect their lives” (Fyson and Cromby 2013, 1171).

For a potentially productive alternative to that which Fyson and Cromby warn against we can turn to MacQuarrie and Laurin-Bowie. MacQuarrie and Laurin-Bowie also look at accessibility for those with intellectual disabilities as their “inclusion requires more than a simple adaptation, accommodation, or device” (2013, 26). They argue that there is little knowledge of the challenges faced by those with intellectual disabilities, from those who are abled bodied and from those with non-intellectual disabilities (2013). They are not looking to downplay the struggles of those with physical disabilities, but rather make aware the complex struggles of those with intellectual disabilities, which cannot be solved solely with logistical solutions. As they describe:

while many people with disabilities may participate and be included in their school, community, or workplace when provided with a ramp or other adaptation, for people with intellectual disabilities real inclusion requires that classrooms, workplaces, communities, and societies are organized in ways that enable their participation. (MacQuarrie and Laurin-Bowie 2013, 26)

Some, such as Rodman and Cooper (1995), would argue that for those with physical disabilities, logistical solutions provide more than just physical inclusion, but also a sense of belonging, again however, MacQuarrie and Laurin-Bowie are arguing that both inclusion and a sense of belonging require more than just logistical solutions for those with
intellectual disabilities. MacQuarrie and Laurin-Bowie arrive at a similar discussion to Fyson and Cromby (2013), that those with intellectual disabilities require different resources in order to make decisions and to voice those decisions. One of the examples they offer is that of an individual named Charlie and his family, who together, work to voice Charlie's decisions (MacQuarrie and Laurin-Bowie 2013). Having the family work together helps mitigate the risk of guardianship (only one person speaking for Charlie) and helps to "ensure that any one decision made is, in fact, Charlie's decision" (MacQuarrie and Laurin-Bowie 2013, 33). MacQuarrie and Laurin-Bowie share this story as an example of how organisations are able to work with families such as Charlie's to advocate for the CRPD to recognize the role families play in the lives of those with disabilities (2013). This inclusion of families in the CRPD is visible in several places: in section x of the preamble which concludes “family members should receive the necessary protection and assistance to enable families to contribute towards the full and equal enjoyment of the rights of persons with disabilities” (United Nations 2006, 3) and in several places in the articles.

As the authors above have demonstrated, disability rights exist not solely to solve logistical problems, such as ramps or funding, but also to aid in less concrete and more abstract areas. As Rodman and Cooper explain: "[accessibility] is both about concrete ramps and about ideas of empowerment, about mind and body" (1995, 590). This is not only important when considering the different accessibility requirements for those with physical disabilities compared to those with intellectual disabilities, it is also important when promoting self-confidence, independence and overall well-being in all aspects of life for those with all types of disabilities (Rodman and Cooper 1995). Disability rights also serve to normalize accessibility efforts, which continues to add the overall well-being of those with disabilities. Currently however, many accessibility efforts seem special or out of place; as Rodman and Cooper explain: "ramps in residential environments still seem 'special' to most of us, while steps for example seem neutral. The point is that we make steps neutral by assumptions with which we frame space" (1995, 596). By expanding accessibility efforts, accessibility will hopefully become normalized (Rodman and Cooper 1995). Logistical accessibility efforts aid in that normalization, which benefits those with all types of disabilities, even if the efforts only directly help those with only one type of disability. By viewing accessibility efforts as a whole, rather than separating them based on the type of disability, the claims of disability rights are strengthened. As described by MacQuarrie and Laurin-Bowie: “the success of the CRPD would depend on uniting the disability community” (2013, 29).

Self-Advocacy

The examination of MacQuarrie and Laurin-Bowie and Fyson and Cromby's research led to a discussion of the role families play in advocating for persons with disabilities. Changing course however, we can look at self-advocacy methods. During their fieldwork, Daley and Weisner interviewed teens with both intellectual and physical disabilities and some mental illnesses (though primarily intellectual disabilities) in order to try and gain an understanding of the teens' explanatory models; which, as they explain, are "an individual's beliefs in five domains of an illness or health condition: etiology, time and mode of symptom onset, pathophysiology, course of sickness and treatment" (2003, 25). The primary focus of their research is to show that teens do indeed have explanatory models for their disabilities, but they conclude with an explanation of how they think explanatory models can help with both advocacy and self-advocacy (Daley and Weisner 2003). Daley and Weisner believe that these explanatory models can also help demonstrate the ways the teens in their study understand themselves, their disabilities and their place in the world (2003). They begin their paper with an abridged version of the responses of 23 teens. Mainly they are trying to determine if the teens perceive themselves to be different from their peers and the understanding they had of their own disability (Daley and Weisner 2003). As they
summarise the general results: "some adolescents may not perceive themselves as different at all, even though diagnosed with a specific disability. Others see difference but not in the areas that relate to their diagnosis. Still others may identify with the disability as defined by the researcher or the school they attend" (Daley and Weisner 2003, 26). They conclude the paper with in-depth descriptions of two of the teens’ explanatory models. The first is Jay who, along with other intellectual disabilities, has anger management problems which is the main focus of his own explanatory model (Daley and Weisner 2003). According to Daley and Weisner, his anger is something he would like to overcome, but he also identifies strongly with it, leading to a struggle in his daily life (2003). Throughout Jay’s life his parents discussed his limitations with him, not understanding how other parents would not; because of this and the fact that he is highly verbal, despite his cognitive limitations, he has a well-developed explanatory model and sense of his disability (Daley and Weisner 2003). The other teen they offer a description of is Bobby, who was diagnosed with autism at a young age (Daley and Weisner 2003). Bobby has been making great improvements since his diagnosis and “is able to read and comprehend at a college level,… and attends regular classes, receiving no special assistance. He does very poorly in most school subjects however, and has only recently begun to make genuine friendships” (Daley and Weisner 2003, 42). Unlike Jay, Bobby was not fully explained his impairment and has instead created a story, attributing his disability to his up-bringing; a relatively isolating one growing up in a neighbourhood with few other children (Daley and Weisner 2003). At the time of the interview, he had come to view his disability as a part of who he is and to understand how pervasive it is, acknowledging that it affects his entire life (Daley and Weisner 2003). Daley and Weisner offer these examples in order to demonstrate “that teens with developmental, cognitive, emotional and behavioral problems have ideas on a wide range of topics relating to their difference or disability” (2003, 43). Daley and Weisner believe their findings point to a way explanatory models can be used as adaptive tools to make sense of the world and hopefully assist policy-makers and service providers because it allows for “interventions [to] be more effectively tailored to the individual” (2003, 44). Finally, listening to teens own explanatory models can aid in their own self-advocacy by opening up new areas of communication between themselves and their families and professionals (Daley and Weisner 2003, 45).

Self-advocacy is possible in multiple formats, including for example, social media, which can be used for both advocacy and self-advocacy; the anecdotal evidence on terminology above was retrieved from individuals using blogs (of varying levels of professionalism) to self-advocate. Sitter and Curnew describe three ways non-profits can use social media as a communication tool in advocacy work: 1) to gather and share information about events, 2) to interact with stakeholders in ways that lead to the creation of online communities, and finally, 3) in ways that gets followers and stakeholders involved, such as by signing a petition (2016). Miller identifies ways individuals can use social media for personal and self-advocating ways; they initially offer the example of a graduate student who read a blog about disabilities which ultimately allowed her to identify with the label and begin to call herself disabled, when previously she never did (2017). As Miller explains their study: “social media gave students…a chance to explore their identities, and, for some, to cement how they identified or gain new language that prompted a revelation” (2017, 509). Miller explains social media use in the same language as Daley and Weisner (2003), making it apparent that it can be helpful in creating individual explanatory models. Social media is becoming more and more frequent in our lives and thus was bound to affect our advocacy and self-advocacy, as it has begun to do in significant ways (Sitter and Curnew 2016). Social media is useful in self-advocacy especially, because, it allows community-members to easily become agents in their
community (Sitter and Curnew 2016). Alongside this, it allows users to create impressions of themselves online that may vary from how they view themselves or how others view them; this means “social media activity may serve an increasingly central purpose in understanding one’s sense of self and construction and management of various social identities” (Miller 2017, 510). Social media thus plays more than one role in self-advocacy, it is a relatively accessible way to become an agent, as the barriers for entry are low, and it allows one to better understand and create social and personal identities, and explanatory models. According to Sitter and Curnew, citing Megele, social media is also a multilogue as it allows for advocacy efforts in offline and online to intersect in real time and for these advocacy efforts to be received by more than one potential individual (2016). One final benefit to social media is that “unlike face-to-face interactions, social media leaves a digital footprint, which contributes to easy searching and sharing in highly visible ways” (Sitter and Curnew 2016, 273). Social media advocacy is not without its limitations, however. The major limitation is what Sitter and Curnew call “slacktivism” (2016, 273). ‘Slacktivism’ is the idea that passive social media actions such as ‘liking’ or sharing posts is solely symbolic and does not lead to significant real-world change (Sitter and Curnew 2016). These actions can be beneficial, but on their own do not make significant change and thus are most productive when paired with real-world actions when possible (Sitter and Curnew 2016). Despite this, there is a real potential for social media use in advocacy and self-advocacy.

Conclusion

The history of disability rights, before the CRPD is long and did not result in an official UN convention until 2006. Before the CRPD, and to a certain extent still today, the medical model of disability was prevalent, creating harm when those with disabilities were seen as solely individuals for rehabilitation. Authors such as Turner (2006) suggest that by viewing disability as coming from society rather than inherent within individuals we can continue to work past the medical model. Shuttleworth and Kasnitz (2004), as well as many non-academic sources, would suggest that switching to ‘identity first’ language would aid in this area. Official documentation continues to use ‘person first’ language, but it would appear as though those with disabilities, prefer to label themselves as ‘disabled’ rather than ‘with a disability’ and thus, perhaps there is a future where it is not solely those with disabilities who choose to use identity first language. Beyond terminology, it would appear as if the future of disability rights will involve greater unifying of those with various disabilities as accessibility efforts appear to be strengthened when normalized. Varying view points on disability allow for better advocacy and self-advocacy and thus discussions on the varying accessibility efforts allow for this normalization. Thus, academic as well as anecdotal evidence (including via social media) will allow a wider audience to be reached, which can only aid in normalization.

References


SAFE ROAD PROTEST: YOUTHS’ POLITICAL CONSCIOUSNESS AND PROTEST FOR JUSTICE IN EVERYDAY LIFE

Mahfuzar Rahman | University of Manitoba

keywords | youth, protest, participation, social media, political system, corruption, human rights

abstract | The safe road protest challenges the prevalent perception of contemporary youth in Bangladesh that recognizes them as political apathy. This protest reveals two opposite truths of youth politics in Bangladesh; on the one hand, they are frustrated with the existing political systems and bi-partisan politics, and on the other side, they are politically conscious and contributed to important national political, social and economic crisis in multidimensional ways without actively joining any political parties. These unorthodox forms of political participation and youth roles need to be recognized for a better understanding of contemporary youth politics, political ideology, and activism.

Scholars in different disciplines are increasingly interested in youth, youth culture and the political role of youth. Contrary to the prevalent perception that depicts the contemporary youth as political apathy, Anthropologists have highlighted the unorthodox and varied political roles of young people in different countries and societies, that the mainstream politicians and political analysts overlooked or failed to understand. This article is an attempt to contribute and enrich this branch of anthropology that analyzes one of the most significant youth resistance movements in the recent history of Bangladesh, organized and led by the school and college students. The movement, popularly known as the Safe Road Protest, helps us to understand the political thoughts, dimensions and diversity of political activities of young people of Bangladesh.

Although the primary demand of the movement was a safe road at the beginning later, it goes beyond the safe road demand and addresses the deep problems of the democratic system and governance. The youth protesters raise questions on corruption, lack of the rule of law and human rights crisis of the country and demanded justice in everyday life. The political wisdom and thoughtful thinking of the youth surprised the people of Bangladesh. Before the movement youth were considered indifferent about the society, state, politics and politicians, and political scientists were seen to express their frustration on Bangladeshi youth. But the youth did the work that their parents, teachers, civil society, intellectuals, politicians and any political party could not do in the last three decades. This courageous role of the youth is indicating their political awareness which has been developed through their everyday experiences, critical observation of ongoing incidents in family, society and the state and participating in the political discussion on social media. The protesters are conscious and interested about politics, democratic rights, socio-political and national issues, and are willing to play a more significant role in the national political system; simultaneously they are frustrated with existing party politics and political systems and didn’t find enough space for participation. The movement highlighted that the new political ideas and perspectives of the young generation need to be recognized and space for their participation needs to be created to increase youth’s involvement in the mainstream politics and political system.

The primary source of data for this article is the secondary documents, mainly newspaper articles, online articles, books and blogs. As a citizen of Bangladesh, my observation also played an important role. The limitation of this article is the lack of direct observation of the movement and direct interviews of the protesters. I believe interviews of protesters, observers and government representatives published on national and international newspapers help to
overcome the limitations that arise from lacking direct observation and interviews and make a critical analysis of the movement possible.

**Youth Participation in Politics**

Bangladesh has a long and glorious history of student protests and is powered by the idealism of the youth. Young minds have shaped the political narratives of Bangladesh at different point of time. The seed of Bangladesh’s independence was planted through the Language Movement in 1952, which started with the student movement (Simlai 2018). Students played a significant role in the mass upsurge in 1969 that led to the 1971 revolt and formation of Bangladesh (Islam 2018). Students in Bangladesh also played a remarkable role in the democratic movement in the 1990s. After the end of autocratic rule in 1990 and the introduction of a democratic government system, student politics in Bangladesh were surprisingly losing its glorious role (Islam 2018). At this point of time student politics started losing its independent characteristics and became the loyal forces of mainly two major political parties (Awami League and Bangladesh Nationalist Party). Due to the violence of student wings of two major political parties, regulated environment and lack of freedom of speech, general students have gradually lost interest in politics (Bhattacharjee 2018).

Though the youth have an important role in different movements in Bangladesh, the participation of youth at the parliament or policy-making stage is frustrating. The existing political establishment doesn’t encourage youth participation, rather it sometimes discourages them. For many youths, joining the system isn’t easy. The existing party structures don’t allow the youth in the system. The current parliament has only one member (out of 350 members, translating into 0.29%) under 30 years of age, and 19 members (5.71%) under 40 years of age (IPU 2018). Most of these young parliamentarians are the family members of ex-parliamentarians and inherited the political positions. These dynastic parliamentarians are almost exclusively from the upper classes and biased towards defending their vested economic interests.

**Safe Road Protest in Bangladesh**

The safe road movement starts with the tragic death of two students in a road accident in the capital and the following remarks of a Minister regarding the accident. The incident occurred on 29th July, when a speeding bus lost control and mounted a footpath, leaving two dead and many others critically injured (Murshed 2018; Human Rights Watch 2018). Hundreds of students and friends of dead students gathered at the accident place immediately after the accident and demanded the arrest and punishment of the driver and owner of the bus. Students’ anger further fueled by the insensitive remarks of the Minister of Shipping, Mr. Shahjahan Khan on the dead students sparked massive outrage across the country (Rai 2018).

A video clip containing the insensitive remarks of Minister Shahjahan Khan spread on Facebook on the night of the accident, and thousands of students came on the street the next day and blocked major traffic points in the capital. Students presented a nine-point demand to the government with a twenty-four-hour ultimatum, mainly demanding the resignation of the Shipping Minister and government action against those who violated traffic rules and partook in negligent and rash driving and to make the roads safe for its citizens (Roy 2018). On the third day of the incidents the protest spread across the country, and the protesters, mostly students, aged 13 to 19 with school uniforms, took to the streets and literally took total control of the traffic system in the capital for next two days. The protesters checked driving licenses and legal documents and fitness certificates of the vehicles at different points throughout the capital and brought the undisciplined transportation system in an unprecedented discipline structure (Abi-Habib 2018; Rai 2018). The ruling party secretary, Mr. Obaidul Qader requested that the protesters forgive the Shipping Minister for his insensitive remarks; on the same day in another program the Commerce Minister, Mr. Tofayel Ahmed, apologized to the protesters on behalf of the Shipping
Minister but the Shipping Minister refused to resign as per the protesters’ demand (Manik and Abi-Habib 2018; Rubel 2018).

On August 1st, the fourth day of the protest, thousands of university students declared solidarity with school-going protesters and came down to the streets and virtually took control of the capital (Abi-Habib 2018; Rai 2018). Celebrities, teachers, lawyers, and people of different occupations came to the streets to show solidarity with the young protesters. Protesters stopped the Minister of Commerce’s vehicle for breaking the traffic rule. In another incident, the chauffeur of the Minister of Water Resources failed to show driving license, and the Minister had to take another vehicle to go to his office (Manik and Abi-Habib 2018; Rubel 2018). On this day, police attacked the protesters at different places in the capital (Human Rights Watch 2018; Roy 2018; Murshed 2018). The Prime Minister met the leaders of Bangladesh Chatro League (BCL), the student wing of the ruling party, and assigned the responsibility to ‘convince’ the general students and send them back to school. On the same night, the Minister of Education declared all Educational Institutions closed for ‘security purpose.’

On 2 August 2nd, students came down to the streets in uniform after ignoring the Education Minister’s announcement. Several Ministers and high officials of the Police Department accused and warned the oppositions, mainly Bangladesh Nationalist Party and Bangladesh Jammat-E-Islami, for backing the protest to create an unstable environment (Rai 2018; Pokharel, Ahmed, and Wilkinson 2018, The Economist 2018). They warned the protesters to leave the streets and go back to school; otherwise, they will use force to clean the roads. Students were attacked in different places of the country by the government-backed terrorist groups and police before their warning (Human Rights Watch 2018; Roy 2018; Murshed 2018).

Several Civil Society Organizations, and National and International Children and Human Rights organizations condemned the attacks on the students and requested that the government sit on a dialogue with the protesters and peacefully solve the issue. In many places, guardians, teachers came down to the streets to protect peaceful protesters from the terrorist groups and police. The Quota Reform Movement1 expressed solidarity with the Safe Road protesters and called a countrywide strike at educational institutions on 4 August, in protest of the attacks on peaceful protest. On 5 and 6 August, Bangladesh Chatro League (BCL) along with Police and unidentified groups of youth wearing helmets attacked young protesters, the supporters of the protest at different points in the capital and university and school campuses (Roy 2018; Human Rights Watch 2018). At least 20 journalists were reportedly beaten for taking picture and video of the attack on students. The government had slowed down mobile internet across the country to prevent broadcasting live videos and images of the attack on protesters. The local media has imposed self-censorship because of the harsh monitoring of the government agencies and has avoided broadcasting on the attacks on the peaceful, unarmed and defenceless protesters (Murshed 2018).

Bangladeshi security forces launched a massive crackdown on protesters (Roy 2018) to control the protest. Police arrested hundreds of protesters and activists, including Shahidul Alam, world-renowned photographer and Human Rights activist, for supporting the students. Several students were detained by the police for posting, sharing and liking images and videos of the protest (Abi-Habib 2018; Bhattacharjee 2018). The youth protest for safety and security in everyday life has come to an end through attacks, suits and mass arrests of the protesters. Every movement left its impact on society. The safe road movement not only indicates the insecurity and injustice on the road but also in the broader social, political and economic life of Bangladesh, and strongly demonstrates the need to establish justice in everyday life in Bangladesh.

---

1 Bangladesh Quota Reform Movement is an ongoing students’ movement demanding reforms in policies regarding recruitment in the Bangladesh government services.
Why this Protest?

Death on the street in Bangladesh is common, but Bangladesh has not seen such massive students protest before just because of the death on the street (BBC 2018). According to a report of Bangladesh Passengers Welfare Association, 7397 people have been killed in road accidents in 2017 (Simlai 2018). The question is what prompted the students to take to the street? Why this protest gets immense support from every group of people? Was the student protest aimed only at ensuring road safety? Is it an outburst of people’s frustrations against the government? What caused this frustration and its subsequent violent outburst?

The accident and death of two students are not separate and isolate incidents but a regular experience that all people in Bangladesh, including the student, face in their everyday life. The protest is an expression of their daily experience towards the mismanagement of public transportation and transport syndicate that controls the country’s transport system, and eventually to the corruption and bad governance of the state. The movement is a reaction to the establishment.

Dhaka, the capital of Bangladesh, has one of the worse transportation systems in the world contrary to the highest transportation cost among the developing countries. The reasons for this bad transportation system are mismanagement and corruption (Roy 2018; Kashem 2018). A syndicate has controlled the transportation sector in Bangladesh consisting of Ministers, members of parliament, ruling party leaders, pro-government businesspeople and union leaders (Rai 2018). A general perception in Bangladesh is that this syndicate is led by the Minister of Shipping, who is also the President of the Bangladesh Transport Workers Federation. The overarching influence of this syndicate has paralyzed regulatory bodies, protected the interests of transport workers and owners, and prevented the implementation of existing laws. The government put a hold on the long-awaited and expected the Strategic Transport Plan (STP) due to the immense pressure of this syndicate. The protesting youth are specifically blaming the government for the anarchy of the road and transport system of Bangladesh since it gives priority to the interest of a specific group rather than the peoples’ interest.

A Chilling Atmosphere for Free Speech

It will be a mistake if we think this youth movement took place only for the safe roads. As time passes on it becomes clear that this movement is the outburst of the youth towards the controlled democratic governance system, injustice in everyday life, and the government’s efforts controlling the freedom of speech which becomes clear through the slogans, banners, and festoons of the movement (Kibria 2018). It is necessary to analyze a movement by its social, political and historical context. Contextual analyses of the safe road protest help us to understand the answers of the questions mention at the beginning of this section.

In Bangladesh, there is a scary environment now where the people of the opposition parties, as well as general people, are always in a threat of attacks, suits, disappearances and extrajudicial killings (Human Rights Watch 2018). The question of the legitimacy of the government, the opposition party’s demand for reelection has made the government offensive. The government denounces any alternative views as an attack on the state and suppresses them in different ways. The current Awami League government develops and applies several draconian laws and policies, for example, ICT act2, to silence opponents and critics in the name of public security (Human Rights Watch 2018; Bhattcharjee 2018). The general perception from the people is that the increasing crackdown on free expression is an attempt to limit speech and criticism of the government. The government has arrested thousands of political opponents including the head of the major political party opponent, journalists, teachers, students, housewives, farmers, and businessmen for expressing their political view and criticizing the government, ruling party’s political leaders, and others on Facebook, as well as in the blogs, print and online

---

2 The vague and overly broad law has been used repeatedly over the years to stifle criticism.
newspapers, or other social media (Human Rights Watch 2018). The government targets not only political opponents, but also journalists, teachers, students, internet commentators, and broadcasters. Television networks, already under government pressure (Murshed 2018). Bangladesh authorities have detained dozens of people across the country for criticizing the government on the social media over its violent crackdown on peaceful protesters.

Several Bangladeshi citizens have been arrested for criticizing the prime minister’s roles, her foreign policy, or the actions of her cabinet colleagues and ruling party leaders. For example, Monirul Islam, a rubber plantation worker, was arrested for liking and sharing a Facebook post criticizing the ongoing official visit of the prime minister to India; several journalists and editors have been arrested for online articles criticizing corruption, maladministration, or particular individuals (Human Rights Watch 2018). Nusrat Jahan Sonia, a primary school teacher in a rural area of Patuakhali district, who was seven months pregnant, was arrested and suspended from her job for “spreading rumours” regarding the student protest over road safety on Facebook (The Daily Star 2018). Maidul Islam, a university teacher, has been arrested under section 57 for making “defamatory” remarks against the prime minister on social media. Shahidul Alam, a world-renowned photographer, was detained for criticizing government crackdown on student protesters and journalists covering the protest.

Secret detentions and enforced disappearances have become a terrifying prospect for Bangladeshis. A common perception is that any criticism or political affiliation with the opposition party can lead to the disappearance. This perception has spread since the general election in January 2014. Four hundred thirty-two people have disappeared since 2009, and the family members, relatives of the disappeared people, complained that they were abducted by the Rapid Action Battalion, Detective Branch and Police in the civil dress (Daily Odhikar News 2018). The list of disappeared persons included not only opponent political leaders, but also ex-diplomats, university teachers, lawyers, human rights activists, student leaders, public representatives among others. In some cases, the police refuse to take the general diary of the disappeared person. Over 80 cases of secret detentions and enforced disappearances were reported in 2017 (Ain O Salish Kendra 2018; The Daily Star 2018).

More than 100 people were killed, of which the majority were youth, during the “war on drugs” campaign in early May 2018 (Ganguly 2018). The timing of the campaign raises a question about the goals of it; it took place just before the mayoral elections of the major cities. The opposition party accused the government of using the campaign to threaten the opposition, critics, and different minded people. The killing of Akramul Haque, a counsellor of Teknaf municipality, has led to widespread public outrage. His family has released an audio recording of phone conversations, including one in which he was crying and informing his fourteen-year-old daughter that the RAB officials will not let him go back home. In another recording, he was telling the RAB officials that he has no relations with the drugs and instead always protest drug business in his area, he requested them to check his records, then sound a gunshot that killed him.

These incidents created extreme dissatisfaction among people. Due to the growing self-censorship of print and electronic media and restrictions of the state, social media, mainly Facebook, became the alternative medium of freedom of expression. Bangladesh has achieved remarkable development in information technology and social media. Dhaka has been ranked second in terms of having the most active Facebook users in the world, of which most of the users are young (Dhaka Tribune, 2017). The use of social media creates the opportunity for young people to express their opinions on important social, political and state issues which significantly contributed to raising their political awareness. Youth’s activism in the safe road protest and their well-thought-out opinion on important state issues exposes youths’ political awareness (Rabee 2018). This youth protest is an expression of their dissatisfaction with the state and political system of Bangladesh although it was triggered by the tragic death of two
students and subsequent reaction of their school friends (Kibria 2018). The youth have not demanded anything for their interests or their personal development; rather they demand justice in state and society. They demand security of life, freedom of speech and civil rights, as well as raise questions about the legitimacy of government, abduction and extrajudicial killing, corruptions and growing inequality in the society.

**Challenging the State Power and Political Establishment**

The safe road protesters challenged the state's power structure and political establishment through raising questions about corruptions, lack of good governance and absence of justice in everyday life. Protesters highlighted the syndication, irregularities, and corruption on the road and transport system as well as demonstrated the desired behaviour and government's actions (Roy 2018; Rai 2018; Kashem 2018). The protesters didn't confine them into chanting slogans and demands but also executed it and showed the country how to make the road safe (Riaz 2018). These young protesters changed the general perception of youth in Bangladesh. No one could think that before the protest these youth could do such a unique protest that expresses the feelings of every Bangladeshi at this point (Islam 2018). Their slogans and statements, and activities showed the rottenness of the state, and the way to overcome it, that the politicians and elderly failed to do in the last twelve years.

From the second day of the protest, the protesters took full control of the traffic system of the capital, Dhaka, and were able to bring the chaotic transport system to discipline. Protesters set-up check posts at all crucial places in the capital to check vehicle papers and driver’s licenses to bring discipline to the road (Rai 2018). The young protesters stopped ministers, members of parliaments, justice, high officials of police and armed forces, ruling party leaders, businesspeople, journalist and many others for not following the rules and lacking legal papers for their vehicles (Manik and Abi-Habib 2018). These incidents and everyday experiences of the protesters make them fell that the Bangladesh state is lacking justice, the rule of law and accountability (Wasif 2018). From their experience they realized that law is not equal for everyone in Bangladesh, there is a group who are above the law. These young protesters, in their early teens, astonished Bangladesh by demanding and taking the responsibility to fix the state. They give the message that if the adults fail to perform their duty to fix the state, then the young generation is ready to do so, which started with bringing discipline and establishing the rule of law on the streets.

One of the most spoken slogans of this movement was “Do you have the license?” (Raihan 2018). The young protesters not only checked the driving licenses on the streets but also called the whole country to check government licenses. The protesters raise the question of the legitimacy of the government. The current *Awami League*-led government is the first government in the history of Bangladesh in power for two terms in a row since 2009. This government reelected in 2014 in an opposition less election where 154 members of parliament (out of 300) elected uncontested (Bhattarcharjee 2018). The oppositions boycotted the election demanding caretaker government during the election period to create a level playing field for all political parties. Before the election, the *Awami League* government said to the nation that they are bound to do the election to uphold the constitution, but they will arrange another election within six months under an interim government. Once the government was reelected, they forgot their promise and used executive and judiciary power, police and political goons to silent the protest of opposition. That is why this government always suffers from a crisis of credibility.

In the last four years, no one has raised the question of government’s credibility in such a large extent like the students. These young protesters remind the countrymen that the time has come to check the license of the government. They ask the government for its license to govern the country that the opposition political parties, civil society, and media failed to do. These young students remind the nation that the
present government’s license expired in 2014 and just like the expired driving license this government doesn’t have any authority to rule the country anymore. By raising the question of the legitimacy of the government, the youths indicate the crisis of democracy and violations of civil and human rights of the present Bangladesh state. These young people have realized from their everyday experiences that a terrible regulated system is expanding in Bangladesh, and students, teachers, intellectuals, farmers, labourers, no one is exempt from this controlled system.

**Challenging the Hegemony of Development**

The Awami League-led government always brings its development activities, mainly mega infrastructural projects, to the front to hide its credibility and constitutional crisis, lack of good governance and human rights violation issues. A narrative has become dominant in Bangladesh since 2014 that sometimes you need to compromise on democracy for the sake of development and give the example of the rule of Mahathir Bin Mohamad of Malaysia and Lee Kuan Yew of Singapore. This narrative becomes popular amongst the government, ruling party supporters and pro-government journalists and intellectuals. The safe road protesters raise questions on the government’s development perspective and challenge its development hegemony.

In the last two terms of the Awami League-led government, Bangladesh has achieved tremendous success in Information and Technology (IT) sector (Human Rights Watch 2018). The government has branding digital Bangladesh to attract the young generation. As young people are the primary beneficiaries of this development in the IT sector, naturally they are happy with the success of the government. But the government faces resistance to these youths when the government uses its success story to hide their repression, human rights violations and democratic crisis, and legitimize their activities. The safe road protest is a manifestation of this resistance. The protesters want development, but not with the cost of democracy, justice, freedom of expression, security, and human rights.

One part of the youth protesters raises questions about the increase in discrimination in the society, the rationality and cost of some ongoing development projects, and the corruption in the development projects. For example, the construction cost per kilometer of road is between $2.5 m and $11.9 m, which is the highest in the world (Roy 2018). Contrary to the highest amount of construction cost, Bangladesh has the second-worst roads in Asia (Roy 2018). Moreover, the average transportation cost in Bangladesh is the highest in South Asia. The general perception of pupils is that the infrastructure-centric development efforts of the government are serving the interest of a specific group, and are not for increasing the living standard of general people (Riaz 2018).

Recent statistics from Bangladesh are supporting the ideas of young people. Bangladesh has topped the list of countries in terms of an increase in the number of ultra-high-net-worth (UHNW) individuals. With a 17.2 percent increase between 2012 and 2017 Bangladesh left behind China, Vietnam, Kenya and other counties in the list (Daily Bonik Barta 2018).

The youth protest again indicates that people do not want developments that do not address their real needs or with the cost of rights. They give a clear message to the state that their life is far more important than the ‘development.’ They do not want the state to abduct their rights for ‘development’; rather they want to establish people’s authority over the state. The young generation of Bangladesh loudly told the government that a safer Bangladesh is more important than a digital Bangladesh.

**Are the Protesters Welcomed?**

One of the beauties of this protest is people’s responses to the protest. It was the most welcome
protest in the history of Bangladesh (Awal 2018). People of every section in the society accepted students’ authority on the streets and extended their support. Guardians, senior students, teachers, journalists, lawyers, celebrities and so on came to the streets in their favour. Many brought food and water for the protesters. During the protest people positively accepted the authority of young protesters and showed their license, vehicle papers when stopped by the protesters. They established emergency lanes on the streets, strictly followed the signals, none got spared, which was unthinkable in Dhaka before the protest. The protesters executed the rule of law on roads; they show the country that no one is above the law.

"I brought my daughter here as I believe we all should join the protest; it is for a right cause," said mother of protesters, who accompanied her daughter to the protest. (The Daily Star, August 5, 2018)

"I am suffering, of course. But the student protest is logical. Suppose, I’m standing by the road; now what if a bus runs over me?" a senior citizen came to the capital for medical treatment. (The Daily Star, August 3, 2018)

The safe road movement of young students exceeds the geographical boundaries of Bangladesh. Bangladeshi and Bengali communities all over the world came in support of the safe road protesters and building pressure on the Bangladesh government. The largest gathering and protest in favour of the safe road movement are seen in Kolkata, an eastern city of the neighbouring country India. Students in Kolkata, India came to the street and march to Bangladesh High Commission in Kolkata in support of the young protesters of Bangladesh.

In contrast to the welcome and cooperation of the general public, these protesters were subjected to suppression, oppression, and torture of the government (Pokharel, Ahmed, and Wilkinson 2018; Human Rights Watch 2018). Like the other movements, the government tried to find political affiliation with the protest since the beginning of it (Riaz 2018). The government labelled previous movements as anti-state activities by linking them with opposition parties. The government gives an impression that political affiliation is itself a crime. Political affiliation with a political party other than the ruling party is anti-state. The protest was spontaneous and leaderless, and become more conscious of avoiding any affiliation with any political party after government accusation of the political affiliation of this protest. "We have no political affiliation, and we are not protesting for any political purpose. We just want justice", was said by a grade twelve students and safe road protesters in response to government accusation of the political affiliation of the protesters (The Daily Star 2018). The learning of previous movements, especially the quota report movement4 which was also a student movement, that affiliation with any political party or ideology other than the ruling party can allow the government to label as anti-state and suppressed it. All political parties except the ruling party declared solidarity with the protest but consciously keep a distance from it. The present Bangladesh government wants a political apathy young generation who will not oppose any of the government’s policy and projects and will welcome all government initiatives. This protest shows that youth in Bangladesh, contrary to the post-industrialist state, are very conscious about their political rights and want to participate and contribute to the state, though they are dissatisfied with the contemporary political parties.

**Conclusion**

The young protesters set a new definition of Bangladesh. For them, Bangladesh is the synonym of

---

4 Early in 2018, until July, there have been ongoing demonstrations by newly graduated students and unemployed youth demanding reform of the quota system for government jobs (Roy, 2018)
protest. They reminded the people that Bangladesh got independence through a massive mass protest, started by the students following a nine-month long liberation war, got back the democracy in the 1990s after a decade long autocratic regime through movements. The people of Bangladesh, especially the students always stand against injustice, authoritarian rule. Bangladesh and Bangladeshi youth are never afraid of repression rather they always stand against and protest them. This protest gives new hope to the elders, democratic movement, and the people who are fighting for the freedom of expression. They provide a clear message to the elders, politicians and the whole country that if you are afraid of repression if you surrender yourself to injustice, then you are not Bangladesh. Now it is your decision whether you want to be Bangladesh or not. These young protesters invited everyone to participate in this protest, and they will not stop whether anyone joins with them or not.

Contrary to optimism, the new democratic system and the political establishment then created obstacles in the participation of youth in politics outside the ruling party. Violence and repression of opposing ideology, thinking and practices in educational institutions and society make youths politically discouraged. In this hostile environment, youth have seen active and courageous participation in different issues over the last three decades. The involvement of youth in the safe road movement, its previous anti-quota movements and several other students and mass movements in the previous three decades indicate two different aspects. Firstly, young people in Bangladesh are dissatisfied with existing bipartisan politics and the existing political system and are unwilling to participate in the current party politics. Secondly, these youth are politically conscious which has been demonstrated through their significant role in different social and state issues. These young people are ready to play a vital role in politics, but it requires the recognition of the political role of young people and the reform of the existing political system.

References


Human Rights Watch. 2018. “Bangladesh: Suspend Deadly ‘War on Drugs’, Large Number of Deaths Creates Fear of Duterte Model.” A


THE CULTURE OF IMPUNITY IN POST-WAR GUATEMALA

Adriana Nelsen-Gross | University of Manitoba

**keywords** | Guatemala, impunity, femicide, feminicide, Latin America, corruption

**abstract** | This paper examines the culture of impunity in Guatemala by looking at specific historical aspects of the region, two case examples of varying and prevailing types of impunity, the actors involved in strengthening the justice system, impunity’s infringement of human rights, and the role anthropology has to play in it all. This paper is written through an anthropological and human rights lens.

To begin, a brief yet crucial look will be had at the 36-year armed conflict as it created the backdrop for the workings of Guatemala today. After the history of the situation has been introduced, two key types of cases will be discussed as exemplifications of the role impunity plays. A discussion will then follow on how human rights, as they are described by the UN declaration, are being violated within the case examples and within Guatemala as a whole. To gain a full understanding of the current situation, I will overview several of the key players in the fight against impunity and conclude with the role the field of anthropology has in this fight.

36 Years of Violence: A Brief History of the Guatemalan Armed Conflict

To understand modern day Guatemala, and its culture of impunity, it is crucial to comprehend the impact of the armed conflict. The history of violence was so catastrophic that all topics dealing with life in Guatemala today, must first start with the armed conflict. The conflict is inseparable from Guatemala as a country. The history of the armed conflict, as it pertains to the creation of impunity, began with the overthrow of dictator Jorge Ubico in 1944. There was peace in Guatemala for 10 years during the democratically elected government that followed, but during this peace the military was evolving. The military built itself up as an entity separate from the government, and it created a system of checks and balances to prevent another dictatorship such as Ubico’s (Shirmer 2000, 10). The president’s during this time of peace had a
communist hue to their policies, especially in regard to land reform. So, as the army grew and became an increasingly complex structure, the United States became progressively threatened by the land reform measures that took land away from the United Fruit Company. All of this led the US funded military coup of 1954, which ended the ‘ten years of spring’, and Guatemala would not see ‘spring’ again for over 36 years (Shirmer 2000, 10).

The involvement of the United States in Guatemalan politics can be seen mirrored throughout Central and South America with relatively similar themes. This US involvement can date back to the Monroe doctrine of 1823, and the decline of Spanish authority in Latin America. The Monroe Doctrine was a means to guarantee mercantile freedom for the United States in Latin America as it eliminated the threat of the strict trade laws associated with the Spanish Empire from returning. From this point the United States became increasingly more involved in the region on varying claims of liberation, which evolved into claims of stabilization and then into a fight against communism in the mid-20th century. The United states had growing tropical-fruit plantation investments beginning in the mid-19th century, which flourished in the early-20th century as several companies consolidated to form the United Fruit Company (Shirmer 2000). In regard to Guatemala, it was their investments in the United Fruit Company that put the United States on the defensive as the progressive land reform of the late 1940's threatened to return the stolen plantation land to the indigenous population it had originally belonged to. This threat drove the US to incite the coup d'état in 1954. The United States was so invested in the monetary gains to be had from the United Fruit Company that they personally trained military generals within the US and had military training camps set up within Guatemala to ensure the continued support of the Military Government after the coup (Shirmer 2000).

Violence ensued immediately after the first military government took control in 1954. As a succession of coups followed, keeping conservative military dictators in power, rebel groups began to form in resistance to the increasingly oppressive leadership (Shirmer 2000, 11). The rebel groups grew and gained support from the rural, indigenous, and agricultural population who bore the brunt of the new oppressive legislation. The government started a counterinsurgency effort to try and control the rebel actions. As the rebel cause grew, so did the counterinsurgency. Violence became a norm in Guatemala as disappearances evolved into massacres (Shirmer 2000, 12). With the military coup of 1982, and the instillation of Efrain Rios Montt as president, massacres of the indigenous communities turned into unmistakable genocide with the ‘scorched earth’ counterinsurgency. Montt was only dictator for 17 months before another coup occurred to lead the way towards transitional democracy. Montt stayed in politics, however, for over a decade after his presidency. The armed conflict officially ended with the signing of peace accords in 1996 (Shirmer 2000, 14).

This brief history of the Guatemalan armed conflict pertains to the culture of impunity as it was during the rise of the military government that the extreme levels of power were achieved and used to create the culture of impunity. From the possession of complete authority over all happenings in the government, and after decades of atrocities occurring without recompense, a system was created which granted the army immunity for all crimes committed. To this day, much of that immunity holds, and the justice system has yet to break the complacency entrenched by decades of military regimes.

**Impunity in Favor of Jose Efrain Rios Montt**

The story of ex-president Rios Montt is littered with many illustrations of impunity dating as far back as 19 years. This relentless nature is one of the most frustrating yet powerful parts of impunity. It was during the 17-month regime of Rios Montt where the massacres transformed into genocide. The Truth Commission of Guatemala (CEH), established in 1994 as part of the peace accords, investigated and recorded what had occurred during the 36-year armed conflict (CEH 1999, 11). As part of its 1999 publication, the Guatemalan CEH concluded in article 122 “that agents
of the State of Guatemala, within the framework of counterinsurgency operations carried out between 1981 and 1983, committed acts of genocide against groups of Mayan” (CEH 1999, 41). After this publication, the Guatemalan people, led by indigenous and human rights activist Rigoberta Menchu, brought their case of genocide to the Public Ministry. In the year 1999 the genocide case was initiated, and from there it takes a very long and twisted 13-year journey which ends in an overturned verdict.

The 2011 documentary, Granito: How to Nail a Dictator, directed by Pamela Yates, discusses the extreme difficulties encountered in the process of proving genocide, and the actors behind it, in the court of law. The Spanish National Court, who claims universal jurisdiction for its territory along with all international crimes which come under the qualifications of the Spanish court, took the case presented by Rigoberta Menchu (Kinoy et al. 2011, 20-12). The process in Spain began in 1999 with documenting witnesses and obtaining crucial governmental documents. But as Yates states in her documentary, “when you fight impunity, impunity fights back” (Kinoy et al. 2011, 48-36). The Spanish Court had enough evidence to procure an arrest warrant for Rios Montt, but even 20 years after his dictatorship Rios Montt maintained enough power to prevent his arrest. The Guatemalan Constitutional court blocked the Spanish arrest warrant in 2007 (Ross 2016, 10). Three years later, however, the Guatemalan Attorney General’s office finally opened their own investigation and with the appointment of a new attorney general in 2011, and the initiation of international commissions such as the CICIG, the justice system was finally in a place to take on the genocide case (Human Rights Watch 2017, 32).

The Guatemalan Court Case against Rios Montt began after he was arrested for counts of genocide and war crimes within the state of Guatemala in 2012. A Human Rights Watch Report published in 2017 describes the ways the genocide case was, and continues to be, deliberately derailed by varying tactics of impunity. The two tactics of impunity described in the report as most commonly used are the petitions of amparo and recusal. The amparo petition is used when a person on trial feels as if their right to life, liberty and security has been threatened by an unlawful act of a public official, and the recusal petition is defined as “a request to have a judge removed from a case due to bias, a conflict of interest” (Humans Rights Watch 2017, 13). These constitutionally imbedded petitions are meant to serve as last resort protections of due process, but in reality they are being unjustly used by defense lawyers to manipulate the justice system. The Human Rights Watch report continues on to “describe how defense attorneys are able to exploit the slow and hesitant manner in which many courts treat amparo and recusal petitions to secure unreasonably long delays in proceedings” (Human Rights Watch 2017, 3). Both of these tactics, along with others, exemplify the entrenched system of impunity, and are relentlessly seen in the genocide case against Rios Montt.

The 2013 trial began with manipulation and tactics of impunity, but for once the justice system appeared to prevail. The trial came to an end on May 10th, 2013, with banners around the city reading “si, hubo genocidio”; yes, there was genocide (Stuesse et al. 2008, 1). The guilty verdict against Rios Montt was a monumental court decision for many reasons; first, 30 years after the genocide and 13 years after the fight for justice had begun, the survivors of the massacres were able to see retribution, second, for Guatemala as a nation this was a tremendous step forward in the fight against impunity, and third, at an international scale, this court decision made Guatemala the first country in the world to convict its own former head of state for genocide and crimes against humanity (Stuesse et al. 2008, 1).

Unfortunately, the story of Jose Efrain Rios Montt does not end there. A mere 10 days after the court convicted Rios Montt guilty for the act of genocide, the Constitutional Court effectively annulled the verdict on false procedural claims. Since then, the trial has been interminably delayed for four years (Human Rights Watch 2017, 33). The trial resumed in 2015, with the defense claiming that Rios Montt’s mental health was unfit for trial. The court ruled two months later, after a
psychiatric evaluation, that the trial would continue but
due to his declining mental health, Rios Montt was
unsuited for a regular trial and special proceedings
would be put in place. These special proceedings
included that the court would not decide about his guilt
nor apply a prison sentence, but only determine if his
condition warrants the immediate measures of
psychiatric internment. Nothing but delays have
occurred since. As of today, Rios Montt remains under
house arrest with all hope of justice depleted. (Human
Rights Watch 2017, 36) Blatant impunity such as this is
what makes people such as Pamala Yates, ask in her
documentary: “is justice an unattainable dream?” (Kinoy

Daily Impunity in Regard to Feminicide
Impunity does not, by any means, exclusively
occur in high profile cases of grand genocide or crimes
against humanity, but it is a lived-experience in the daily
lives of Guatemalans. Women especially are faced with a
violent reality, as female homicides have risen
tremendously; from the years 2001-2006 the female
homicide rate increased by more than 117% (Sanford
2008, 108). Femicide is a term which refers to the
murder of women in criminology literature, but in the
case of Guatemala a more serious term is needed.
Feminicide is more appropriate to Guatemala, in the
sense that it is a political term which holds responsible
not only the male perpetrator but also the state and
judicial structures that normalize misogyny (Sanford
2008, 112). Sanford describes why she chooses to use
feminicide to discuss the killing of women in
Guatemala: “Feminicide connotes not only the murder
of women by men because they are women but also
indicates state responsibility for these murders whether
through the commission of the actual killing, toleration
of the perpetrators' acts of violence, or omission of state
responsibility to ensure the safety of its female
citizens” (Sanford 2008, 113).

Sanford illustrates a framework for
understanding feminicide in Guatemala; systemic
sexism. This systemic sexism is more than misogyny as it
is understood in the West, the misogyny is systemic not
only in the sense that it exists within state institutions,
but in the further sense that it is systemic at the social
level too. This systemic sexism is commonly referred to
as the ‘culture of machismo’, and as exemplified
through Sanford, machismo plays a fundamental role in
understanding feminicide in Guatemala. A prime
example of this is the special national-prosecutor for
charges against women who is quoted saying that “there
is no specific cause for violence against women because
all violence in Guatemala has increased” (Sanford 2008,
117). In the eyes of the prosecutor responsible with
resolving the murders of women, the rise in female
killings is only incidental to the general increase. Even
the National Civil Police are at fault, as they often look
for any sign on female victims that would place her
within gang violence, drug trafficking, or prostitution.
That is, any tattoo, piercing, or clothing deemed too
revealing is used to divert the blame away from
misogyny towards the woman herself. This diversion
of blame can be seen as well from the classifications for
female victims used by the National Civil Police. The fact
that ‘passionate problems’ has its own category, yet
domestic violence leading to a murder is combined with
two more causes in an ‘other’ category, explains
perfectly well the state of female blame, and the
immunity granted to men when they commit crimes
(Sanford 2008, 117). Impunity takes a different form
with feminicide. As the genocide case has been stuck in
the legal crosshairs of impunity for over a decade, the
high majority of feminicide cases do not even make it
past the front desk of the local police station.

Impunity and the Violation of Human Rights
From reviewing the history of the armed
conflict, to viewing the ways in which impunity functions
in varying, yet equally destructive ways within
Guatemala, it is important to include a discourse on how
human rights are directly affected by the culture of
impunity. The 1948 Universal Declaration of Human
Rights adopted by the United Nations, and hence
Guatemala as a signing member, is violated by the acts
of impunity on multiple levels. How impunity has
previously been defined, explained, and exemplified in
this paper is directly infringing on articles 7, and 10 of the UN declaration of Human Rights. Article 7 states that “all are equal before the law and are entitled without any discrimination to equal protection of the law...” (my italics; United Nations 1948). Impunity and equality cannot coexist within the same justice system. Impunity implies the legal immunity of some, and the legal exclusion of others. In the case of Rios Montt, there exists a legal immunity which has prevented the restitution of his crimes for over 30 years, whereas in the cases of feminicide, impunity works to exclude these cases from even reaching the justice system. Impunity also directly violates Article 10 of the Human Rights Declaration: “Everyone is entitled in full equity to a fair and public hearing by an independent and impartial tribunal...” (United Nations 1948). The same idea of immunity versus exclusion applies to Article 10; the cases of feminicide are denied the right to a full and fair investigation and trial for justice, while the cases of high profile individuals such as Rios Montt are not denied a hearing but the hearings are certainly not fair nor impartial.

There are other human rights that are violated by the acts which impunity allows to occur without consequence. Article 3 encompasses this idea best: “everyone has the right to life, liberty, and security as a person” (United Nations 1948). The right to life, as obvious as this may sound to some, was denied to over 200,000 Guatemalans during the 36-year armed conflict, and to over 4,500 Guatemalans just within the last year (CEH 1999, 3; OSAC 2017). With impunity standing in the way of Rios Montt paying for his crime of genocide, 1,771 Mayans were denied the human right to life under orders of Rios Montt between 1982 and 1983, and today they are denied justice under the court of law. As Victoria Sanford stated in 2003, “only prosecution can be an ‘appropriate acknowledgement of the past’” (Sanford 2003, 12).

**The Reforming of the Guatemalan Justice System, and the Actors Involved**

The process of combating impunity is one that requires participation from both outside and inside the country in question. There are several UN-founded and supported commissions who have been fundamental in strengthening the Guatemalan Justice System. The UN is not the only warrior in this battle for justice, other institutions and individuals both in, and outside of the country have had imperative roles to play as well.

**Commission for Historical Clarification (CEH)**

The CEH was established in 1994 through the Accord of Oslo as an independent truth commission with the order to “clarify with objectivity, equity and impartiality, the human rights violations and acts of violence connected with the armed confrontation” (CEH 1999, 11). The commission was not created to judge nor function as a court of law, but to clarify and record the history of violent events. The CEH was paramount in the transition period directly following 36 years of violence and oppression. During its research, the CEH received thousands of testimonies, oversaw many exhumations of mass graves, recorded accounts of former heads of State, high Army commanders, and the guerrillas, and read thousands of documents (CEH 1999, 12). The overall purpose of the CEH was to uncover the truth of the armed conflict and to make that truth public. In other words, the CEH accomplished the monumental task of recognizing the issues within Guatemala; a battle cannot be fought or won, without knowing what the enemy is and where its situated. The CEH named impunity specifically as an issue, 82 times within their 1999 report. As has been stated before, and which will now be stated again due to the importance of its acknowledgement; the reality of Guatemala as a country, and its culture of impunity included, are so interconnected to the violent past that the two cannot be separated, and this is where the importance of the work of the CEH comes into the play in the fight against impunity.
The International Commission Against Impunity in Guatemala (CICIG)

CICIG was established in 2006 as an independent and international body designed to support the Public Prosecutor’s Office, the National Civil Police, and other State institutions in the investigation and prosecution of crimes committed by domestic illegal security structures and to ultimately aid in their dismantlement (Hudson and Taylor 2010, 54). In short, their task is to assist and strengthen Guatemalan institutions against impunity. Its multi-focus aim on promoting individual prosecution, along with reforming institutions and building local capacity, increases the possibility that its work as a commission will make lasting effects in Guatemala. As is an issue with the UN itself, CICIG lacks enforcement mechanisms or prosecutorial powers to ensure its mandates are followed, but that is the key importance of a hybrid system. Building the capacities of local institutions is how real change is made. The effects of CICIG can be seen through its work with the Attorney General, as progress has been made in the initiation of trials against high-profile, and powerful political figures. Along with its prosecution work, CICIG’s success in advancing institutional reform and capacity building will likely be the most permanent impact it has within Guatemala and its fight against impunity (Hudson and Taylor 2010, 68). The CICIG’s mandate will expire in September 2019, and there exists a threat that once they leave, all of the foundations they have constructed within the judicial system will crumble. The current Attorney General, with whom has been working side by side with the CICIG to make headway in the fight against impunity, ended her elected term this last year (May 2018). With the end of these momentous figures, it will be crucial to see if the Guatemalan Justice System maintains the current momentum against impunity on their own (Human Rights Watch 2017, 11).

The Church: Office of Human Rights of the Archbishop of Guatemala (ODHAG)

The role of the Catholic Church in Guatemala has been one of support and representation. The Church was fundamental in the armed conflict in speaking up for the atrocities being committed and using faith as a way to give strength to the oppressed. The Church’s support of the Mayan movements has been crucial in their growth and success in speaking up for their collective rights. The Peace Accords were signed under the National Commission of Reconciliation (CNR), of which a local priest was placed as president. As David Caballero Mariscal states in his 2012 article; “the mark of the church in the consolidation of the character and community nature of the indigenous people, their awareness as a people, and the consent of the Mayan movement cannot be ignored” (my translation; Caballero 2012, 42). The ODHAG was created in the 1990s in response to the successive violations of human rights within the country, and to this day they continue to release reports on the clarifications of truth, and have found ways to continue the fight towards justice (Caballero 2012, 46).

Rigoberta Menchu

Commissions, and institutions can all aid in the fight against impunity, but so can a single person. Rigoberta Menchu was mentioned above as the human rights activist who first brought the genocide case to the Spanish Court, but Rigoberta has done so much more than that for Guatemala. Rigoberta Menchu has become the voice for the oppressed Guatemalans; traveling the world and sharing the story of her country, and her people. Anthropologist Elizabeth Burgos discovered the powerful voice of Rigoberta in authoring the book ‘My Name is Rigoberta Menchu and this is how my Conscience was Born’. The above-mentioned film-maker, Pamala Yates, saw what Burgos saw in Rigoberta Menchu and used that powerful voice and her incredible ability to tell the story of Guatemala. In Yate’s first documentary, When the Mountains Tremble, was fundamental towards the world seeing what was happening in Guatemala, and it was seen through the
eyes of Rigoberta. This was just the beginning of her activist work. She was the first indigenous woman to be awarded the Nobel Peace Prize for her peace and activist work in 1992. She continues to break the silence of impunity and corruption to this day (Kinoy et al. 2011, 15-50).

**Anthropology’s Role in Fighting Impunity**

The anthropologist has taken many forms within the fight against impunity: the advocate, the observer, the documenter, and the reporter. Anthropology holds its role in the creation, and maintenance of transparency. Transparency is crucial for accountability. Anthropology holds this role both in the field and in the office. As Ellen Messer points out, “as anthropologists, we continue to point out the discrepancies between human rights rhetoric and ratifications and human rights abuses. We provide evidence and approach the root causes of ongoing human rights abuses in political, economic, and sociocultural terms…” (Messer 2009, 128). In terms of human rights and impunity, anthropology serves as a watchful eye, ready to make transparent any violations.

Throughout every stage in the life of impunity, beginning in the armed conflict, anthropologists have stood guard. Myrna Mack, a Guatemalan Anthropologist, began her work in 1982 documenting the experiences of the population displaced by the military’s scorched-earth procedures. Myrna described how she viewed her role as an anthropologist in the field; “It’s all very complex, and it makes me realize that no matter what side you’re on in all this, people, especially the people in this region, have an overwhelming need to speak, to tell about their lives, to confide in a sympathetic listener” (Oglesby 1995, 159). Myrna’s role as listener, documenter, and advocate of the truths she heard ended with her assassination by orders of an army official in 1990 (Oglesby 1995, 14).

During the transitional years after the conflict, anthropologists from all corners of the field collaborated with each other, and the CEH in the search for truth. Physical evidence was collected through the exhumation of mass graves by forensic, physical, and archeological anthropologists, and documentary evidence was collected through the listening and documenting of stories of survivors by ethnographers and cultural anthropologist (Strauss et al. 2013, 3). Along with providing evidence to build the foundation for the fight against impunity, the acts of anthropologists also aided in the healing and transitional process for the survivors of the conflict and Guatemala as a country (French 2005, 2).

In 2013, the American Anthropologist interviewed the anthropologists involved in the trial against Rios Montt. When asked the question of how anthropology uniquely contributes in documenting human rights, Beatriz Manz responded that “[anthropology] is a discipline that allows us to interview, document, record, reflect, analyze, and above all, observe deeply through participation…but with that deep immersion comes deep responsibility…we should also be willing to speak out accurately and forcefully when necessary” (Stuesse et al. 2013, 4). Myrna Mack called this moral obligation to speak out and to inform antropologia comprometida; committed anthropology (Stuesse et al. 2013, 4).

**Conclusion**

Impunity does not only reside in Guatemala, it exists in all corners of the world relentlessly preventing justice. Within the specific context of Guatemala, it has been expressed how crucial the armed conflict was in creating not only the culture of impunity, but in creating the reality of Guatemala today. You cannot have 36 years of violence and oppression and not expect every aspect of a society to be affected. Within the scope of this paper, the culture of impunity is the direct result of the effects of the conflict. With a weak justice system, justice cannot be had for the past or the present, which is in violation to numerous fundamental human rights. The fight against impunity is in full swing this very moment, and the battle has just begun. Efforts from outside actors have set in motion change that has the potential to fundamentally strengthen the Guatemalan justice system and start a domino effect ending in the dismantlement of the culture of impunity. But, in the
end, change needs to come from within. Guatemala has truly demonstrated its tremendous strength as a nation in the transition out of such a dark past, but in order for this transition to continue, for justice to prosper and impunity to fail, that tremendous strength is once again needed.

References


EXPLORING ONLINE INCEL SUBCULTURE

Candice Guild | University of Manitoba

**keywords** | involuntary celibates, incels, subculture, online culture, radicalization, misogyny, neo-birminghamian

**abstract** | Incels (short for involuntary celibates) are a subculture that has formed online. After the Toronto van attack in April 2018, incels became a group of interest to several news organizations in Canada and internationally. After the Toronto van attack and the Isla Vista massacre in 2014, incels became associated with violence and misogyny. When the incel subculture first emerged online it was a significantly more open and positive group. This group has not been researched significantly but what research has been done demonstrates that there has been a dramatic shift within incel subculture towards hatred and violence. More research is greatly needed to understand how members of this group have been radicalized, prevent the spread of misinformation, and develop solutions to some of the issues within incel subculture. The neo-birminghamian conception of subculture may be helpful in future studies of incels.

Incels (short for involuntary celibates) have increasingly been gaining media attention, but not for positive reasons. This group has been connected to at least two significant violent attacks in less than five years (Kassam 2018; Shechter 2018; Taylor 2018; Zimmerman, Ryan, and Duriesmith 2018). With the increased attention this group has been receiving by the media, academics should also be taking interest in this subculture to gain a better understanding of it, prevent the spread of misinformation, and to contribute to the development of solutions to some of the issues within this subculture. This piece will be an exploratory essay that will bring attention to the need for more research on or with this online subculture. This essay will explore what is currently known about incels, and touch on why it is so difficult to study. This essay will be focusing on incels in the United States and Canada. As there is so little research on this particular subculture, this essay will be drawing from several disciplines, news articles, and some of my own observations. This essay will begin by clarifying how the term "subculture" will be used to describe incels, and how this term suits this online group. Following that, this essay will go over in more detail who members of the incel subculture are and how they have changed over time. Looking at what we know about incel subculture and changes within it will highlight the need for more research to better understand how it has changed.

Incels as Subculture

To aid in our understanding of incel subculture, it should be first clarified what the author means by a subculture and how this term fits incels. The definition of subcultures has changed over time, and is hard to pin down (Thornton 1997) so it is important to define how this term is being used to ensure clear communication. In the broadest sense, subcultures are “groups of people that have something in common with each other (i.e. they share a common problem, and interest, a practice) which distinguishes them in a significant way from the members of other social groups” (Thornton 1997, 1). Subcultures are often not connected to a physical area, and its population is not permanent or connected by kinship (Thornton 1997). This is the case with incel subculture as can be observed on their Reddit threads such as r/Braincels. They meet and interact online, meaning that the members of this group could come from across the country, or even the globe, and likely have never met any other members in person.

Members of a subculture are frequently interpreted as deviating from the dominant culture, or as “others” compared to dominant culture (Thornton 1997). Of course, this can lead to complications while studying subcultures as what is considered normal or dominant within a culture is almost impossible to determine due to the significant amount of variation in all cultures (Thornton 1997). For incels, dominant culture is thought of as being highly sex focused, as sex is highly used in
advertising and in media (Donnelly et al. 2001; Shechter 2018), and with the popularity of hookup or dating apps such as Tinder. They deviate from dominant culture as they are celibate not due to religious reason or personal choice, but due to their inability to find willing sexual partners (Burgess, et al. 2001; Donnelly et al. 2001).

Due to the "sub" in the term "subculture," subcultures are sometime thought of as being of lower social standing, or lower in a power hierarchy than the dominant culture (Thornton 1997). Subcultures that are studied usually consist of members from racial or ethnic minority groups, or people of lower social status due to their age or economic status (Thornton 1997). How incels fit in this regard is quite complicated and hard to determine due to changes within the subculture (Kassam 2018; Shechter 2018; Taylor 2018), changes in access to the internet and these forums (Burgess et al. 2001), and the lack of research conducted on this group (Jaki et al. 2018).

**Early Incel Subculture**

As with any online subculture and the online population as a whole, incels have changed significantly over a short period of time (Burgess et al. 2001). The term “incel” is short for involuntary celibate and was coined in the 1990s, so it is not necessarily a new group despite the sudden increase in media attention to it (Kassam 2018; Shechter 2018). At this time, a young woman living in Toronto created a website for people like herself who were having trouble dating, to provide each other with emotional support and motivation to not give up (Kassam 2018; Taylor 2018). She described herself as an involuntary celibate and a late bloomer, and wanted to create a positive online space for people who had a similar struggle (Kassam 2018; Taylor 2018). This website was the beginning of the incel subculture. This subculture flourished online as people could feel safe discussing such a personal problem with people who had similar experiences, while staying anonymous (Burgess et al. 2001).

In 1998, a team of researchers of sociologists from Georgia State University were contacted by a member of an online incel discussion group to inquire about what research had been done on this group so far (Donnelly et al. 2018). It became apparent that there had not been any academic research on this online subculture yet, so this team took on the project and published work on their research with incels in 2001 (Burgess et al. 2001; Donnelly et al. 2001). The researchers joined the online discussion boards briefly to observe and interact with the participants of the research study (Donnelly et al. 2001). An online survey was also created that was available to members of the incel group that contacted the research team and to other groups through search engines (Burgess et al. 2001; Donnelly et al. 2001). The majority of participants in this study were from the United States, but 30% from elsewhere (Western Europe, Australia, or Canada) (Donnelly et al. 2001). This research is now long out of date but should still be discussed to gain an understanding of how this community began, and how it has changed over the years.

For this early research, incels were defined as individuals who had not had sex in at least six months, not by their own choice, but because they had difficulty finding a sexual partner (Burgess et al. 2001; Donnelly et al. 2001), or individuals who defined themselves as incels (Donnelly et al. 2001). This meant that someone could be an incel regardless of their gender, sexuality, age, race, ethnicity, economic class, or relationship status if they had not had sex for an extended period despite their desire to do so (Burgess et al. 2001; Donnelly et al. 2001). Despite this broad definition there were a few trends. The vast majority of participants were heterosexual, male, under 34 years old, had attended or completed college or university, and were part of the middle class (Burgess et al. 2001; Donnelly et al. 2001), but the subculture was accepting of people who were different from the majority in any of these aspects and were quite active in the discussions (Kassam 2018; Shechter 2018; Taylor 2018). It was believed that the demographics of the participants reflected the population that was most likely to have computer access at the time (Burgess et al. 2001; Donnelly et al. 2001). As more people gained computer access it was speculated that the demographics would change (Burgess et al. 2001).
There were three different categories of incels in this study: virgins (individuals who had no sexual experience except for masturbation), singles (individuals who had had sex with a partner at least once in their life but who had not been sexually active for a while), and partnered celibates (individuals who were in a relationship that had once been sexual but no longer were) (Donnelly et al. 2001). There were a variety of reasons why people became incels. For virgins and singles some reasons included mental illness, medical issues, low self-esteem, awkwardness, shyness, not living up to gender norms, following gender norms too closely resulting in males not meeting female partners due to working in a male dominated work place, or females not asking males out as they expected the male to initiate, religious upbringing preventing dating experience in teenage years, abuse, and living arrangements (Donnelly et al. 2001; Kassam 2018; Shechter 2018). For partnered incels the reasons were a little different as they and their partners use to have a satisfactory sex life, but slowly stopped over time, or stopped after the birth of a child (Donnelly et al. 2001).

Involuntary celibacy had a few different consequences for the participants in this study. Consequences included: frustration, depression, anxiety, isolation, feeling like they were off time with peers of the same age group (virgins and singles feeling behind peers with more sexual experience, while partnered felt like they had skipped ahead), and a loss of confidence (Donnelly et al. 2001). While the lack of sexual activity was the focus for some participants, for others it was the lack of love or relationship that brought on these negative feelings (Donnelly et al. 2001). Negative thoughts and feelings that came from involuntary celibacy likely furthered the problem for many individuals as they would be less open to opportunities for sexual activities or romance due to their lack of confidence (Donnelly et al. 2001). The longer an individual was an incel, the more likely they were to give up on their situation changing (Donnelly et al. 2001). Only 22% of participants in the study used the Internet for sexual purposes, the majority used it to participate in the online incel community that was forming as an emotional support network for people going through the same problems (Donnelly et al. 2001).

**Incel Subculture Shift**

As was predicted by Burgess et al. (2001), the incel community changed significantly as time went on. Some of the incel subculture online still resembles that of its early days, as an inclusive community for those who are experiencing involuntary celibacy and want to provide emotional support for each other (Kassam 2018), but this unfortunately has been drowned out by a much more negative community within incel subculture. The term “incel” is now associated with a violent misogynistic ideology and seen as a counter culture to the feminism movement (Kassam 2018; Shechter 2018; Zimmerman et al. 2018). According to the misogynistic incel ideology, feminism goes against nature by disrupting monogamous heterosexual couplings, and has ruined society by causing the oppression of men (Zimmerman et al. 2018). It is believed by incels who subscribe to this ideology that feminism and women’s sexual liberation has resulted in only the most attractive or rich men getting access to female bodies leaving many without sexual partners (Zimmerman et al. 2018). These incels believe they are entitled to sex and that society has failed them for not providing access to women’s bodies (Zimmerman et al. 2018). The aim of this ideology is for men to gain sexual control over women through any means necessary including raping and murdering women (Zimmerman et al. 2018). But how did the meaning of incel change so much? What was the process that lead to this dramatic change within incel subculture? The online subculture has died down and reformed a few times since the Donnelly et al. (2001) study was conducted (Shechter 2018). In 1998, some of the participants in the research conducted by Donnelly et al. (2001) did show signs of misogyny by objectifying women, seeing themselves as not masculine enough due to their lack of sexual experience, and blamed women for their situation (Shechter 2018), but this was far from the majority (Donnelly et al. 2001; Kassam 2018). In 2010, some online incel spaces such as LoveShy were beginning to show signs of hatred to themselves and to
the world (Shechter 2018). Other spaces like "You’re Not Alone" in 2014 were still a relatively positive and inclusive spaces for all incels (Shechter 2018). Despite positive pockets of activity, the incel forums online became an echo chamber for self-hatred and misogyny as members that held these views found other members that shared their attitudes, and resulted in even more hatred and eventually radicalization due a lack of mediation on the forums (Jaki et al. 2018; Shechter 2018). They began to develop their own terminology to discuss their hatred of attractive women and the men they had sex with, and their own self-hatred (Jaki et al. 2018). Some of these terms which will be relevant later in this essay are “Stacey” which refers to an attractive woman who is assumed to be promiscuous, and “Chad” which refers to an attractive man that has sex with Staceys (Jaki et al. 2018).

It was in 2014 that it became clear that the incels had seen a major negative shift and became associated with misogyny and violence when a young man (who will not be named in this essay) killed six people and injured over 14 others before killing himself in Isla Vista, California (Shechter 2018). The attacker wrote a 141-page document identifying himself as an incel, discussing his deep hatred of women, and calling for other incels to stop being so passive and act (Shechter 2018; Taylor 2018). According to Zimmerman et al. (2018) this man “was the first individual to be labeled a terrorist of the alt-right by the Southern Poverty Law Center, which tracks far-right activity” (1). By some members of the incel subculture, the attacker became a hero being referred as “the Supreme Gentleman” and inspired another violent attack in 2018 by another man (who will also not be named) in Toronto, Ontario (Taylor 2018; Zimmerman et al. 2018). The Toronto attacker made his connection to the negative side of incel subculture clear on Facebook by making a post directly referring to the Isla Vista attacker, and stating “The Incel rebellion has begun!” just before driving a rented van into a crowd resulting in the death of ten people (Zimmerman et al. 2018, 1).

Along with misogyny, incel subculture has been associated with racism and white supremacy by organizations like the Women in International Security (Zimmerman et al. 2018), but this is debatable. Lack of data and research make it hard to determine if the majority of members in the incel community are white, but from browsing through popular online spaces for incels such as subreddits (the term used for boards on Reddit) like r/Braincels, or boards like ROBOT9001 and Politically Incorrect on 4chan, it would appear that racist or race related comments are common. A linguistic study conducted on incel.me by Jaki et al. (2018) also demonstrated that racist comments are frequently made on incel forums. However, racism tended to be much more sporadic than misogyny (Jaki et al. 2018). A significant amount of the race related discussion tended to be connected to self-hatred, where an individual would express that due to being a racial or ethnic minority that was not attractive or rich, they had an even harder time finding a partner than their white incel counter parts (Jaki et al. 2018). From these observations it is fair to say that there is a great deal of racism on these forums, but it is not the primary source of hate within the negative side of incel subculture. The main focus of incel hate is themselves for being unable to find sexual partners, and anyone who can find partners (Williams 2018).

Current Space

As a result of the violent attacks associated with incel subculture that were discussed earlier in this essay, incels are experiencing increased surveillance online (Ohlheiser 2018). Due to this increased attention some incel online spaces such as r/incel on Reddit or incel.me have been shut down by either the main website that the board was on to prevent radicalization, or by incels themselves to move away from public observation (Ohlheiser 2018; Zimmerman et al. 2018). Some incel spaces can still be found though. Although it has been put on quarantine by Reddit, meaning before you enter the subreddit you must read a warning that content may be offensive, be spreading hoaxes, or based off inaccurate information (Reddit, n.d.), the subreddit r/Braincels is still active and has become a replacement for r/incels. The top post for the month as of December 17, 2018 on r/Braincels was a post about the death of a beloved pet, which lead to many comments on how pets are better
than woman or the only creatures that love incels (TheJollyReaver 2018). The top post of all time as of the same date on this subreddit was a story of one incel’s experience of being bullied by a group of Staceys, but to his surprise he was stood up for by a Stacey and a Chad (Unknown 2018). This post lead to a discussion critiquing incel ideologies by other Reddit users (Unknown 2018). This last post demonstrates that there is a deep hatred within the incel community, but that there is hope that through positive experiences in the real world some members who subscribe to the negative incel ideology may be able to see the flaws in their thinking. The connection to incels going offline and into public places and incels becoming aware of how toxic the incel ideology is was made by David Futrelle as well (Shechter 2018).

Future Research

As was previously mentioned online subcultures change quickly and incel subculture is likely to continue to shift (Burgess et al. 2001). To better understand the shifts that have already occurred and how incel subculture may change in the future more research is desperately needed. This task will not be easy though. While the Internet is relatively open making it easier to find some subcultures that may be difficult to find offline (Burgess et al. 2001), incels are moving to more discreet spaces online which will likely make them harder to find in the future.

Subcultural studies theories may be helpful for studying incels, specifically neo-birminghamian conception of subculture discussed by Jensen (2018). The neo-birminghamian concept combines the openness of postmodern theories with social structural theories to gain a more in-depth understanding of members of a subculture (Jensen 2018). This theory accounts for the various structural forces that influence a subculture such as race, ethnicity, gender, and class while still accounting for agency within the subculture (Jensen 2018). Since so little is known about current incel subculture, theories that allow for the exploration of the complex connections between social structures and agency with an open mind would be helpful.

Conclusion

In this essay the author has explored the online subculture of incels. Breaking down the term “subculture” and discussing how it applies to incels provided a helpful foundation in understanding this group. There has been limited research conducted on incel subculture, but the study conducted by Donnelly et al. (2001) provides a good start for understanding members of the incel community, why they struggle to find sexual partners, and the impacts involuntary celibacy has had on them. While incel subculture began as a supportive and inclusive network for anyone experiencing involuntary celibacy, this has dramatically changed. Pockets of the inclusive side of incel subculture do still exist but due to the echo chamber effect of the Internet, deep hatred has, for the most part, taken over this online subculture. Two violent attacks associated with incels have resulted in incel subculture becoming more hidden, but its spaces can still be found. The spaces used by incels that can be observed do demonstrate misogyny and self-hatred, but some hope can still be found as well. More research is needed to gain a better understanding of how incels have changed and will likely change in the future. The neo-birminghamian conception of subculture as discussed by Jensen (2018) could be useful in future studies as its openness may allow for a greater understanding of incels.

References


Unknown. 2018. "I went to the gym for the first time yesterday and a bunch of Stacys made fun of me.” Reddit post, February, 2018. https://www.reddit.com/r/braincels/comments/7wsk9l/i_went_to_the_gym_for_the_first_time_yesterday/


YOUTH AND POWER IN *MOONRISE KINGDOM*

**Tracey Turner | University of Manitoba**

**keywords** | youth, love, power, hegemony, governmentality, agency

**abstract** | Stories of young and forbidden love, like that of Sam Shakusky and Suzy Bishop, provide an ideal context through which to discuss and challenge current conceptions of youth and social theories of power and agency. In the case within Wes Anderson's film, *Moonrise Kingdom*, both the characters and their actions illustrate social theories such as the adult/child binary, and the savage/civilized binary elements that work in counterpoint as they challenge the viewers’ concept of youth with a clever interplay of oppositional forces. In *Moonrise Kingdom*, the main characters demonstrate the concept of youth as a category of governmentality by clearly showing the ways in which government insists on hegemonic structures and policy for the care and control of its youth. In the end, it is the forces of governmentality which inspire the transformation of the protagonists to come of age by asserting their power, agency, and resistance through rebellion, innovation, and independence.

The film *Moonrise Kingdom* is a whimsical yet visceral coming of age story of young love. Released in 2011, *Moonrise Kingdom* was written and directed by American filmmaker Wes Anderson and co-written by Roman Coppola. The film is set on an island off the coast of New England in 1965 and tells the fictional story of likeminded pen-pals Sam Shakusky and Suzy Bishop who live in the Eastern coastal community of Summer’s End. *Moonrise Kingdom* draws the viewer into a complex power struggle surrounding the relationship of two pre-teen children and their community and world situated around their love for each other as they search for belonging, independence from their familial dysfunction, and an end to their youthful status. Through a critical discussion of youth and power present within *Moonrise Kingdom*, the film’s representation of youth will be analyzed within a theoretical framework by examining how the film’s characters and events exhibit elements of exclusion, rebellion, agency, resistance, and hegemony.

It can be said that power is central to the narrative in *Moonrise Kingdom*. To begin with, Sam exerts his own personal power and agency over his own circumstances in a number of ways. Initially, one sees the power that is inherent in Sam’s actions through his resignation letter from the Khaki Scouts of America youth, and defection from Camp Ivanhoe, leaving the only consistent community and affiliation he has ever known. From the outset, Sam is seen as an outsider, and lacks popularity amongst his peers in his Khaki Scout troop. Sam’s unfavourable reputation extends into his home life, as the audience soon hears from the telephone call between the police and Mr. and Mrs. Billingsly, Sam’s foster parents, as they convey their refusal to continue to foster Sam due to his emotionally disturbed state. Being that Scout Master Ward and Island Police Captain Duffy learn simultaneously that not only is Sam an orphan, but also one that is now without a foster family, they begin to empathize over time with Sam’s choices and journey.

Despite the building empathy that Scoutmaster Ward and Captain Duffy may be feeling, Sam is inherently caught up between three levels of power structures of governmentality.

First of all, the power structure that Sam holds membership in and later resigns from is identified as the Khaki Scouts of America. With this in mind, Anderson’s fabrication of the Khaki Scouts of America in this film is a perfect vehicle for exemplifying what Kwon (2013) refers to as a “youth community program.” Considering these types of programs, Kwon contends that “community-based programs have been and continue to be an important youth intervention strategy to enable technologies of affirmative governmentality” (2013, 27).

“Youth, as a category of governmentality” was regarded with special status for “care and control,” and for this reason Kwon argues that youth were targeted by government to be triumphed over, and a force to be kept...
at bay since the late nineteenth century (2013, 27-28). Kwon, further draws emphasis on youth as a category in the parallel occurrence and chronology of the founding of the “first US juvenile court” in Illinois in 1899 with its aim to “refine delinquent youth,” to the occurrence of youth community based programs and structures which historically targeted the young, poor, and disenfranchised, as well as ethnic and immigrant populations (2013, 27). The historic roots of the real Scouts of America reveal a lineage directly informed and descended from Robert Baden-Powell. Founder of the Scout movement, Baden was a national military hero in Britain, and his publication Scouting for Boys was influenced and inspired by his own military field manual writing Aids to Scouting published in 1899. The 1908 publication Scouting for Boys, inspired the Scout Movement in the U.S. American youth scout organizations that began as the “Woodcraft Indians and the Sons of Daniel Boone,” later became the Boy Scouts of America in 1910 (history.com, 2009). Programs such as the Scouts sought to redirect youthful energy by promoting self confidence, leadership, team-work, and obedience with the intent to create a “better democratic subject” (Kwon 2013, 27). On the surface, a survey of Sam Shakusky reveals him to be the perfect candidate for a youthful strategy of care and control like the pseudo military Khaki Scouts, as the community within Summer’s End has labelled him emotionally disturbed and an at-risk youth while also being powerless and an orphan without friends, family, or a future.

While the knowledge and experiences gained through membership and participation in the Khaki Scouts of America aims to empower their youth, it can be said that this power is also countered and negated by its need to criminalize its youth (Kwon 2013). This is evident in the inherent contradiction between the training and awarding of wilderness, and survivalist style skills that the Khaki Scout’s receive, juxtaposed to the coercive and punitive forces that are set into motion when Sam, casts aside mediocrity to survive in the unknown wilderness.

On the other hand, Sam’s pen-pal Suzy Bishop lives with her unhappily married mother and father, who are both emotionless lawyers, and her three younger male siblings. She is represented as a precocious and troublesome dreamer with aggressive tendencies who enjoys books with female heroines and protagonists. Suzy is initially shown gazing out at life through a set of binoculars around her neck, symbolically and figuratively looking for a way out of her own. The two pen-pals have planned their way out.

Sam decides to leave his community with the Khaki Scouts behind as he forges out into the wilderness with Suzy. Soon after, it is revealed that their departure was a pre-mediated one that was destined through a series of simple letters noting their pure intentions: “Dear Suzy, here is my plan... Dear Sam, my answer is yes... Dear Suzy, when?... Dear Sam, where?” (Moonrise Kingdom 2011). There is a unification of forces that come together as the second set of power structures emerge that Sam and Suzy must contend with. These coercive and disciplining forces can be identified as the Island Police Force as represented by Captain Duffy, The Khaki Scout Troop, and Suzy’s parents, Mr. and Mrs. Bishop.

Sam and Suzy are acting and taking control of their destiny outside of the norm that is expected of twelve-year-old children as they run away together to the wilderness.

The Khaki Scouts are ordered to search through the woods and a select three of the boys are deputized by Scout Master Ward to ensure Sam and Suzy’s return. The youth of the Khaki Scout search party arm themselves with savage weaponry including a bow and arrow and a club with nails to search for the dissident couple. As the couple is discovered, the two are threatened by their intended rescue squad, and must reveal how they, too, are armed, which results in Suzy stabbing a scout in the back with scissors, and the scouts’ dog getting caught in the crossfire by an arrow. Indeed, this is what Kwon means when a power structure, such as the Khaki Scouts program and its enforcers, the Khaki Scout deputies that have empowered others, leads to Sam and Suzy to becoming villainized in an effort to maintain social control (Kwon 2013, 28). Sam and Suzy defy capture.

Sam’s preparation to run away with Suzy, his love interest, illustrates a maturity that is beyond his years. Sam and Suzy are desperately reaching for a new way of
being and of being seen. Their actions display a conscious willful approach to leaving the category of what is the preconceived notion of childhood behind. Conceptions of childhood reflect a discourse on the differences between young and old; they are socially constructed, and on this Rollo states the following:

In most Western traditions, ‘childhood’ is a social category constructed around the physiological and cognitive differences that characterize the early life of human beings. The category of child is comprised of a set of ideas and imaginaries that organize how older people think and act in relation to young people. (Rollo 2018, 62)

Regarding this, Rollo argues that a “binary opposition” exists “between children and adults” (Rollo 2018, 62). The “binary opposition,” Rollo suggests, is a relational category that posits the aimless, dependent, agency-less child against the independent, focused, agency-driven adult (Rollo 2018, 62). Sam and Suzy are twelve years old; however, by way of contrast, their behaviour and abilities clearly suggest they possess an adult-like wisdom, neither lacking agency, independence, nor focus. Sam’s camping skills from Khaki Scout training are evident; in fact, they earn praise from Scout Master Ward. Suzy also reveals her knowledge, albeit modestly but matter-of-factly, on swimming, berries, and reading, while also exhibiting adult behaviours such as wearing perfume, dancing, and kissing.

This film brilliantly illustrates the childhood concept of the “savage/civilized binary” within a childhood discourse and yet also challenges it on numerous occasions (Rollo 2018, 60-61). Rollo tells us that, “The idea of a telos of progress from animal child to human adult is both a historical and conceptual antecedent of the idea of European civilization, prefiguring its stories about maturation and progress from cultural ignorance to enlightenment” (2018, 61). Here Anderson, the film’s director positions Sam and Suzy in an idyllic and romantic fashion within a background of music that simultaneously evokes innocence as well as a coming of age theme like a spring morning vignette. Suzy shares private aspects of her-self, affecting Sam like his muse, on how to kiss and endearing Sam to her by sharing her stories of her beloved heroines, love for magic, and posing scantily clad for Sam to paint her. The film situates Sam and Suzy within a common discourse of contradictions that exist in childhood theory: the tensions between the romantic notion that childhood was both as Rousseau suggested, a “time of innocence,” while also as Hobbes maintained, a time of evil and wildness” (Fournier 2018). This wildness is evoked in the forest scene where-by Sam and Suzy explore their love and beginning sexuality. The emphasis of this moment conceptually underscores a departure from innocence yet also a grounding in wild-ness and savagery. Like most rituals they are marked with the exchange of gifts, and Sam fashions a pair of earrings out of large beetles and barbed fishhooks. Sam applies agency and persuasion to Suzy, to alter her appearance with this gift by the inquiry “are your ears pierced?” as he soon pierces Suzy’s ears in the tent in the forest (Moonrise Kingdom 2011). Above all, the alteration of her body, and the symbolism of the gift is delivered as a rite of passage and convinces the viewer of the transition of both Sam and Suzy from a liminal state of “wait-hood” being betwixt childhood and adulthood (Fournier 2018).

Abruptly, this magical and idyllic moment instantly evaporates as the hunted couple is discovered by the coercive and disciplining forces of Captain Duffy, the Khaki Scout Troop, and Mr. and Mrs. Bishop. In keeping with social science theories from Rollo that state, “child societies would be fixed as a stage of amorphous, irrational, savage, and even criminal state of being” (2018, 73), Sam and Suzy faced disciplinarian forces which followed in reaction to the powerful agency that Sam and Suzy had shown in their flight from Summer’s End. Their agency was not innocent or benign; that is to say, a boy has been stabbed by Suzy, and a dog is dead. Considering the curious “binaries of savagery” and civility poses the question: are Sam and Suzy captured, or are they saved (Rollo 2018)?
Suzy faced forceful and coercive threats from her father that the couple were forbidden to see each other. Met with this option, Suzy applied equal agency and coercive force, and countered “one of these days, somebody's gonna get pushed too far. And who knows what they're capable of?” (Moonrise Kingdom 2011). A duality in the couples delinquency is apparent as Suzy's actions are seen in a different light than Sam's are. Anderson focuses upon the disgust of Mr. Bishop's discovery of the couple underneath the tent. In a conversation between Suzy and Mrs. Bishop, Suzy professes “we're in love. We just want to be together. What's wrong with that?” (Moonrise Kingdom 2011). Mrs. Bishop responds by saying “how will we get those fishhooks out of your ears?” (Moonrise Kingdom 2011).

Suzy's delinquency is situated within the context of her newly explored sexuality, and her parents response is coercive isolation and blatant denial. Kwon speaks to the common duality apparent in discourse about delinquency, stating that female delinquency most often related to "overt sexuality" (Kwon 2018, 37). Further, the third coercive and government structure forcibly acting upon Sam's delinquency was Social Services. Social Services is a hegemonic character that represents the third level of governmentality over Sam. This government agency is represented by a bleak monochrome uniformed woman, who promptly reveals her agenda that parentless and out-of-control Sam would be sent to an orphanage, and correspondingly after a psychological assessment, may undergo electroshock therapy. Sam was poised to be further imperilled in a system of parens patriae (Kwon 2018, 31). Speaking about this, Kwon writes that Social Services were inspired by the "British doctrine of parens patriae," a patriarchal state of “father knows best” in which the government acts as both a “parent, and as an agent of care” (Kwon 2018, 31; Fournier 2018). For the time being, Sam is given a safe haven with Police Captain Duffy.

The proposed potential treatment of Sam's mental illness or deviance via electroshock therapy represents a proposed form of coercive bodily discipline upon a child via a government structure. Hence, it is this torturous revelation that turns the emotional tide in favour of Sam, and unites the Scoutmaster, the Khaki Scouts, and The Police officer against the coercive force of Social Services and form a resistance.

The Khaki Scouts assist the couple's resistance, and in an act of selfless and independent agency, decide to sneak Suzy out of her parents home, to rescue Sam from future harm, and re-unite the couple. Foucault's notion which states, "Where there is power there is resistance", proves to be very true within the story of Moonrise Kingdom (1978, 93). It can be said that the form of resistance that Sam and Suzy, the Khaki Scouts, Captain Duffy, and the Scout Master become eventually united and engaged in is what Foucault conceived as, "everyday forms of resistance" (Seymour 2006, 303). While Sam and Suzy's resistance wasn't a social movement, it was indeed pivotal in circumventing the strong arm of hegemonic Social Services, and shifting their social status with respect to their peers, their community, and governmentality. Seymour posits the question: "under what circumstances would people challenge hegemonic systems?" (Seymour 2006, 3004). In light of the film's themes in Moonrise Kingdom, it might be suggested that people challenged hegemonic forces for love.

On the whole, this critical analysis of the film Moonrise Kingdom presented a set of diverse, complex and dynamic issues around youth and social power. It served to illustrate and challenge many notable concepts of social power through the actions of personal agents Sam, Suzy, the Khaki Scouts, Captain Duffy, the Bishops, and Scoutmaster Ward, as well as through the nongovernmental entities, the Khaki Scouts of America, and government entities, Social Services. The presentation of the burgeoning relationship and love between Sam and Suzy at the age of twelve challenges the social construct of the category of youth as a fixed and dependant category, and offers up the discourse through the players and events that begets questions of the viewer: is their love to be supported? Is it socially acceptable? Are they too young? Nevertheless, the viewer comes away from the film experience with the belief that deep down, society really doesn’t support young love.
Moonrise Kingdom imparts a great deal of agency to its protagonists, as they are able to build a relationship in secret. Their premeditation of their departure entails a great deal of planning, expertise, courage, and self determination, but clearly this challenges the very social theories that categorize youth into a dependent state under a paternalistic structure. Sam and Suzy are not “docile bodies” but active agents writing their destiny as they evoke their own free will (Fournier 2018).

The very nongovernment structures, like the Khaki Scouts of America that imparted this independence to Sam and encourage self reliance, also seek to restrain Sam initially, and force him to behave according to conventions, rules, and the structural forces that bear down upon the Khaki Scouts of America organization. Therefore, we see the contradictions inherent in the nongovernment structure’s tendency to empower and criminalize as they are two-sided, and perhaps are not to be trusted. Clearly, Anderson represents youth as a time of agency and innovation, and he shows this through the young Khaki Scouts’ inventions, abilities, and through the wisdom and agency that Sam and Suzy embody; however, the society of Summer’s End reveals that youth is not necessarily a category to be trusted. Yet still, why is the general perception around Sam and Suzy’s relationship in the community of Summer’s End seen as a threat? In Sam and Suzy’s quest for freedom and desire for a different life, they shine the critical light upon the limits of the antagonists’ own deficiencies in their marriages, loneliness, lack of fulfillment in work, and in their blind acceptance of the status quo.

Conclusion

To summarize, through this critical discussion of youth and power present within the film Moonrise Kingdom, it has been shown that the film’s characters and events exhibit elements of exclusion, rebellion, agency, resistance, and hegemony. Anderson cleverly balances many relevant social theories of powers at play regarding youth which illustrate the adult/child binary and the “savage/civilized binary” that work in counterpoint, constantly challenging and forcing the viewer to re-assess their positions (Rollo 2018, 60-62). Given these points, the criminal, runaway, and sexualized behaviour of Sam and Suzy was offset and transformed into a visual commentary of respect, self determination, freedom, and creativity. Are the Khaki Scouts in support of their peers, Sam and Suzy, or are they against them? It is this clever interplay of oppositional forces that are inherently at work in our perceptions of youth in Moonrise Kingdom.

References


ANTHROPOLOGY IN IRAN AND IRAQ: WAR AND WOMEN

Mina Dousti | University of Manitoba

keywords | war, Iran, Iraq, women, Iranian women

abstract | One of the most important anthropological missions is to try to release and remove gender differences in war and conflict. The gendered approach to war cannot be understood, however, solely by focusing on such elements as: violations of women’s rights in cases of physical security, sexual harassment, or rape. Instead, women's emotional and physical experiences of violence and trauma during periods of conflict must be taken into account. All these must be contextualized within particular views toward tradition, culture, personhood and nation, owing to the constraining influence each may have for women’s rights. During the eight-year war between Iran and Iraq, many women struggled endlessly at the front. Multiple fighters fought against men and defended their homeland. But due to their gender and, of course, they are a minority in terms of number, they were less likely to be seen. The goal is to identify the strong personality of these women and introduce them not as a second class gender, but as the one that had the greatest impact in many wars and has been ignored unfairly.

“If women hold up half the sky during peacetime, they hold up even more of it during wartime” (Ammu Joseph 2002).

Degrees of sexual violence vary tremendously across cultures across the globe. In certain areas of the world, routine and ferocious gendered sexual violence has become a key feature of women’s lives. The processes of determining what it means to be man or woman in these settings is extremely complicated as this crucial self-work must occur within a situation of male domination and female subservience. To anthropologically assess the psychosocial effects of gendered violence it is required that one examines material, ideological, and institutional features and others intersectional, and situate these in time and place (Sideris 2003, 714).

Within the framework of war, women are both important to the allies and the opponents because they represent important sources of information, as they are generally intimately aware of local happenings (Joseph 2002, 2). Where battles are occurring in urban areas, women’s lives are often overturned as a result of the anarchy the war generates. They may become the tactical goals of violence because they are the core elements of urban life (Nordstrom 1991, 6).

Women’s front line involvement in war varies considerably in the literature. When dirty war strategies are in play, women are generally placed at the core of conflict. Dirty wars are about creating a logic of terror, and in them, women are common targets. They are raped, injured, or murdered to pacify the resident community and scare them into social and political submission (Taussig 1987, 3).

Typically, a culture in panic mode governs through fear. In such a setting, women stand out as the exemplary figures of innocence. This is often the pattern on which the hostile party works to inscribe horror. Since the majority of war casualties are civilian, and a significant number of these are women and children; it begs the question as to who precisely are the soldiers and the victims, and who is the war’s essential subject? (Nordstrom 1991, 11-13).

In this paper, I provide a general review of gendered differences in war. It is also intended to portray the presence of women in various roles of society and their social and cultural activities, with an emphasis on their participation in the war especially women’s role in Iran-Iraq war.

Sexuality, Culture and Power

Women are the most common victims of sexual violence. Yet, women’s talk about war does not always position them as its victims. Women tend not to classify all men as agents of violence in their discussion of the sexual violence perpetrated against them. Their stories
expose an anxiety for the misery of men who endured the sexual suffering of their own kin, and who became the caretakers for women who were raped (Sideris 2003, 715).

Based on archeological findings, it is generally believed that nomadic, horse riding, early Iron Age women of the Eurasian steppes may have utilized weapons and probably had some political influence, though likely did not have either authority nor power. Nonetheless, 90% of war-related artifacts that have been obtained from the graves of men and only 15–20% from the graves of women (Davis-Kimball 1997, 47). For Amazon societies in ancient Greece or South America, there is a lack of sufficient proof for such conclusions. In many contemporary hunting and gathering and rural societies, distinct gender prohibitions apply to weapons, and special acts emphasize attention on men's roles as combatants. Generally, war and hunting are the two domains of social life closed off to women (Goldstein 2001, 11-19).

Conquering a population by executing males, raping women, and then taking women and children as slaves was the most prevalent pattern in wars in the ancient Middle East and Greece. The idea was that captive women could be made submissive and would submit to control in a way that men would not. There is insufficient evidence to suggest, however, that male sexuality is a significant component of male soldiers' hostility. Individual rights based on gender categories may cause anger (especially for women) during the war, which is unavoidable. If the deprivation of sexual needs does not explain male cruelty to women during war, what drives this abhorrent behaviour?

In the context of the so called, "war on terror," sex and gender differences are deeply shot through with national and religious difference from the "West". "The martyr," “the supporter,” and “the fighter” are roles which are conventionally relegated to men, rather than women. Transgressing the boundaries of the private–public domains, female sacrifice in this framework depicts a renegotiation of women's “traditional” domestic roles and a subversion of the dominant gender order. In addition to the policing of national and religious difference, circumscribing women's roles speaks to the structure of sex–gender variance in class differences, namely in terms of the disparities produced by neoliberal economic developments. The structure of a mutual sex–gender difference functions tactically to connect differences amongst women based on class and national or religious characteristics in addition to political beliefs (Pratt 2012, 1822). Through studying the place of women, it becomes obvious that most concepts of social roles split the primary concern of work between women and men (Eagly and Wood 2000, 123).

Whereas many social principles state that social roles can vary in diverse situations and stages, Eagly and Karau (1995), social roles reliant on gender are the most likely to be subjective and framed according to localized societal norms (Eagly and Johnson 1990, 249).

**Men's Motivation for War**

Some biological anthropologists attach war and hostility to male biology. Konner (1988) contends that "testosterone is a key" to animosity. Wrangham and Peterson (1996) depict male chimps as intrinsically "wicked," requiring restriction by females. The argument advanced is that male biology favours men for battle in several important ways. By and large, most men are bigger and sturdier than most women—however there is enough variation in sizes and sturdiness between men and women to make this theory implausible. The biological argument plays on allegedly inborn characteristics that men are physiologically better suited for battle. A culturalism theoretical turn permits researchers to see women and men as complementarily equivalent in war, which explains the established historical record of women warriors, their roles in bolstering troops, and their contributions as assembly line labourers (all while continuing to assume the unacknowledged labour of managing all affairs in the domestic realm). Postmodern women's theorists ensure the "essentialism" that is at work when researchers fail to take into consideration the restrictions on gendered work in wartime (Goldstein 2001, 113-114).

Mass media also has a role to play in distorting and rigidifying gender roles during wartime. The way
news is reported and the editorial policies at work in most mainstream media institutions tend not to question gender normativity, and merely enhance ideas that people think they already know. In the situation of war, reports attend to the “real work of war”—the actual battle fields, which entices audiences to continue to believe that there truly are a greater number of men than women engaged in the war. Men are the media’s war subjects, while women are its objects (Wood 2014, 31).

**Women’s Role in Wars**

One analysis of twelve culturally diverse war sites found that women were excluded from battle in cultural settings while they have faced something far worse than that: a high degree of domestic violence against women, warlike games, high crime, and normative vindictive behaviour in the name of religion (Ember and Ember 1997, 6). Women’s attendance in war is to some degree higher in matrilocal than patrilocal social orders, but still remains remarkably. In one study of sixty-seven different communities, women took an interest in war events during a certain period. There were nine cases—for the most part Native American culture groups—where women warriors comprised a minority of those in battle, but even here it is regarded as uncommon. For another instance, Navaho war parties never had more than two women. Brave women "sometimes" battled against enemies, but women warriors are largely considered non-normative; Comanche women just sometimes engaged in battle, but only were around the battlefield sides not in the middle (Adams 1983, 202-203).

In this study women are not wholly excluded from participating in battle, but their battle roles (and rights in general) are largely tied to their roles and rights in the community.

**World Wars**

Studies reveal that women frequently and effectively influence men to spur them into battling wars. In Britain and America amid World War I, women organized a vast crusade to pass out white feathers to physically fit men in the city to cajole them into service. Prior to the 1973 political situation in Chile, conservative women tossed corn at troops to insult them as "chickens". Apache women met successful warriors with "tunes and rejoicings" while they insulted those who were defeated in the war and created a sense of embarrassment in them (Goldstein 2001, 316-317).

The coordinated efforts between Britain and the United States made military use of women. The Soviet Union significantly militarized women making battle jobs accessible to a considerable amount of them. In Britain, the number of women in the military crested at 470,700 or 9.39% of the nation’s military population in September 1943 (Central Statistical Office 1993, 39). Military women made up 2% of the UK’s female populace.5

In the United States, women served for the first time in the Second World War. During WWII, 350,000 women served in the US military (Army DCSPER 46, 1945). In the US, 150,000 women served in the Army and different branches in an official capacity as individuals from the Women’s Army Auxiliary Corps (WAAC) and the Women’s Army Corps (WAC) (Bellaire, 1993). US military women comprised 0.13% of the US female populace.6

The latest evaluations put the quantity of Soviet women in the military at 1 million (Markwick and Cardona 2012, 150), which adds up to approximately 3 % of Army work force. Of the almost 500,000 women who filled in as customary fighters, 120,000 assumed battle capacities, for example, as riflemen, pilots, tank-drivers, mortar administrators, and heavy armament specialists. The quantity of female fighters in the Red Army (just the

---

5 This proportion has been ascertained based on the 1931 statistics for England, Wales and Scotland, and the 1937 evaluation for Northern Ireland (Online Historical Population Reports).

6 This proportion has been figured based on the expected number of 45 million US women in 1945, recommended by the registration figures for 1940 and 1950 (Historical Statistics of the United States, 15).
field armed force without the naval force) added up to 348,309 in 1943. The number crested at 473,040 in 1944, and had tumbled to 463,503 by 1945 (Krivosheev 2005, 33). They represented 0.8% of the female populace at their crest in 1944. Registration figures including sexual orientation proportions for the whole pre-war Soviet Union are inaccessible, being bound to the Russian Soviet Republic, where the greater part of the female officers hailed. Of the 170.5 million residents of the Soviet Union in 1939, the lion’s share (109.4 million), lived in the Russian Soviet Republic (Rossiiskaia akademiia nauk 2000). Here 57.8 million or 52.8% were women (Fieseler and Hampf 2014, 116).

In between the wars in the Soviet Union, the sentiment of being ambushed by powers unfriendly to communism prompted the state to engage in purposeful publicity which stressed the obligation, regardless of gender, to safeguard the nation in the case of war. Paramilitary associations were set up, which pulled in a sizeable degree of female participation (Krylova 2004, 628). Following women’s work in the military administration in the First World War and the Civil War of 1918–1920, women developed a powerful urge to exceed the limits of their previous roles (Fieseler and Hampf 2014, 118).

In the Soviet Union during World War II, approximately 800,000 women were engaged the war efforts and comprised around 8% of the Soviet military. Most were restorative specialists, however a couple thousand were soldiers, airplane and heavy armament specialists, pilots, expert sharpshooters, and infantry. War propaganda often overstated women’s achievements to push men into competition so that they would battle harder (Goldstein 2001, 67-72).

In every one of the three nations, the kind and level of women’s contributions to the war efforts were largely in reaction to the exigencies of war, rather than the product of social norms. Nonetheless, women’s militarization was still circumscribed by ideas about their abilities and worth. In the U.S. and Britain, the restriction on battle jobs for women was maintained. In the Soviet Union, on the other hand, the restrictions were lifted, but quietly (Fieseler and Hampf 2014, 121).

**Iran-Iraq’s War**

The women and war issue in the Middle East could be depicted as an important activity to women’s activists, researchers, and experts to gender their points of view and ways in order to deal with power connections and structures (Rodgers 2011, 130).

Political and military improvements are often the primary, direct results of war. Other outcomes are financial ones that occur because of the wartime economy: i.e., the development of offices, hardware gear, materials, and merchandise. While, the absence of work existence and high energy generation and transport of a noteworthy power of the work power to military fronts is undeniable. The second set of outcomes are social. These include: changes in the populace, decreases in the level of social administration, changes in social developments, and the exchange of social obligations. The results of the war are sometimes divided into two categories, positive and negative, although the nature of the war is devastating. Notwithstanding the creation of deficiencies in various regions, war sometimes could offer chances to cross previous social limits, and prompts innovativeness and development (Koolaee 2014, 277-78).

In what follows, I examine the changes in the social roles of women in their own words. Likewise, changes occurred during the war inside the system of sociology for women. This issue needs more thorough knowledge in regard to the role of women in war and changes in their social job in Iranian society.

Despite the physical and emotional pressure on women during wars, this research shows the recovery of women and their coordination with the conditions of war.

Women’s roles in war can be categorized as follows: those who worked in the context of an immediate job in the war; those who assumed an irregular job on the front lines; and those roles flowing from the war’s repercussions, including the role of a spouse, sister, or martyr child. As indicated by the Foundation of Martyrs and Veterans Affairs, many Iranian women were martyred on the Iran-Iraq battlefront (Koolaee 2014, 281).
Iranian women were actively engaged in war efforts against Iraq amid the Iran-Iraq War (1980-88). They battled in a few different ways, supported the troops at the edges of the battlefield, and gave key strategic help. As a major aspect of their battle, they conveyed firearms, went on observation missions, cared for the injured, monitored ammo terminals, sorted out nourishment drives, deliberately gave their material belongings, and most significantly, empowered the men in their lives (fathers, spouses, siblings, and children) to battle at any cost. Accordingly, Iraqi troopers murdered, harmed, physically attacked, assaulted, and imprisoned Iranian women as detainees of war. Today, they are seldom acknowledged in the media for their tremendous efforts and instead, the general public abhors any mention of their inclusion in the war (Farzaneh 2015, 1).

Dr. Mateo Farzaneh, who is principal of the Mossadegh Initiative at Northeastern Illinois University and is research fellow in history of Iran and Middle East, pointed that according to the interviewees I worked with, provide some explanation interviewed the reasons of women took an interest in the war to either safeguard their country, Islam, or both. They also worked in the war with full heart satisfaction. As such, their support was either with the military and associations dependent on it, or it was independent of various organizations and institutions. Despite the fact that women from all over Iran volunteered to strategically bolster the war, they were most dynamic in their official efforts along fringe territories with Iraq: namely in Western Azerbaijan, Kurdistan, Kermanshah, Ilam, and Khuzestan. Herein, women’s activities included corresponding with and for the state media, planning war publicity, providing paramilitary or paramedic training to other women, performing paramedic work, and working as insight and counter knowledge officers. These roles were sorted out with the support of the Revolutionary Guard Corp (Sepah-E Pasdaran), the Mobilization Force (Basij), the Jihad Reconstruction Corp (Jahad-E Sazandigi), and the Red Crescent (Helal-E Ahmar) (Farzaneh 2015, 2).

The war was presented to the Iranian populace by creating and advancing a narrative about a culture of suffering in view of religious subjects found in Shi’i Islam. For quite some time, there have been two famous discourses in post-war Iran: the common discourse, (which is full of references to dodge, to overlook, to run
away to the Caspian); and after that the state’s discourse—a narrative of the strong, grieving women and the brave saintly men. Grieving shows women bound to the burial ground, alone. The discourse of the grieving women is really the regurgitation of state crafted ideology. Other women hear and ignore it, and it is never trusted. This is because it is an account composed by men, about men, loaded up with male pictures and male heroics (Varzi 2008, 86). Most women exist between the two discourses, focused instead on the possibility of womanhood given the constraints of parenthood.

The state’s legends of male saints have done important ideological work for the country. Women in these stories function merely to grieve. Those who speak out against this narrow role are shrouded away in their homes and made imperceptible (Varzi 2008, 94). During the war women not only participated by offering practical supports (providing blankets, clothing and food), but physically, serving on front lines, especially south of Iran.

According the war information which was gathered by Farzaneh, during the war, thousands of Iranian women were executed, injured and captured by Iraqi forces.

Farzaneh (2018) believe that the wounded statistics are much higher than what has been announced. During the well-known attack of the city of Khorramshahr (southwest of Iran), which fell following 34 days of battle, women represented up to 25% of the battle corps in the city. Those women wrote in their diary that they did this more because they wished to be viewed as equivalent to men. Farzaneh insists that poor women care more for their nation than rich women. “The war helped women to maintain their dignity in ways they preferred, rather than the manner in which the state needed them to,” he said (Farzaneh 2018, 1).

It is obvious what the Islamic fundamentalists require of women. Utilizing the desire of Allah as cover, they seek to control women by requiring them to accommodate their own literal translations of the Qur’an. They demand that women defer to any and every male so-called “expert.” Women are to lead lives without voices, as the social, political and monetary inferiors of men—taking orders even from 12-year-old boys.
The requirement for women to assume central jobs in the workforce during the mass migration of men to battle in the Iran-Iraq war (1980-88) drew women into once male-dominated positions. Women became military officers, oil-venture capitalists, development chiefs, researchers, architects, specialists, bookkeepers and took on other previously restricted occupational roles.

Iraqi women also performed numerous jobs during the Gulf War. They were seriously influenced by the mainstream uprising that went ahead of the lower regions of the United States in 1991. Women, much the same as men, were activated before the Iraqi attack of Kuwait in 1990. In fact, all situations in the Iraqi military were available to women, including battle jobs; notwithstanding, there is no confirmation to propose that Iraqi women partook in the genuine attack compel.

Just at the time when women comprised nearly 30% of the undergraduate student population (in 1990-91) women’s numbers began to taper off owing to the return of male soldiers from the frontlines, and the return of men who had been the detained in Iran (Vedadhir 2002, 33). In Iraq’s military structure, women of the Ba’ath regime were utilized as an honours badge (Al–Rabiee 1998, 174).

In March of 1983, President Saddam Hussein visited the workplaces of the General Federation of Iraqi Women (GFIW), the female arm of the Ba’th party, where he asked women to build their investment in the reproduction purposes. Women up until this point had not understood their potential, and really were a long way from doing. So, Hussein insisted that women should move in the direction of this objective. He encouraged women’s social development, although not without limits—the idea was to balance their traditional obligations with their new rights (Efrati 1999, 28).

From the record of Iran about the war, it is obvious that women were used as an active force in different fields of war. Women are perceived nationally as courageous, whether they were in the battle zone, providing insight and administration, operating as war scouts, doing restorative work with injured soldiers, or they did some responsibility like burying the dead bodies. While serving in Iran’s political offices, women assumed accomplished and responsible jobs. Iranian women willfully chose to be engaged actively in war efforts. Iraqi women were additionally occupied with their responsibilities as parents and spouses. The war forced new social jobs on women; it also permitted new social roles for women.

Other Wars

In last decades in the Kitwara Empire in the Zulu kingdom, and elsewhere in Africa, women stayed at home during the wars, and they took responsibility for peace in the city. Zulu women additionally left the house before leaving the warriors. Among American Indians, in Arikara culture, during the 2-day war, women wore their spouse’s garments and told stories about their husband’s valour. In the Comanche war, women held up one side of a drum while men held the other instruments. Teton women wore adornments demonstrating their prosperity as warriors, and Ojibway women also participated in an active battle (Turney-High 1971, 161).

Among the Chiriguano and Chané of Bolivia, women performed extraordinary dances and songs to help the warriors, prior to, and during and battles. Women engage in different manners of advancing and compensating warrior jobs for men (Goldstein 2001, 316-17).

In different social orders, from Germanic clans of Roman times to American Indigenous peoples, women have been “the sacrosanct observers to male valiance” (Elshtain, 2009, 292). Women performing women’s work in the war zone, for example, nursing, “enhances confidence by upgrading a man’s recognizable proof of himself as a warrior” (Holmes 1985, 97).

Notwithstanding women’s exclusion from battle, various social orders have routinely utilized women to help troops. Women’s support in tormenting and murdering detainees is additionally remarked upon in the literature. The Konkow now and again empowered women to take part in tormenting captive males. Among the Tupinamba of Brazil, women eagerly helped torment detainees of war to death and some say, ate them afterwards. Also, Kiwai women of Oceania had the unique occupation of “disfiguring” adversaries injured in battles,
and afterward slaughtering them with blades or burrowing sticks (Turney-High 1971, 160-64).

In the 18th–nineteenth century Dahomey Kingdom of West Africa, women made up one wing of the armed forces (Alpern 1998, 60-64). They lived in the ruler’s castle, took an extraordinary amount of training, and were formidable combatants whose presence in the ruler’s abode considerably expanded the kingdom’s military power. Dahomey is a critical case since it demonstrates that a women’s battle unit makes up a significant component of an armed force.

Eritrea and South Africa also have women in their military infantry. Eritrean women battled on the ground in the deadly war with Ethiopia in the late 1990s (comprising approximately 33% of the total army). A few reports put women at 33% of Eritrean battle powers. Women’s status in NATO military endeavours is advancing slowly. National wars tend to move along a typical trajectory—from air raids, to battle ships, to submarines, to ground battle. Women are engaged at each level. Women pilots, for example, bombarded Serbia (1999) and Afghanistan (2001) (Goldstein 2003, 113).

Conclusion

Women are today engaged, albeit not consistently across the board, not only in war, but pre-war preparations and post-conflict reconstruction efforts. The experiences and challenges women and girls face are different from the experiences and challenges facing men. Moreover, often their experiences, views, and skills are falsified to serve state interests. Despite their abilities, they continue to be considered less able than men are and continue to be less commonly deployed.

Women comprise both the casualties of war and the survivors. In the wake of wars women’s roles have been altered, as have their rights and their responsibilities. During wartimes women remain responsible for family care and in charge of family spending plans. They suffer enormously in times when the need to sustain armed forces diverts funds away from basic needs, rendering basic sustenance a weapon of war.

References


CLIMATE CHANGE AND HUMAN RIGHTS: US AGAINST THE WORLD (AND OURSELVES)

Kylie Nicolajsen | University of Manitoba

**keywords** | climate change, human rights, climate refugees, philosophical paradigms, power dynamics, global and local scales, Tuvalu

**abstract** | The uncertain future of climate change goes hand-in-hand with the presently contentious discussion of the concept itself, especially in the interdisciplinary realm of anthropology, law, politics, and philosophy. How can a human rights perspective be forged by viewing climate change at different levels, or from different angles? One thing is clear, even if the “right” way forward is not: a (re)conceptualization of climate change starts with a deeper regard for the “human”—on both global and local (i.e. small island) scales.

To imagine the world mere decades into the future is to imagine a very different landscape—one affected both physically and socially by climate change. It is true that, increasingly, “global climate change is on everybody’s lips” in one way or another (Diemberger et al. 2012, 229). Swirling around us in unprecedented ways, climate change can be both contextualized by and paralleled with human rights—in the sense that they are both ubiquitous and evolving concepts that involve precarious human relationships. Anthropology makes this interface possible by treating climate change not as a natural, but rather a socially constructed issue that has the capacity to reveal the true form of society in its wake (Marino and Lazrus 2015, 341). Usefully, anthropological concepts synergistically derived from and applied to “climate change” and “human rights” awaken a new meaning in “what comes next!”—with a grounded analysis of one assisting in the legibility of the other. Focusing on the South Pacific Island country of Tuvalu, a site marked by sea-level rise and forced migration, will assist in (re)conceptualizing climate-related human rights violations and keep our “heads above water” in the process.

Undertaking an analysis of the lofty relationship between climate change and human rights involves two major entanglements: the appropriate situating of “climate” and “human,” and turning a critical eye to the process of naturalization. Anthropocentric ideas inherited from the modern Western framework have been instilled with an oppositional logic, one that maintains a hierarchical relationship between either man and nature, man and woman, and, more generally, certain humans over other humans; this logic serves as an essential basis for “othering” that lies as central to many human rights issues in the way we view the earth and one another (Farbotko and Lazrus 2012; Barnes et al. 2013). Predictive models and protocols of climate change have also not sufficiently distinguished humans from the quantitative realm of discussion; how people are truly affected by climate change cannot be contained by any model based on categorization or calculation (Roscoe 2014, 536). The tendency to over-simplify or take the “human” and “climate” categories for granted originates from an attempt to mimic Western ideas of efficiency, where despite “economic models of humanity currently used to assess and manage the threat of climate change” not creating a “sufficiently robust basis for predicting (or backcasting) climate trends,” these models prevail (544). Inescapably, it seems, naturalization has manifested as a double-edged sword: making us simultaneously stagnant in the face of impending doom, and obsessive in our visual evidence-based documentation of climate change through mainstream media that pushes alternative views of “nature” and “crisis” out of the spotlight (Farbotko and Lazrus 2012, 383). Yet there are more layers to this Western “crisis of nature” (383). Calling into question “human rights” calls into question the subtext of this established climate narrative, encompassing qualitative issues such as entitlement, survival, and security when it comes to climate change. Re-situating where, exactly, the “human” component fits into this narrative is also to
situate a sense of urgency, recognition, and responsibility (McNamara and Gibson 2009, 476). The question remains: what roles do we all play, and, more importantly, what do these roles signify with regard to a human rights framework?

Fieldwork and interview processes conducted in Tuvalu, a “least developed country” as designated by the United Nations with a population consisting of fewer than fifteen thousand people, reveal the greater extent of the threat of sea-level rise, erosion, and flooding (Marino and Lazrus 2015, 343). Tuvalu is also a country that, according to unanimous climate change prediction models, “does not stand a chance” (Duong 2010, 1239). It is an irony taken for granted that those who contribute most to the problem of climate change via excessive resource exploitation, energy consumption, and pollution also tend to face fewer consequences; citizens of Tuvalu have made numerous failed efforts simply seeking the recognition of other countries’ disproportionate greenhouse gas emission levels (1240). Unfortunately, vague blame games rarely lead to immediate action, and the so-called “joint liability” entrenched in global climate change narratives simply allows the continued manipulation of countries like Tuvalu by larger nation-states in international discussion panels (1243-44). However, implicit in such relations is the perpetuation—and obfuscation—of victim, perpetrator, and so-called “neutral” roles (Hughes 2013, 571). Analyzing the already complicated power dynamics of climate change, while certainly useful, is also to ask challenging questions when these dynamics become less clear or mutated. For instance, how legible are human rights claims when non-vulnerable, high emitting countries find themselves in crisis? Do they have the right to ask for help—even from comparatively lower emitting countries? Or, is it the sole responsibility of the high emitting countries and corporations to find solutions, and, furthermore, to accept blame? Overall, how are cause and effect relationships to be reconciled with notions of “right,” privilege, and responsibility? These are only several scenarios that come to mind when framing human rights in the context of climate change—where the murky notions of accountability and control converge in rather unsettling ways on a grand scale—to such a degree where the concept of “human rights” itself fails to take on the same patterned visible, or expected, signifiers it always has. Given this rather overwhelming “what happens now” feeling, eliciting an impossibly nebulous array of interests with no feasible entry point, it is likely best to deal with human rights in real, tangible ways first—which directs the spotlight back on Tuvalu.

Fundamental to understanding and applying human rights in practice is not only about helping others when things go wrong, but recognizing—and altering—our roles in creating, perpetuating, and worsening these wrongdoings or injustices (Hughes 2013; Williams 2008). The anthropology of disaster offers useful insight when it comes to how to conceptualize climate change at a community level. For instance, it is during periods of crisis when the fundamental features of society become apparent; not only are a society’s priorities revealed in terms of their basic material needs, but, as well and of equal import, their social and cultural needs (Oliver-Smith 1996, 304). The stresses of climate change can be felt by citizens across three stages: warning, impact, and immediate aftermath. The drawn out nature of sea-level rise in Tuvalu presents an interesting temporal dilemma: how to implement an effective “disaster” or “crisis” mode preemptively with the same urgency as would be implemented in more “obvious” crises. Unfortunately, for countries like Tuvalu, “human migration and forced displacement will be a critical, if complex, outcome of anthropogenic climate change” (Marino and Lazrus 2015, 341). The atmospheric changes in Tuvalu transcend simply the physical environment, where “[p]olitical instability, violent conflict, extreme poverty, and corruption can go hand-in-hand with environmental degradation to create conditions for displacement” (Farbotko and Lazrus 2012, 389). Exploitation is a common theme as well, especially when it comes to the label of “first climate refugees;” being “us[ed] as points in global indicators of Corporate misgoverning” does not yield productive results (387). Tuvaluans want real support and solutions. An assessment of the interests—the needs, practices, and barriers—of Tuvaluans goes hand-in-hand with local or traditional
Indigenous peoples craft very particular natural and spiritual elements into their way of navigating the world—knowledge that should not be viewed as lesser than “proper” scientific knowledge; evidently, and important when framing the human rights of people from different backgrounds, “[knowledge] never speaks in one voice” (Diemberger et al. 2012, 229). For example, various accounts from Tuvaluans prioritize drought, not sea-level rise, due to the cumulative effects of poor access to drinking water on disease and health (Beyerl, Mieg, and Weber 2018, 33). It is important to recognize that pleas for governmental or NGO financial aid are not made in the spirit of arbitrariness; water management infrastructure and conservation are internally evaluated as more important than migration measures or building sea walls, as conserving water is thought to be directly related to “conserving” human rights (35). Interestingly, the viability of and advocacy for a human rights lens in Tuvalu has not gone unrecognized in international, academic, or activist communities. It also must be remembered that there is a non-negligible aspect of randomization that affects the “place-specific/pathway-dependent nature of climate impacts” before power dynamics even come into play (Fiske et al. 2014, 53). What does this mean, though, for citizens of Tuvalu and countless others like them? How does a country that “does not stand a chance” in the future claim their worth, and their identity, in the present?

A human rights framework attempts to reconcile boundaries by traversing them, even when circumstances may be conflicting or laced with hesitancy. Crossing boundaries is thematically important to human rights in this context; for instance, people can cross borders but pollution knows no bounds (Duong 2010, 1243). Boundaries are also crossed, or enforced, when taking into consideration the cultural differences between groups, between natives and outsiders trying to dictate how they should handle the situation and subsequently navigate their lives. By this token, proving one’s worth becomes significantly distressed by losing the meaning-imbued material grounds upon which identity is crafted. More than just “a dry place to go,” Tuvalu’s people will increasingly need to negotiate space in terms of “re-creating their nation and their lives” (1239). Yet, betwixt with the ever-precarious politics of representation, especially when it comes to groups lesser in number and power, are the consequences of labelling people as things such as “climate refugees.” The “climate refugees” of Tuvalu face the consequences well before disaster strikes, or before they are forced to leave, where value systems and economic priorities for local development and maintenance automatically become crippled by the prematurely presupposed inevitability of their destruction; people’s ability to access water, sanitation, and transportation is thus compromised, forcing many of them into inconvenient and dangerous living and working conditions (Marino and Lazrus 2015, 341-42).

When it comes to the efficacy of law and policy, the complex relationship between so-called “climate refugees” and the international community lies at the crux. The term “climate refugee” has only gained prominence in the literature in the last few decades, and already it has proven adverse in terms of up-keeping community strength and resilience with its isolating rather than unifying connotation (McNamara and Gibson 2009, 477-78; Farbotko and Lazrus 2012, 383). “Refugee” already enforces disparity between the so-called First and Third Worlds at large, but the traditional definition of “refugee” in human rights literature also fails to adequately account for climate change, threatening citizens’ legibility in a legal sense (Duong 2010, 1249). Equally contentious, the word “adaptation” lingers uncomfortably on Western ideals, with “incomplete” strategies to “adapt” to climate change often making less distinguishable the autonomy and abilities of countries who are directly affected (Oliver-Smith 1996, 304). What becomes implicitly signified by “climate refugee” and “adaptation” are problematic value systems—“who matters,” who is more important. Then, how to upgrade the idea of “climate justice,” where current imbalances are recognized and mitigated, to “human rights,” which far exceeds checks and balances when it comes to the great disparities between us, depends heavily on being critical of the very language we use (Williams 2008). To use “displaced person” rather than “refugee” for Tuvaluans, for instance, keeps the “human” in the equation—an
important distinction if one wants legal claim over not only the right to “life, health, food/water, livelihood, culture, privacy and home life, and property,” but autonomy, too (Duong 2010, 1253). As of late, climate change has been reconceptualized in ongoing and important conversations, such as with the Intergovernmental Panel on Climate Change, as a full-blown violation of human rights; any potential qualms or discrepancies regarding the exact nature of climate change are overshadowed by an evolution from purely morally defending people, which is unstable, and legally defending people, which is far more resilient (Bell 2011, 101-102). A model that “protect[s] human rights rather than maximizing welfare” frames climate change as human-inspired action that violates the rights of others, foremost a “threat to [people’s] most basic human interests” (99-100). The aforementioned right to “home life” is very relevant for Tuvaluans, but what does it really mean to recognize, beyond the right to shelter and a place to live, the right to have and maintain a “home?” It has been proven that displacement from one’s home, even in the context of fleeing for survival, may have profound social and psychological consequences (Oliver-Smith 1996, 308). Loss, change, and trauma factor in to what can initiate “responses […] involv[ing] the moral and ethical core of [people’s] belief system[s] and include a deep delving into concepts of both social and cosmic justice, sin and retribution, causality, the relationship of the secular to the sacred, and the existence and nature of the divine”—in other words, systems for establishing self-worth (308). Matters of perception and translation seem to be at the forefront of human rights discourse, and so it goes to follow in asking: “how [do] different individuals and organisations uptake and translate information about climate change as a concept into their own thinking” (McNamara and Gibson 2009, 475)? Tuvalu is just one of several vulnerable island countries that has been probed with critical attention with regard to its central role in navigating the uncharted territory that lies ahead, where questions of displacement and rights at large intersect with indigenous rights and refugee rights (477). Similar to how climate change cannot be construed in “fact and figure” terms, human rights viewed solely in terms of their legal or official standing neglects crucial elements of subjectivity and individuality—what climate change symbolizes beyond survival for “the people and things [humans] care about” (Diemberger et al. 2012, 227). Establishing human identities beyond the status of “climate refugees” is crucial in mobilizing the view of human-environment relationships as imbued with cultural significance. When it comes to the human rights landscape in places like Tuvalu, there is evidently both receptivity and resistance—people are not interested in seeking assistance blindly (Farbotko and Lazrus 2012, 385). Tuvalu’s citizens’ own standards quickly break down the robustness, appropriateness, and usefulness of certain solutions to climate change—a process that is still very much in its early stages. Venturing ahead with little historical precedent to go off of, it is the citizens of places like Tuvalu who will realize the true extent of “what comes next” after being designated “climate refugees.” There is, after all, a vast difference between viewing climate change as the only resort and as a last resort (385).

That being said, viewing climate change as a multi-faceted, multi-scale phenomenon can be intensely destabilizing. How can human rights remain situated on any solid ground when contextualizing “the big picture” while not losing sight of the many “smaller pictures,” and vice versa? Destabilization thematically infiltrates both the material and immaterial dimensions of climate change, serving as a tool and descriptor that simultaneously signifies what is happening, what should happen, and what we do not want to happen. For instance, there is the jarring destabilization of people from their homes, our paradigm level notions of “human” and “climate” that need to be destabilized in order to move forward, and the destabilization of our care and compassion for one another in an age of unprecedented “climate refugees.” It is problematic that people counted among populations of thousands rather than millions face a certain irrelevance when they are subsumed by “the big picture”—especially island populations which have held historically precarious and marginalized positions as isolated, distant, or insignificant to begin with (Hughes 2013, 572). Lying for the most part mere metres above sea level, the often
“exoticized” or “primitivized” Pacific Islands—including the Pacific Island country of Tuvalu—have an unstable collective identity (Mimura 1999, 140). This instability factors in detrimentally to the ability of these citizens to gain a certain recognition in international conversations. The significance of perpetuating certain visions of certain peoples is also damaging in that they are given a certain static and depersonalized image—one that drives the perception of helplessness and incapability that helps keep colonial power dynamics alive and well. It stands to reason that before there can be the comprehension and acceptance of equal human rights initiated by the migratory merging of “different worlds,” there must first be the comprehension and acceptance of “different worlds” as they currently are. Human rights progress, in this regard, is unfortunately hindered by fear of the unknown, unjustified assumptions, and ignorance in the present day (Terrell, Hunt, and Gosden 1997). Stripping away the superficial layers of difference in such visions of “palm trees and blue lagoons, jungle drums and [...] cannibals,” and “exotic fertility rites” that are still emblematic of the Pacific Islands reveals the individual livelihoods at stake (Terrell, Hunt, and Gosden 1997, 155). Many forms of human rights violations are mobilized by climate change, including more obvious, direct effects and the equally problematic but largely unacknowledged indirect effects—that much is clear; the politics of destabilization surrounding “the other,” however, are not quite so simple.

Given the “existential” tone of the threats promised by climate change, current climate change models are not only inconsistent, but inconsiderate when it comes to difference (Roscoe 2014, 535). The shadow cast by climate change is daunting, where it can be and has been analyzed using ways ranging from a philosophical lens, to a policy lens, to an economic lens, to a scientific lens. Is “human rights” just another lens? Human rights are evidently vulnerable in this literally and figuratively dynamic climate. From outright denial, to tireless activism, to the clashing of innumerable worldviews, it is clear that there is no solid ground upon which to base discussion of climate change; as far as human rights are concerned, this is further accentuated by the highly contested nature of the logistics of climate change and the extent of people’s struggle (Shue 2014). These sites of contestation contain so many different interests: corporate and political greed, sustainability and resource management, love of nature, et cetera, but it would be remiss to gloss over the complexity of human intentionality and morality. Are the CEOs of big oil companies inherently evil? What about, for instance, people who depend on working for oil and mining companies to feed their families (Shue 2014, 63)? Do they not have rights as well? Being a consumer is also laden with difficult choices to be made on a daily basis. Can the people who do not take part in “green” practices, including actions ranging from recycling to not driving a car, be viewed as intentionally harming others? Some people cannot even bring themselves to think about the future of climate change, as it is too overwhelming. Is this a matter of “intellectual and moral distancing,” or something more (Duong 2010, 1246)? The already blurry relationships between human beings in the context of climate change get even blurrier at these intersections—a uniquely challenging dilemma for not only situating human rights, but defining their parameters and making them enforceable. Along the same stream, where is the best place to target change from a human rights approach given that the future effects of climate change have already been set in motion, the “causes” un-localizable, un-eradicable, un-eliminable? While some sites of sea-level rise are thought to be mendable or reversible if we change immediately and drastically, no degree of action can prevent Tuvalu from being a “disappearing island” (Farbotko 2010). Examining to the notion of the “human” in human rights, then, also requires an examination of the notions of difference and change. It is to challenge the idea of restoring people’s livelihoods to what they once were, where, “[i]n the end, it will all come down to public communication” (Diemberger et al. 2012, 227). Human rights must be predicated on everyone changing, learning to “exist” with climate change; things will likely get worse before it gets better, forever requiring consistent hard work and sacrifice—but what does this really mean?
As an “affront to Western commonsense notions about the world and how things are,” being faced with “it could happen to me, too” is a much-needed shock to the system (Terrell, Hunt, and Gosden 1997, 187). Being careful not to lose sight of hope and resign ourselves to the direness of climate change is essential—the resilience demonstrated by the citizens of Tuvalu can certainly be learned from (Fiske et al. 2014). So, then, what can we learn about ourselves in the context of resilience? We hear the phrases, “displacement,” “climate refugees,” and “rising sea levels” and neglect the depth of implication for us as human beings—how vastly different coping mechanisms converge and take on whole new meanings: for instance, what suffering will be inherited by future generations (Shue 2014, 63). Anthropological work done in Tuvalu has shown that “local mechanisms” are key in understanding themes of survival, adaptation, and self-preservation; “the communication of this knowledge can be challenging, […] revealing […] how credible and actionable knowledge is produced and disseminated” (Barnes et al. 2013, 542). Do knowledge and experience, for instance, become more “credible” when the element of distance—in a familiar and geographical sense—is removed from the equation? Conceptualizing human rights in terms of everyone having them can be paralleled with the not-so-far-fetched idea of everyone losing them. Of all the conceptual problems affiliated with climate change, long-term temporality especially forces a critical confrontation between human rights, ethics, and “moral thresholds.” As previously mentioned, depersonalization of climate change issues and the people on the ground who face them renders a certain “invisibility” when it comes to the consequences of our actions; without the solidly affirmed “human,” an application of human rights based on intrinsic respect for one another is compromised (Gardiner et al. 2010, 165). After all, the discourse on “the right to life” itself is complex enough as it is (166). How do we face our connections to “home” and place when we could feasibly all be refugees? Or, perhaps more complexly, how does violating or compromising the integrity of the human rights of not-yet-born people in the future fare in terms of our compassion—where our own future children and grandchildren are involved, for instance? If we cannot or will not change for the sakes of ourselves and others in the present, can we for the sake of our descendants? Climate change seems to be all about “thresholds:” the threshold of how much damage can be done and carrying capacities, the threshold of value systems placed on human beings and the environment, and the threshold of compassion. But with thresholds come pressures—intrinsic and extrinsic—and feeling pressures may be exactly what a human rights framework needs. People who may not have had to face violations or adversity, or even consider their own human rights before, may be able to gain an appreciation for them. Tuvalu as an epicentre of the synergistic ideas that flow between human rights and climate change—its citizens’ lives in this context marked by “islandness, diplomacy, and vulnerability”—is also a site marker of both enlightenment and trepidation for the future (Hughes 2013, 576). For, in a seemingly endless battle between us and the world, and each other, how does a “right” way forward get facilitated?

**Conclusion**

There is no more a monolithic version of human rights than there is of climate change. The collision between the two concepts clearly provide many insights—some helpful, many challenging. It can be expected that what will occur in the future will transcend simply the tangible loss of land and resources, but a loss of footing in a new, emergent reality—both in how we treat one another and the planet and how we think about one another and the planet. At a core level, when it comes to rights, it is prudent to reflect on the notions of permanence and fleetingness, incorporating the idea of “home” as something importantly personal and yet profoundly shared. On the one hand, for the citizens of Tuvalu, home is something worth fighting for, where people do not want their lands to erode as much as their identities; rather than assuming the climate refugee status, citizens want their “identities” [to] be replaced with an acknowledgement of them as citizens of a sovereign, independent nation” (McNamara and Gibson 2009, 480). Proclaimed by an ambassador for the Pacific
countries in a discussion on international climate change, “We are not going to go quietly. There are human rights issues; there are sovereign rights issues that need to be looked at carefully” (481). Despite being “injured by the actions of others,” many Pacific islanders still “believe there is good will in the international community” (481; Oliver-Smith 2009, 125). The phrase “international community” connotes of the word “home” another meaning to consider. In many narratives, fictitious and real, the planet has been designated our shared home—the home of the human race. Are local and global meanings of “home” compatible? Perhaps this compatibility is the missing link regarding human rights and climate change, where notions of reconceptualization, sustainability, and circumstance can lead to harmony rather than dissidence. “Nobody wants to live outside their home and go and settle in another, unless of course you are really deprived of your fundamental rights,” another Pacific state ambassador has remarked (McNamara and Gibson 2009, 479). With this sentiment, it appears that an examination of human rights and climate change has come back to the subtext of the climate change narrative and the re-situating of “human” and “climate.” Climate change on a surface level is not an obscure issue, deliberately shrouded in secrecy from the public sphere; it needs not simply more support and recognition as a global ecological issue to produce justice. The truly problematic aspects of climate change, the ones that are “hidden in plain sight,” boil down to conceptualizing climate change as a human rights issue. The question is: will this (re)conceptualization happen before it is too late?

References


IN PURSUIT OF JUSTICE: INDIGENOUS EXPERIENCE & THE CANADIAN CRIMINAL JUSTICE SYSTEM

Kaitlyn Martin | University of Manitoba

**keywords** | Indigenous justice, criminal justice, restorative justice, retributive justice, youth, cultural practice, incarceration, circle sentencing

**abstract** | Indigenous experience within the Canadian criminal justice system has a lengthy, complex history. In Canada, criminal justice practices cannot be considered independent from past colonialism and context. Previously published statistics show that Indigenous individuals are incarcerated at roughly eight times the national rate of non-Indigenous individuals, with high rates extending to Indigenous youth. The research presented focuses on the concept of restorative justice as an approach to crime in response to the over-incarceration of Indigenous populations. Specifically, the subject of analysis is on how restorative justice programs, such as circle sentencing, can be utilized to halt the cycle of incarceration of at-risk Indigenous youth. Restorative justice and its holistic nature offer considerations for alternative justice and subsequently Indigenous culture. In order to examine these complex connections in depth, the research highlights the history of Indigenous law and justice, Western contemporary law, and contrasts Indigenous experience in a retributive system and a restorative system. Previously published case studies and academic source material are utilized to construct the hypothesis that when applied properly, restorative justice is a viable option for the insertion of cultural expression into the legal system, therefore generating culturally relevant and functional methods of managing criminal behaviour.

Examining Indigenous experience within the Canadian criminal justice system reveals a lengthy, complex history. A justice system, in its most basic form, is a set of practices that are used to identify and respond to criminal behaviour (McNamara & Burns 2009). In Canada, these practices cannot be considered independent from their storied past of colonialism and context. Indigenous individuals are convicted and incarcerated at roughly eight times the national rate of non-Indigenous individuals, with high rates extending to Indigenous youth as well (Blackburn 2007). By placing Western “retributive” justice at odds with “restorative” justice, a dichotomy emerges. This essay will argue that restorative justice, a theoretical and philosophical approach to crime, can be used in response to the over-incarceration of Indigenous populations in Canada. Specifically, this argument will consider how the implementation of restorative justice programs, such as circle sentencing, can be utilized to halt the cycle of incarceration with regards to at-risk Indigenous youth. Restorative justice and its holistic nature offer consideration for alternative justice and subsequently Indigenous culture that is not fully accommodated within the current Canadian system. After the examination of case studies and academic source material, it is revealed that when applied properly, restorative justice is a viable option for the insertion of cultural expression into the legal system, therefore generating culturally relevant and functional methods of managing criminal behaviour. By approaching this through a multifaceted anthropological lens, greater awareness can be directed towards matters that a strictly legal approach may disregard.

Over the last several decades, anthropology has widened its scope to incorporate studies surrounding the negative effects of colonialism and imperialism. Moving beyond early endeavours to observe Indigenous groups in isolation, the historical relationships with colonizers have been placed in a new academic spotlight. A discourse of reparation and reconciliation, especially in relation to Indigenous populations in Canada is of the utmost importance when attempting to comprehend systemic and social intersections. As Indigenous rights come to the forefront, evidenced by the development of 2007’s United Nations Declaration on the Rights of
Indigenous Peoples (UNDRIP), we must situate ourselves within contemporary concerns. In order to holistically frame the complications surrounding Indigenous populations, we are required to conduct an on-going inquiry into institutions which may contribute to future problems (Clemmer 2014). For this reason, the institution examined will be the Canadian criminal justice system. Institutions which have the potential to suppress the desired and justified rights of Indigenous populations should be critically analyzing in order to conceptualize solutions, promoting the further development of Indigenous rights.

**Introducing an Alternative Theoretical Approach: What is Restorative Justice?**

Despite being initially introduced to the social sciences by psychologist Robert Eglash in *Creative Restitution* (1959), “restorative” justice has had a lengthy history in many worldwide practices. It was not until decades later that serious considerations of restorative justice methods took hold again, this time as a response to the shortcomings and costs of conventional justice (Morris 2002). In theory, restorative justice aims to join together victim, offender, and community into a productive decision-making process. The methods used to implement restorative justice can vary, but the overall objectives are similar. Holding the offender accountable, healing harm and deciding consequences by group consensus are several basic principles. Many practices involving restorative justice are at odds with conventional norms of Western criminal justice systems, making their implementation controversial in some fields. In contrast to common Western methods, restorative processes remove the ultimate decision-making power from state authority, returning it to the people most affected by the transgression (Morris 2002). That is not to say that restorative justice is detached from the legal system, as court-appointed judges, lawyers, or therapists are often still involved, albeit often in different roles.

Canada has previously supported applications of restorative justice, at the UN Commission on Crime Prevention and Criminal Justice, Canada encouraged countries to implement *Basic Principles on the Use of Restorative Justice Programmes in Criminal Matters* (Skelton 2007). Basic principles forged by UN experts legitimize the guidelines and standards around the practice of restorative justice inside of a legal configuration, promoting its usage. Following proper guidelines, justice that focuses on social, emotional, or even spiritual well-being can function more inclusively around Indigenous populations and their wishes. Applications such as these enable the victims to disclose the harm and the consequences they have experienced, while the offender can listen and be held accountable. Amends can be made beyond a strictly legal realm through a variety of ways including apologies, material repayment, community work, or even incarceration. In theory, any outcome has the capability of being restorative if it is reached by consensus.

Interestingly, restorative justice approaches are consistent within many values that have been established throughout Canadian Indigenous groups. For this reason, it will be emphasized that restorative justice can be effectively implemented without disregarding Indigenous needs and rights to cultural practice. Instead, it can be exercised *within* Indigenous understandings of justice in conjunction with the law.

**Indigenous Conceptions of Law and Justice: The Effects of Colonialism**

Prior to colonialization, Indigenous populations had a mature, developed governance structure with methods of social control used throughout their history (Monchalin 2016). Theoretically, the pursuit of Indigenous justice placed itself in a value system at odds with European principles. As a result, it may have been possible for colonial settlers to incorrectly assume that Indigenous communities lived without any sense of law or justice at all. There existed no uniformed police officers, no prisoners in jail cells, and no lengthy legal documents to define how the law was to be enforced (Monchalin 2016). Despite appearances, communities had highly developed ways of handling and resolving conflicts unique to their respective worldviews regardless of possible assumptions made by colonizers. It is significant to note that not all indigenous groups confine themselves
within a homogenous cultural fabric. There is no "Pan-Indian" understanding of justice. Generalizations, especially in anthropological examinations, can be detrimental to appreciating the intricacies of cultural processes.

With this cautionary note in mind, several commonly shared values across many Indigenous groups can be further explored. These basic values consist of balance, harmony, respect, and the overall emphasis on the importance of human relationships (Monchalin 2016). It would be erroneous to assume that these concepts are identical universals across groups. Instead, they should be conceptualized as foundational. Similar base principles can be found across many aspects of everyday life, especially when informing responses to conflict or deviant behaviour.

Acknowledging Indigenous values is crucial to analyzing how justice is meant to operate in Indigenous contexts. "Law-breaking" in Indigenous justice is a result of a violation of these values, which in turn must be restored. Monchalin (2016) notes, Swampy Cree elders view the pursuit of justice with the ultimate goal of healing, not punishment. Justice was intended to rebalance and alleviate harm that the offender has inflicted. Punishment alone could not address this. The community would involve themselves in the process of recreating balance, while the emphasis on human relationships meant that harm affected not only victims directly but the wider social circle by proxy. It is only appropriate then that the wider community is actively involved in problem-solving, as deciding on ultimate consequences in collaboration is logically justified.

As cultural norms within these values vary across Indigenous communities, so did the prescribed responses to crime. The importance placed on relationships meant that socially affective consequences could include shaming, avoidance, or removal from the community. Apologies or material reparation would likewise be acceptable in certain situations. A common misunderstanding around Indigenous justice is the perceived lack of serious consequences. The Indigenous Justice Implementation Commission notes in the event of a severe violation, physical force or death penalties historically could have been implemented (Monchalin 2016). As an example, members of the Tsilhqot’in nation may have faced death if they threatened the waterways that the community relied upon for their livelihood. Additionally, consequences of murder in Lakota and Crow communities were decided upon privately by the families involved, while in Blackfoot societies compensation could be expected by taking the life of the murderer, or a relative (Monchalin 2016). If violations occurred between different cultural groups, a mix of various methods may be used in response, as to be determined in consensus by those involved.

Retrospective examination reveals that Western ideologies introduced and placed upon Indigenous peoples by settlers were not guided by the same goals or even exist within these same structures. Pimental (2010) offers the case of a 19th-century murder in Dakota territory, that after deliberation, the offender was to offer material reparation to the victim’s family and began reintegration back into the community at the family’s request. European settlers in the area were “aghast” at the perceived injustice of this sentence, despite it being the wishes of those most affected (Pimental 2010, 33). Western justice is by nature adversarial and retributive, guided by legal notions of objective positivism (Zion, 2005). “Retributive” justice, in contrast to restorative, is defined as a punishment-centred reaction to the violation of a law (Wenzel & Okimoto 2016). Punishment sanctioned by some authoritative third-party stands as a foundational and philosophical difference between the two systems. Approaching legal misconduct as an act that cannot be undone, retributive justice seeks additional action against the offender and the offence itself.

In order to frame this approach at a philosophical level, deontology, a rule-based moral system can be briefly considered. Deontology refers to an ethical duty to take a certain course of action (endorsed by law) based on the crime itself, rather than its consequences. While this is not strictly how Western justice operates, it is useful to highlight its potential reasoning. Specifically, in relation to crime, the prescribed response requires punishment (Wenzel & Okimoto 2016). As Hannah Arendt supposes, moral and legal channels
are not one and the same, but rather are affiliated through the notion of judgement (Arendt 2003). Judgements, like morals, are socially informed. In a Western conventional justice system, judgement and punishments are determined and sanctioned by laws, supported by a moral and social fabric which upholds those laws. A deontological stance here informs us that punishment and retributive actions are required to restore justice through legally defined means, therefore making punishment such as incarceration morally viable by common Western standards (Sandberg 2013). This stricter emphasis on hard-coded laws with respect to selecting punishment sets retributive justice apart from the flexibility of restorative justice, which does not rely as heavily on actions and their predetermined reactions. If one was to remove “law” and instead substitute “principles of social rebalancing”, you may approach something more akin to Indigenous justice, yet not quite. An in-depth debate of morals within law and punishment is beside the point. It is also beyond this essay to challenge the theoretical and moral basis of Western retributive justice, as aspects of this system function well to meet certain needs of Canadian society. Instead, it will be argued that from the standpoint of cultural and historical reflection, retributive justice may not be the most appropriate strategy for managing Indigenous needs appropriately.

Aspects of Indigenous tradition and culture simply do not fit into legal epistemic standards that demand inflexible objectivity (Connolly 2006). Criminal behaviour in a Western sense is a violation of the law, and therefore by extension, an act against the state itself. This system removes the crucial offender-victim relationship in Indigenous justice, replacing it with an offender-state relationship. Arguably, this is a “theft” of conflict, removing the emphasis on the victim(s) (Calhoun 2013). Retributive justice seeks to declare innocence or guilt through facts. However, wrongdoings removed from contextual social dynamics may not be so objective (Calhoun 2013). Several other subtle aspects separate retributive justice from restorative approaches, such as the nature of rehearsed communication in court, which limits victim and offender participation. Representation by strangers (e.g. lawyers) rather than family or friends loses contextual and social value. Although retributive justice is effective in extreme cases when protecting the public is essential, it may overlook aspects of social injustice and context crucial to reaching a holistically-informed decision.

The consideration of social justice is pivotal in multiple ways as retributive justice and its potential lack of social justice awareness enact a two-fold disservice onto Indigenous populations. First, ignoring social justice ignores the core values of many Indigenous groups. Additionally, not acknowledging social justice ignores context valuable to understanding the vulnerability of Indigenous populations in Canada. Colonialization did not only bring an alternative method of justice to Canada but additionally introduced circumstances under which Indigenous populations suffered. With the occurrence of colonization, oppression and trauma soon followed. Trauma transforms as it is passed down intergenerationally, reinforced by structural racism both past and present. This process produces a complex web of risk factors, which can ultimately result in high rates of Indigenous crime (Monchalin 2016). The connection between past Canadian policies and Indigenous crime rates cannot be ignored when looking at the situation holistically. It is erroneous to assume that Indigenous populations are innately more criminal. Visualizing social injustice means exploring beyond the statistics.

One of the most impactful and visible horrors enacted against Indigenous peoples in Canada’s history was the use of residential schools. Following the 1867 legislation policy, An Act of Gradual Civilization, institutions designed to assimilate Indigenous populations arose (Wadden 2008). Developed with the vision of re-educating and re-socializing Indigenous children, residential schools began operating around 1879, by 1920 it was required by law for Indigenous children to be removed from their families in order to attend (Milloy 1999; Wadden 2008). Dr. P.H. Bryce, former Chief Medical Officer of the Indian Department submitted a shocking report to the department in 1922, claiming that diseases ran rampant throughout these schools. With another first-hand source supposing that
“fifty percent of children who passed through these schools did not live to benefit from the education which they had received therein” (Milloy 1999, 72).

In a modern case study involving residential school survivors, almost all (90 percent) of individuals had suffered abuse in residential schools, while roughly half (49 percent) had been convicted of some offence following their release. Here, the connection between residential schools and high crime rates cannot be ignored. The widespread effects of child abuse, on both physical and emotional health, did not halt with the eventual closure of these schools in 1996, as it is estimated that 86,000 former students are still struggling with the consequences today (Wadden 2008). Two hundred years of policy aimed to eliminate Indigenous people has taken its toll, leading to the current apodictic realities of abuse and disarray. As previously mentioned, intergenerational legacies from these schools, alongside other complications, can combine to produce well-known risk factors for predicting future criminal behaviour.

Indigenous Incarceration in Contemporary Society

Jackson (2002) poignantly illustrates the ongoing affiliation between past and present, “Prison has become for many young native people the contemporary equivalent of what Indian residential school represented for their parents” (Jackson 2002, 103). This analogy implies that residential schools, and now prisons are common facts of Indigenous life, existing to oppress and contain Indigenous people and culture within their walls. As a result, these two institutions cannot be weighed completely independent of one another.

In 2011, Indigenous individuals composed only 4.3 percent of the population but represented a shockingly high number of prison inmates across Canada. In Manitoba, Stony Mountain Penitentiary’s inmate population is over half Indigenous (Monchalin 2016). These inmates tend to receive longer sentences, spend more time in maximum security, and are less likely to be granted parole. These statistics extend to youth, with Indigenous minors being up to sixteen times more likely to be incarcerated than non-Indigenous in Manitoba. In a one-day “snapshot study” of 229 youth facilities across Canada, 33 percent of youth were Indigenous (Latimer & Foss 2004). Despite crime rates falling in all provinces since 2001, prison admission rates are increasing (Neil, 2015). Concerns surrounding over-representation persist despite experimentation with policy changes and strategies, invoking questions around underlying issues that are not being effectively addressed by the criminal justice system.

There is a need for recognition of circumstances that encourage Indigenous involvement in criminal activities. Demonstrated by a study of Indigenous male inmates in Manitoba and Saskatchewan, many had experienced family violence, had at least one parent with substance abuse problems, and spent time in foster homes (Monchalin 2016). In prairie cities, where incarceration rates for Indigenous individuals can be seven to nine times higher than the average rate, there generally exists a more socio-economic disadvantage (Dickson-Gilmore 2005). Indigenous populations are more heavily concentrated in these urban areas, while simultaneously being segregated. Studying the causes and rates of Indigenous crime is ultimately difficult in Canada due to policy restrictions, creating an incomplete picture. The Canadian Centre for Justice Statistics does not differentiate between Indigenous and other populations with respect to sentencing statistics, additionally, there is a prohibition on collecting and reporting data in relation to race at the level of police arrests and court involvement, further complicating matters (Dickson-Gilmore 2005).

In 1996, responding to this issue, the Federal Government of Canada altered an existing law resulting in the development of “Section 718.2(e)” in the Criminal Code of Canada. This section specifically leaves space for alternative justice measures aside from imprisonment, “with particular attention to the circumstances of Indigenous offenders” (Berlin 2016). The later ruling in “R v. Gladue”, a criminal case involving an Indigenous domestic abuse victim, referenced this section of the Criminal Code of Canada, legitimizing the implementation of the section (Griffin 2007).

As a result, “Gladue Reports” can be conducted in order to include specific information including life
history, circumstances, and systemic factors that inform judges beyond the circumstances of the crime itself (Monchalin 2016). However, even today Gladue reports are not utilized nearly enough, with some Indigenous offenders unaware they exist (Edwards 2017). Arguably, it may be necessary to look beyond the offence itself and question how the legal system responds to it. A retributive justice approach like the one used primarily in Canada does not seem to effectively prevent, target, or stop the reoccurrence of criminal behaviour, as evidenced by rising incarceration rates.

Hollow Water, an Anishinabe First Nation community East of Lake Winnipeg is a useful example of healing from the inside, rather than ineffective intervention from outside. As Sawatsky (2009) notes, the community of Hollow Water was entirely devastated by the effects of colonialism and the disadvantages it perpetuated. "People stumbled around drunk in public. Women were bruised and beaten. Children cowered" (Wadden 2008, 87). Forced assimilation and historical violence caused internalized anger, loss of heritage, culture, and disrupted a functional way of life (Sawatsky 2009). Sexual victimization was especially rampant within the community in 1989, prompting the development of a Community Holistic Circle Healing (CHCH) (The Hollow Water First Nations Community Holistic Circle Interim Report 1994). Prior to these efforts, it was estimated that 60-80 percent of the community had suffered some form of sexual abuse (Swatsky 2009). The conventional justice system would punish offenders temporarily in order to protect the community but provided nothing to correct underlying matters. As a member of the community noted, “the easy thing is to just deny everything and go sit in jail for a couple of months” (Wadden 2008, 89). Clearly, conventional methods were not satisfactory or capable of rectifying the situation.

Judge Murray Sinclair of the Manitoba Provincial Court granted the community autonomy for handling this sexual abuse (Wadden 2008). Using a restorative approach within traditional methods, the CHCH protected the victim, ensured their safety, and removed them from situations if necessary. The project held the offender accountable through disclosure of the abuse in weekly meetings with therapists and specialists, providing support to both victim and offender. Several circles would take place with CHCH workers, nuclear families, and finally the whole community. The final circle additionally introduced an official court judge that provided an appropriate sentence with input from those involved (Wadden 2008). The community observed that working alongside the court system, these healing circles made their agenda clearer to presiding judges, integrating their own wishes in terms of sentencing outcomes, often seeking more socially-valuable alternatives to incarceration. By situating the CHCH between conventional justice and Indigenous values, special emphasis is placed on notions of healing and spirituality unique to the community. The efforts have proven to be convincing, with recidivism rates of roughly 2 percent (Coates et al. 2003). Today it is seen as one of the most well-matured and effective healing programs in Canada (Sawatsky 2009).

Introducing culture into attempts of healing is not a novel concept. A 2010 study of urban Indigenous individuals in Canada revealed that those involved in some aspect of community culture were less prone to substance abuse (Monchalin 2016). Martin Brokenleg, an expert on youth issues, suggests that intergenerational trauma can be countered by the reinstallation of Indigenous culture. Working with young Indigenous individuals specifically, the "Warrior Spirit Walking Project" aims to reclaim at-risk adolescents and provide a better future (Monchalin 2016). The project actualizes a sense of cultural identity and creates a meaningful social support network that may be missing, especially for urban youth. Adolescents can learn competence in achieving personal goals that lead to a sense of accomplishment and self-worth. Independence and generosity are also stressed. An Indigenous youth in similar circumstances notes, “I would like more teachings, classes to tell me about history, spiritual stuff, something to learn more about my culture” (Latimer & Foss 2004, 24). This form of “culturally safe” programming formulates roots to an identity that many Indigenous youths may be removed from. There is evidence to encourage cultural integration,
as communities who utilize projects such as, "Warrior Spirit Walking" have shown decreases in youth crime (Shantz 2010).

**Restorative Benefits for Indigenous Youth**

Focusing on at-risk youth, restorative justice is especially applicable and can offer a multitude of benefits. Just as Indigenous adults are over-represented within the criminal justice system, so too are Indigenous youth. On average, there is a 70 percent chance that a sixteen-year-old treaty-status youth will be incarcerated once by the age of twenty-five (Shantz 2010). The majority of offences by youth offenders are non-violent in nature (e.g. theft, breaking and entering) making restorative justice useful as an intervention method before criminal behaviours escalate in severity. Indigenous children and youth are especially disadvantaged by systemic issues, creating greater risk-factors that may lead to criminal behaviour. This reality is informed by historical policies as well as contemporary issues. Known as the "Sixties Scoop", roughly twenty thousand Indigenous children were removed from biological parents from 1960 to 1980, placing them with non-Indigenous families. While today up to 86 percent of children in the Canadian welfare system are Indigenous, demonstrating the disservice done to these families in disrupting a functional way of life (Mccraken et al. 2013).

Although many of these policies, including residential schools, no longer operate in Canada, other systemic issues perpetuate the problems faced by Indigenous youth such as negative family environments and substance-reliant parents. Maladaptive coping, substance abuse, anxiety and depression are side effects of such intergenerational trauma and should not be conceptualized as innate failings of individuals. As one Indigenous youth notes, "Don't drink and do drugs? It's pretty hard when that is what it is like at home" (Latimer & Foss 2004, 23). Additionally, behavioural patterns that are established in adolescence can persist into behaviours later in life, making intervention methods especially relevant to managing negative tendencies. Legal consequences in a conventional retributive system aim for a deterrent effect, however, adolescent crime rates across all Canadian youth prove to be persistent. Increasing the severity of sanctions has shown to have little to no effect, especially on youth crime (Bala & Lilles 2015).

Canada incorporates a distinct youth justice system that relies upon the *Youth Criminal Justice Act* (YCJA). This system recognizes that adolescents under eighteen may lack the maturity of their older counterparts, and attempts when possible, to divert youth out of the court system. The YCJA terms these diversion programs "extrajudicial measures". The YCJA creates an opening for the implementation of restorative justice practices through its emphasis on non-court methods, although these are under-utilized. Principles in Section 3 of the YCJA are largely consistent with values emphasized by restorative justice. Participation of youth and families in programs, instilling respect for societal values, repairing the harm done to the victim, and holding the offender responsible are all considered ideal by the YCJA and restorative approaches (Huculuk 2005). Section 5 of the YCJA lists several criteria that these extrajudicial measures must meet, all of which are satisfied by restorative justice. With special consideration of Indigenous youth, restorative methods can also introduce justice within a more contextualized cultural framework, giving notice of unique historical and personal background complications in addition to these other benefits.

The practical applications of restorative justice centre around three main categories; conferences, victim-offender mediations, and circles (Latimer et al. 2005). Conferences generally involve the family in an informal gathering, they do not always involve sentencing and can be used for intervention purposes (Crawford & Newburn 2003; Calhoun 2013). Victim-offender mediations involve joining the victim and offender in a discussion, mediated by a facilitator. The facilitator has no authority to force a settlement, but rather there to guide the conversation and encourage meaningful dialogue (Crawford & Newburn, 2003). Circles, as will be introduced, are often used to define consequences within conventional legal channels, involving criminal records. Depending on desired outcomes and the needs of those involved, different
forms may be preferred. However, the main components remain relatively consistent in each practice. Harm is seen as an organizing principle of the gathering, with the primary goal of holding the offender accountable in a way that is to be determined (Umbreit & Armour 2010). For the sake of brevity, sentencing circles will be examined in the most depth. Sentencing circles integrate restorative justice into already existing guidelines set by the criminal justice system. Both section 718.2(e) of the Criminal Code of Canada and the Youth Criminal Justice Act leave room for the use of sentencing circles when appropriate. Court judges ultimately impose the final sentence, however not until incorporating the recommendations of the circle. The Hollow Water Circle Healing program introduced earlier falls under this classification.

The process begins in most cases after a formal court referral. A chosen facilitator is responsible for bringing everyone together and ensuring safety, with dialogue soon following as a central aspect of the process. Restorative justice discourse is not a debate, but instead a collaborative conversation around a central topic (Umbreit & Armour 2010). It encourages authentic concerns to be voiced while increasing the capacity for others to listen. The content of the discussion can range from underlying causes of the crime, how the crime has changed the community, or how healing should take place (Lilles 2003). Here, context can be introduced and special consideration can be given to historical or personal complications that may not have otherwise been brought to light. The dialogue is critical when situating sentencing circles within Indigenous practices. Historically, circles like these would not be uncommon. Creating a conversation in order to reach consensus is a process that Monchalin (2016) asserts is a primary part of decision-making in an Indigenous worldview. Not only can aspects of cultural values be introduced, but dialogues can also incorporate contemporary disadvantages that many Indigenous face on a day-to-day basis. Following this dialogue, the group informs a court judge what outcome they wish to see, and the judge will then take into consideration the needs of the community. It may be criticized that judges are not required to conform to the wishes of the sentencing circle, however, their willingness to participate in circle proceedings demonstrate they likely find these processes valuable and will honour the wishes of the community to the best of their ability. Circle sentencing is not independent of the realm of conventional justice, instead, it works in collaboration.

Here, we can highlight the distinct points at which both conventional sentencing and circle sentencing diverge. Circle sentencing spatially changes the power dynamics of the court. Rather than a judge presiding at the head of the room, everyone is gathered into a physical circle, allowing for a sense of inclusive equality. As circle sentencing requires contributors to be equals, this physical organization is a subtle but practical way of introducing this crucial factor. A conventional court hearing attempts to see the “whole truth” of the situation, through witness testimony in front of the accused when possible. It is not dishonest to plead not-guilty and maintaining eye contact when communicating is interpreted as honesty.

Monchalin (2016) notes how these requirements conflict with Indigenous justice norms. Non-confrontational methods are preferred, and witness testimony in front of the accused does not fit here. In addition, “whole truths” are elusive when taking a holistic stance, making guilty or not-guilty more complex. It is dishonest to plead not guilty if responsible for a crime, with some theorists noting that this factor alone may contribute to higher levels of Indigenous incarceration (Monchalin 2016). Eye contact is not seen as honesty, but rather a sign of confrontation and disrespect. It is not difficult to visualize why these contrasting subtleties would be problematic in a conventional justice setting. Circle sentencing considers more aspects of Indigenous culture and justice, reducing tension between cultural norms that may go unnoticed or misinterpreted.

In order to examine circle sentencing in action, we can turn to the case of “T.D.P”, a fifteen-year-old Indigenous youth. T.D.P had no prior record before he committed multiple robberies and assaulted two victims over the span of one night with several other boys (Panko 2005). If tried as an adult, the youth would be facing a maximum of five years imprisonment for his actions. As the offences were not pre-mediated, Judge Whelan, who
presided over the case, made the decision to opt for a sentencing circle in order to reach a valuable decision. The Restorative Circle Initiative (RCI) was consulted to gather funding from the Department of Justice and tasked with organizing a sentencing circle. Panko (2005) maintains that this decision is both sanctioned and compatible with the YCJA. Circles such as these can allow for the sharing of information, which is what occurred between the offender himself, family members, and members of the community.

Youth, especially those at-risk often experience trouble communicating emotions in an effective manner. At first, the youth had refused to answer questions asked by the judge, which could have been easily misinterpreted as contempt for the process. However, over time this changed. The circle eventually offered useful information about the situation that may have not been otherwise available, given the initial hesitation of T.D.P to discuss his actions. The circle dialogue revealed the youth’s use of alcohol that night altered his capacity to grasp his actions, with T.D.P clarifying that without alcohol the events presumably would have not even occurred. The circle learned of the youth’s recent move from a reserve, and that he had been robbed at gunpoint shortly after settling into his new home, losing items of personal value. T.D.P’s mother offered her opinion that this event upset her son and contributed to his actions. The circle acted as a catalyst for discussing these circumstances that brought together a wide circle of people concerned with T.D.P’s actions. Judge Whelan argued that communication in a workable and open way facilitates proper understanding of context, which ultimately informed her decision (Panko 2005).

Judge Whelan eventually arrived at a sentence of probation, which is not common for similar offences, however, felt negative-peer influence was a major issue in this case, not the decisions of the offender alone. A number of factors were found to have occurred within a close timeframe in T.D.P’s life, leading to a lapse in judgement. Probation in this case effectively held T.D.P accountable, while offering a good chance of reintegration. Since T.D.P had a stable and supportive home life, this sentence would aid both the family and community to provide assistance. Following sentencing, RCI provided a mentor for T.D.P and along with his teachers at school, the mentor reported positive improvements in T.D.P’s life. He increased participation in cultural programs, academic pursuits, and sports (Panko 2005). It is questionable whether such an outcome would have occurred through other legal channels.

This leads to debates surrounding the effectiveness of restorative justice in the long-term. Multiple studies have shown promising results regarding reductions in reoffending (De Beus & Rodriguez 2007; Bonta et al. 2010; Maxwell & Morris, 2001; Latimer et al., 2005). Corrado et al. (2003) introduce several concepts which aim to predict youth reoffending; fairness of sentence, deterrence effects, persistent offending lifestyles and personal needs. When considering fairness, reoffending behaviour is dependent on the interpreted acceptability of the sentence that the youth receives. This is proportional to the youth’s understanding of the seriousness of their actions, which can be effectively integrated by restorative dialogue. Deterrence can be achieved in a similar way, through the reassertion of consequences and acceptance of responsibility. Restorative justice can also effectively target offending lifestyles and special needs as well, by creating specific consideration of circumstances and follow-up restorative techniques. It should be noted that while Corrado et al., (2003) introduces factors that can be met by restorative justice to eliminate reoffending behaviour, situations vary greatly, and theoretical applications may not have guaranteed outcomes.

However, the argument that restorative justice can reduce recidivism is supported by multiple other sources. Bonta et al. (2005) found that regardless of follow-up length, recidivism rates were lower when participants engaged in restorative justice programs, in contrast to probation alone. While Bergseth & Bouffard (2013) report that restorative programming may be applicable to a variety of youth offences, versus long-established juvenile court processes. This is backed by an Australian study, which found a 20 percent reduction of youth legal troubles following restorative conferencing (Maxwell & Morris 2001). Overall, reducing reoffending
seems to be targeted effectively by restorative justice, and at worst, recidivism is no more frequent than within conventional methods (Calhoun 2013).

Reoffending, however, is not the only determining factor in assessing the success of a restorative justice program. Victim studies are also valuable in determining levels of satisfaction, leading to a better understanding of what aspects of restorative justice works. Victim-participants are often satisfied with the outcome of restorative justice procedures, more so than with conventional justice (Van Camp & Wemmers 2013). Flexibility, an opportunity for dialogue, and pro-social motives such as healing likely contribute to overall satisfaction. As Van Camp & Wemmers (2013) note, victims often experienced less fear and anger after restorative conflict resolution. As with recidivism studies, victim satisfaction must be further explored with relation to what characteristics of restorative methods work better than others to further develop appropriate programs and guidelines.

**Conclusion**

In relation to Indigenous youth, considering these programs in Canada is especially valuable. Given the existing data, studies are likely to reveal long-term benefits for both offenders and communities while highlighting potential shortcomings that require attention. The collaborative efforts of restorative justice in Indigenous communities with the reintroduction of cultural teachings is also likely to beget long-term healing and social benefits. That is not to ignore wider socio-economic or systemic issues Indigenous populations face but rather function as one pathway towards recovery in a long journey. Starting with youth is especially practical, as it provides a way to end the cycle of incarceration before it begins, essentially managing a problem before it exists. Caution must be taken with the implementation of restorative programs, just as with any new theoretical applications. It is essential to avoid overgeneralizing culture or forcing these methods into inappropriate cases. The goal is the appropriation of these programs, not an imposition. If conducted properly, restorative justice may be able to offer Indigenous communities something that the conventional criminal justice system cannot.

There is still much progress to be made in the pursuit of integrating restorative justice into Indigenous communities. Restorative justice, and a foundational change in the way the Canadian justice system manages Indigenous crime arguably has great benefits towards the recognition of Indigenous cultures. Full recognition of Indigenous culture includes recognition of Indigenous justice. Healing and restorative efforts require proper dialogues between Indigenous populations and the rest of Canada if legitimacy is to ever be achieved. Indigenous culture itself, given the space to be practiced may have healing effects to counteract the assimilation efforts of colonialism. For this reason, Indigenous justice and restorative methods together must be taken seriously as a way for cultural self-determination to occur. Healing justice, if implemented correctly has the potential for long-term benefits for not only Indigenous peoples but other marginalized or disadvantaged groups, making the exploration of these changes valuable on a global stage.

These factors of rights, culture, and the legal system intersect in ways that are not immediately obvious. Historical factors are often disregarded when examining contemporary issues, but with regards to Indigenous peoples, they are of the utmost importance. Anthropology as a discipline has advantages when striving towards improvement in these areas. Cultural acknowledgement, sensitivity and the emphasis on holistic understandings are what must be understood if alterations are to be made in the dominant criminal justice system. Taking a practical stance, adolescents and youth are an excellent place to begin before socially dangerous cycles of violence and incarceration can take hold. The notion is not to challenge the current system as it stands, but rather encourage a multiplicity of understandings when it comes to what “justice” really means in varying contexts. Through an anthropological holistic stance, efforts towards the implementation of restorative justice not only allows for progress to be made for Indigenous rights but also cultural rights as a whole.
References


Latimer, Jeff. & Laura Casey Foss. 2004. A One-day Snapshot of Indigenous Youth in Custody across Canada Phase II. Ontario: Department of Justice Canada.


CUBAN WOMAN PARADOX: THE CONDITIONAL ADVANCE OF WOMEN’S RIGHTS THROUGH THE REVOLUTION & ITS REPERCUSSIONS

Elizabeth Walker | University of Manitoba

**keywords** | women's rights, Cuba, identity, revolution

**abstract** | This paper will explore the effects of the symbolic linking of women to the revolution, facilitated by the Federation of Cuban Women, from the perspective of healthcare.

“From the first day of the revolution, what it meant to be female began to change.” (Yolanda Ferrer quoted in Espín et al. 2012, 203)

In 1959 Fidel Castro led revolutionary forces to overthrow the Cuban dictatorship establishing a socialist society in a movement known as the Cuban Revolution. Shortly thereafter, the Federation of Cuban Women (FMC) was formed in 1960, consisting of Cuban women who wanted greater participation in the revolution. Through the FMC women were able to carve themselves a significant niche in the revolution. This allowed them not only “to participate in the Revolution,” but also to “have had a significant role in shaping it” (Kirk 2017, 30). This participation was made possible because women’s equality aligned ideologically with socialist orthodoxy (Lutjens 1995, 102). Women became a locus of ideological rhetoric and as a result have experienced many changes from the 1960s to the present day. Andaya describes this as a “key symbol of socialist morality and modernity” (Andaya 2014, 35). This paper will explore the effects of the symbolic linking of women to the revolution, facilitated by the FMC, from the perspective of healthcare. The healthcare system in Cuba offers many insights about Cuban women due to its history, which deeply intertwines with the FMC. Beyond this historical relationship, healthcare and women share interesting parallels within the context of the revolution. Both have been promoted and prized by the Cuban government as indicators of social progress, and thus revolutionary success (Warman 2001, 314; Andaya 2014, 24). Both have suffered in the post-Soviet era of economic devastation (Warman 2001), and healthcare continues to play a role in redefining Cuban women. Due to their historical and symbolic link to the revolution, ‘liberated’ women of the post-Soviet era find themselves in a precarious position of shifting symbolic meaning. This position is actively negotiated through the use of the healthcare system, rejection of medical professions, and subversions to ideological norms regarding healthcare.

Working through the revolution, the FMC helped to advance women’s issues and status by linking women to the revolution symbolically. The healthcare system offers insights into the ways in which this symbolic link helped to reinforce both the revolution and women’s status within the revolution. This led to tensions in the post-Soviet era, and also allowed women to navigate those tensions by negotiating their position relative to the healthcare system.

The FMC and Women as a Symbol

In the first years of Revolutionary Cuba, the FMC established women as a symbol for the revolution, thus also creating a symbolic link between the advancement of the revolution to the advancement of women. Andaya suggests that this is rooted in idealism of the early Revolutionary government, who “assumed a homology between what they defined as the interests of women and the interests of society” (2014, 25). These blended interests extended to the issue of national reputation on a global scale; as Cervera explains:

[In] international forums, any country that finds itself involved in a genuine process of
economic and social development must include among its objectives the full incorporation of women under conditions of equality into education and social, economic, cultural, and political life. (Cervera 1996, 88)

The Federation of Cuban Women was the social organization that fit this dual function of promoting the state, and promoting women, who thereby promoted each other. The FMC dates back to the first year of the revolution, when loosely organized groups of female supporters of the revolution consolidated in 1960 to establish the FMC, which branched into local factions countrywide (Espín et al. 2012, 191-197). According to Johnson, "it identifies itself as a nongovernmental, grassroots organization; its main purpose has been to increase women's participation in politics and society; and its main source of revenue is membership dues" (2011, 48).

Johnson rejects the rendering of the FMC as an instrument for the state, arguing that this notion suggests that any policy devised by the FMC merely adheres to "predetermined and enduring political configurations" and as a result "there is no independent policy process that includes the possibility of participation from competing actors" (2011, 36). According to Johnson, studies conducted about the FMC should acknowledge that "leaders of the FMC are not merely mechanisms for socialist legitimation" but are actively pursuing their own agenda for women's rights (2011, 38). However, it is important to recognize the revolutionary roots of the FMC and its association with the revolution to understand the roles of women in Cuban society today. Many scholars note that the women's movement in Revolutionary Cuba did not resemble or conform to Western Feminism (cf. Kirk 2017, 30; Andaya 2014, 24; Bengelsdorf 1985, 36; cf. Espín et al. 2012, 225). According to Kirk (2017), "Cuban feminism (as expressed by and through the FMC), particularly in the 1960s and 1970s, focused on equal participation in the Revolution, and its development" (30). This aligned with Fidel Castro's view of women as an untapped resource that, if organized properly, could be "used to advance the Revolution" (Kirk 2017, 30). Kirk (2017) suggests that rather than focusing on gender equality, the FMC dedicated itself to "promoting participation throughout the revolutionary process, above all" (Kirk 2017, 30). This fact has been confirmed Vilma Espín, leader of the FMC (Espín et al. 2012, 225). Therefore, within the FMC's position as "proponents of equal participation of men and women at all levels of society," (Andaya 2014, 25-27) there is still the implicit understanding that men and women occupy different gendered, social categories (Kirk 2017, 30; Bengelsdorf 1985, 41). For example, Lutjens notes "neither motherhood nor traditions of femininity have been rejected by Cuban women," (1995, 105) and thus the nuanced sociocultural implications and understandings of these categories are perpetuated. As elaborated by Salper who travelled to Cuba during the 1970s:

Cuban women did not organize among themselves to fight for an issue or to oppose male-controlled institutions, as American feminists did. Unlike [American feminists], she was not fighting to achieve legal and economic equality with men and bring about major structural changes in a government. Rather, she sought to acquire the skills she needed to help consolidate a revolution. Cuban men and women condemned Cuban sexism and machismo, but it was little more than lip service. (2014, 122)

The FMC, whether truly operating separately from the government or not, allowed for the symbolic linking of womanhood to the Revolutionary ideology, producing an icon: the "New Woman" as Andaya has termed it (2014, 24; cf. Espín et al. 2012, 206). Thus, women's role in the revolution was politicized from the very beginning, and their participation became a symbol for Revolutionary validity, regardless of the FMC's 'true' motives. How women have negotiated between this symbolic position and the realities of gender inequality will be returned to later in this paper. First however, the link between the FMC, women, and healthcare must be explored.
**FMC and Healthcare**

The healthcare system offers an interesting point of entry at the intersection of the issues of women's status, and the revolution, because through the FMC women became intrinsically linked to the healthcare system. Firstly, the FMC established programs for “health education and vaccination” employing women and young adolescent girls to bring these initiatives to impoverished rural areas (Warman 2001, 313; cf. Espín et al. 2012, 233). These educational programs enjoyed high levels of female participation (Warman 2001, 313). Secondly, access to free education allowed more women to pursue high status medical careers that were previously inaccessible (Warman 2001, 317). The system of primary state healthcare consists of “three levels of care”, which necessitate medical professionals throughout urban and rural Cuba (Birch and Norlander 2007, 76). These are: Health guardians (neighborhood-based physician nurse teams), Polyclinics (community-based multispecialty clinics), and Hospitals (acute care facilities) (Birch and Norlander 2007, 76).

Salper comments on the prevalence of polyclinics in recounting an emergency medical situation during a bus trip in rural Cuba:

> A couple of days into the trip I began to have terrible stomach problems. I told [the person in charge of the group] and he said, "No problem, we will find a doctor right away." He instructed the driver to turn left after 2 kilometers. Where would we find a doctor in this isolated rural place? Fifteen minutes later, we stopped in front of a low, one story stucco building, and the lone construction on a road narrower than the one we had just turned off of. Over the entrance, painted in green, was the word Clínica. (2014, 117)

In this example it is apparent that quality medical services were available even in rural areas of Cuba. Additionally, to the surprise of the researcher, the head doctor of this clinic was a woman (2014, 117). This is an example of the “‘feminization’ of the medical profession” wherein healthcare professions were dominated by women (qtd. in Warman 2001, 317), even more so than in the historical context of women in healthcare (Espín et al. 2012, 237). Thirdly, the healthcare system was also gendered in terms of its patients, because women were the target demographic for many educational initiatives promoted by the FMC for maternal and sexual health (cf. Johnson 2011, 42; Kirk 2017, 29). One of the results of these health education campaigns is the formation of a body of “highly medically literate” citizens throughout Cuba (Brotherton 2008, 260). Therefore, it is astounding yet not unprecedented that “100 percent of women receive prenatal care and 100 percent receive health care by trained personnel at delivery” as a result of these initiatives (Johnson 2011, 42). Furthermore, a 1987 survey reported that “98.7 percent of women of childbearing age (15-49) knew some method of birth control” which can be attributed to the FMC’s campaigns (Cervera 1996, 91). Another gendered key characteristic of the FMC’s effects on the medical system was the “development of the legal right to safe and free abortions, access to contraceptives, and the overall development of sexual education across the island” (Kirk 2017, 29).

More broadly, Cervera attributes the “marked decline” in fertility levels to “the quantitative and qualitative leap in the social, educational, and economic participation of the female population” (1996, 96). The infant mortality rate in Cuba dropped from 60 deaths to 7.9 deaths per thousand live births in just over three decades (Warman 2001, 316). As far as the FMC was concerned, the speed of women’s economic and social advances in the thirty years between 1960 and 1990—advances measured by education, employment, *infant and maternal mortality rates*, and other gauges—allowed Cuban women to conquer a degree of equality that it took women in the United States and other industrialized capitalist countries more than a century and a half to achieve.” (Espín et al. 2012, 33, emphasis mine)
Johnson posits that access to safe and legal abortion was another way in which Cuba surpassed the United States on the world stage, and can “be explained at least in part as a response to human rights commitments, as well as the concern that deaths from illegal abortion would result in international embarrassment” (2011, 41-42).

In the global context, the FMC employed human rights discourses to legitimate the revolution and secure rights for women through the Convention on the Elimination of Discrimination against Women and the UN Convention on the Rights of the Child (UNCRC) (Johnson 2011, 40). Cuba is both a signatory of this convention, and is more generally, “active in the United Nations on issues concerning women’s and reproductive rights” (Johnson 2011, 40). Both women and the healthcare system have been indicators of Revolutionary success, by providing the statistics, and enabling entry into human rights discourses.

The Cuban Woman Paradox

The statistics show an overall improvement in health and inclusion of women in education and the workforce. However, the lived experiences of women in post-Soviet Cuba produce a newfound tension between their continuing positions as symbols of the revolutionary success and the reality of struggle in all areas of life, including the health sector. The post-Soviet era, beginning in 1990, has become a locus of much scholarly study and scrutiny. This marked the dawn of economic crisis in Cuba as their major trading partner the Soviet Union dissolved, causing a critical blow to the Cuban economy with the loss of “billions of dollars of subsidies” (Brotherton 2008, 262-263; cf. Lutjens 1995, 106; Andaya 2014; Warman 2001, 317; Johnson 2011, 41). While the state medical system was not immune to the effects, the infrastructure somehow remained among the highest ranking in the world, a phenomenon that Birch and Norlander deem “the Cuban Paradox” (2007; cf. Johnson 2011, 39). In their analysis, they explore the nuances of this “first-world primary health care system operating in a country with third-world economies,” by scrutinizing the structural and infrastructural components of the system (Birch and Norlander 2007, 75). The gender aspect, which is largely ignored in their analysis, is filled in by Warman’s ethnography of women in the healthcare system (2001).

Through different aspects of the healthcare sector, it is apparent that women, including female medical professionals, are consistently bearing the brunt of the burden of the economic disaster. “Health-guardians” as Birch and Norlander termed them, are community doctors who live among their patients and attend to their medical needs (76, 2007; cf. Warman 2001). This job places immense strain on women who are afforded extremely little privacy, and placed under harsh scrutiny due to their symbolic position as mediators between the government and Cuban citizens (Warman 2001, 318). Indeed, Espín refers the family doctor as “the human face of the revolution” (2012, 233). Warman points to a combination of factors for why this occurs. Firstly, is the reality of the “medically literate” citizen body, many of whom have experienced decades of exceptional medical care and thus have high expectations of their medical system (Brotherton 2008, 266; Warman 2001, 317). Secondly, the reality of the economic crisis has resulted in a chronic lack of supplies and medicine to give to the expectant population (Brotherton 2008, 266; Warman 2001, 317). Thirdly, the medical professionals’ position as an intermediary between the economically suffering citizens, and the government, causes women to be circumstantially burdened with the frustrations of citizens who may resort to verbal attacks of character, or interruptions in the doctors’ home lives (Warman 2001, 316). Female doctors and nurses serve as double symbols of the state, as liberated working women and the distributors of state healthcare. This is a precarious position to be in, in the context of systemic healthcare and economic decline.

Mothers are also at risk during this period of economic strife to increased burdens of caring for the family, while also remaining the mascot for the revolution as progressive, working women. Andaya’s ethnographic account provides valuable insights into the tension between the state infrastructure and the lived experiences of Cuban women through the interaction between a nurse and a mother pregnant with another child;
Like all pregnant women in Cuba, Gisela received special prenatal rations that included additional milk and yogurt allotments. Yet given Gisela’s continued insufficient weight gain, [the prenatal care nurse] Janet suspected that she was giving away her supplementary rations rather than consuming them herself. The recipient, Janet believed, was Gisela’s daughter, who had recently turned seven years old and had thus become ineligible for the additional dairy rations that the state provides to young children. While most families were able to supplement their older children’s diet with food purchased outside the ration system, this family’s tight household economy forced Gisela to choose between nourishing herself and her daughter. (Andaya 2014, 2)

The nurse “intervened” in this situation by sending the mother to a maternity care hospital in order to “relieve her from the responsibility of nurturing her existing child” and to focus on gaining weight (Andaya 2014, 2). This interaction between two Cuban women, one medical and one not, reveals the interplay between the state and women through healthcare. The nurse is frustrated, because she needs to perpetuate the state healthcare system and its ideologies despite economic decline, and her patient is subverting these ideologies by allocating her food rations in an unsanctioned manner, risking the health of her baby, and herself. This illustrates a snapshot of the growing tension and uncertainty within the notion of the “New Woman” as a symbol for the revolution’s success. Women who have suffered economic devastation are less concerned about participating in the Revolution as they are about preserving what is important to them.

**Negotiating Female Identity in Changing Cuba**

Abortion in Cuba represents an area of tension because it combines two symbolic aspects of socialist Cuba in a way that is unfavourable in the eyes of the government. As indicated earlier, following the Revolution, life expectancy climbed significantly while fertility rate fell “below replacement levels” (Cervera 1996, 87). Johnson argues that abortion in Cuba “is not a stigmatized procedure” and is indicative of the government’s human rights consciousness, and their attention to Cuba’s global reputation (2011, 41). However, Andaya points to discontent from the state toward current abortion rates, and rather examines the social function of abortion for women (2014, 69-74). According to Andaya “state policies towards the uplift and modernization of both women and society have at times also inadvertently fostered the construction of sexual and reproductive cultures that are now defined as traditional, irresponsible, and risky” (2014, 73). Andaya cites for example the case of a forty-one year old woman who boasts of her twenty-four abortions by saying “I’m a modern woman…I follow the modern norms of developed countries” (2014, 69). Bélanger describes current practices of contraceptive use of abortion as an “abortion culture” whereby pregnancy termination is viewed as “a legitimate means of avoiding and spacing births” (2009, 14). In fact, Vázquez found that “40% of all pregnancies were voluntarily interrupted” (2015, 493). Surprisingly, women who had no children were less likely to abort a pregnancy than those that already had two children, (2015, 499) a pattern that supports Bélanger’s position that abortion is a means of family planning rather than a last resort method (2014). According to Andaya this practice has “elicited sustained state, academic, and medical disapproval about the seemingly irresponsible sexual and reproductive practices that heighten women’s reproductive risk (2014, 72). Moreover, “official discourse about abortion is dominated by anxious speculation about women’s apparent willingness to risk their health through multiple abortions” (Andaya 2014, 69). This seems to represent for the state and others, an uncomfortable perversion of the ideologies that both enabled these options for women, and produced the institutions that provide them. This practice subverts ideas of traditional as the antithesis to modern by conflating modern policies with practices that appear to be rooted in old-fashioned thinking, yet prove to be more complex (Andaya 2014, 74). This phenomenon illustrates how women are challenging
notions of womanhood through negotiations of modernity in relation to the self.

Women are also negotiating their identity by rejecting the medical profession for other jobs. Younger generations of Cuban women are opting for non-medical careers and jobs, for instance working in the tourism industry where the pay is better, and where they can develop self-interests. One young niece of a Cuban doctor explains:

Look I've watched tia (her aunt [doctor] Maria) running around, wearing herself out and for what? Being a doctor is OK, but you don't even get to travel much anymore. Me, I'm young. I'm interested in other countries. I want a different life. I'll be looking for a job in turismo (tourism). (Warman 2001, 319)

Brotherton notes that parallel capitalistic structures such as a “dual economy in U.S. dollars and Cuban pesos” are emerging within the state, while simultaneously people are becoming frustrated with the healthcare system and its lack of resources (2008, 267). To add insult to injury, national pharmacies that are well stocked with supplies and medicine are only open to foreigners (Brotherton 2008, 267). In this context of complex economic shifts, medical careers do not retain the same value to many women. This shift away from the state sector into these capitalistic sectors represents a symbolic break from the original Revolutionary woman and introduces the question of whether the FMC will be able to ‘exert pressure’ as it has, onto the government as shifts in political, economic, and social spheres change. This is the ultimate Cuban Woman Paradox: in the absence of their symbolic value to the socialist state, will women be able to maintain and obtain higher social status through alternative means?

**Conclusion**

This paper has attempted to highlight the ways in which Cuban women's symbolic link to the state has been both helpful, and detrimental to their social status. The FMC enabled women's participation in the revolution and helped to establish a substantial place for women within the healthcare sector (Warman 2001; Kirk 2017). This dual symbol of women and healthcare worked symbiotically for the reinforcement of socialist ideologies of equality. This is represented in the high proportion of women in medical professions, the necessarily large proportion of female patients and their access to contentious progressive healthcare services like abortion. However, since the FMC is fundamentally rooted in the Cuban Revolution and its ideology, it cannot necessarily address the realities of women—which would effectively mean departing from the image of socialism—who are negatively affected by the new shifting economic modes and practices. Furthermore, female nurses and doctors in the health sector are disproportionately pressured to remain symbolically linked to the promotion of the state while, in reality, they face the growing mob of a “medically literate” and discontented patients of the post-Soviet era (Brotherton 2008; Warman 2001). This had led to negotiations of what it means to be a Cuban woman, by challenging the notions of progress through abortion practices that subvert state idealism (Andaya 2014, 74), and also by abandoning forms of participation, such as jobs in the healthcare sector.

**References**


GOVERNMENTALITY AND MANAGING RISK THROUGH THE YOUTH JUSTICE SYSTEM

Victoria Stagg | University of Manitoba

keywords | governmentality, ideology, youth, youth justice system, self-regulation, discourse, risk management

abstract | The theory of governmentality is analyzed and critiqued through its application to an ethnography called Students as Threats: Schooling Inside a Youth Prison” by Morghan Vélez Young-Alfaro. In the selected ethnography, Young-Alfaro is exploring incarcerated students experiences inside a youth prison and how it affects them in terms of education and forming identities. The theory of governmentality was selected because it is the idea that one's mental attitude, mindset, outlook, beliefs, rationality, way of thinking – helps an individual or a social institution interpret and respond to situations (Beasley 2010). It can shed some light on the creation of risky subjects, adult-youth discourse, pipeline to prison, and becoming the entrepreneurial self. Governmentality does have limitations in the application, like any theory, it is imperfect when applying it to real life examples as demonstrated in this article.

Governmentality is all around us, it is all encompassing. It plays a large role in the discourses of youth and impacts the way in which youth are seen. In the first part of this essay the selected ethnography will be introduced, “Students as Threats: Schooling Inside a Youth Prison” by Morghan Vélez Young-Alfaro, afterwards the selected theory of risk governmentality will be explained, finally a critical analysis will apply the theory to the ethnography before any limitations are addressed. The focus of this paper is how youth are impacted by governmentality in that they are constantly seen as risks; this causes them to end up in the youth justice system which ultimately leads to the reproduction of these ideologies. Youth need to be seen as more than just threats, especially those from excluded sub-populations.

Selected Ethnography

The ethnography selected for this paper “Students as Threats: Schooling Inside a Youth Prison” by Morghan Vélez Young-Alfaro is a study exploring incarcerated students experiences inside a youth prison and how it impacts them in terms of education and forming identities. The majority of the students inside this youth prison were minority populations such as Latino, and African American making up more than 50%, there was 30% of the population which were unidentified; therefore, this number could be much higher. Minority students in the educational system are more likely to be expelled, suspended, and incarcerated. This addresses the idea that there is a “widespread racialized approach to school discipline” (Young-Alfaro 2017, 301), which is thought to be separated from the parental role.

In studying incarcerated students’ experiences in a youth prison, one is able to see the similarities and differences between the prison and educational systems for youth. Young-Alfaro focuses on two spaces within the youth prison: the classrooms and the extracurricular program of creative writing. In focusing on these two spaces, there is a noticeable difference in the treatment of the students and the forming of their identities within the youth prison. Along with observing classroom spaces, participant-observations also occurred in areas that activities took place in the evening for the youth.

Similar to the idea of governmentality, if youth are not ‘docile bodies’ and ‘useful’ to the state, they are perceived as unacceptable and criminal thus, administering the governmentality biopower through the youth justice system (Besley 2010). With the idea that the majority of youth in the prison system are from minority populations, it is visible that they are seen as not “docile bodies” which are those that can be transformed through disciplinary acts, before they do something that is punishable. This relates to the more targeted theory, risk governmentality, in which due to these youth being targeted as ‘risky’ subjects they are
subjected to more surveillance so that they can be monitored and appropriately handled in the case that they disrupt ‘normal’, non-risky, citizens. This is magnified even more within the prison institution, especially since most of the students were incarcerated for non-serious offences.

Through the data analysis of speech using software, the analysis of the speech illustrated a way for better understanding the discourse and culture created within the prison. This culture produced the idea of the students as threats. The majority of these racialized and demeaning speech acts come from senior officers; it is a common theme that the students will continue to return to the prison system even after they get out. Through adult-youth interactions outside of the extracurricular creative writing program, the idea of the students being criminals or ‘messed-up’ becomes a permanent and internalized discourse within their minds.

Many students actually liked school instead of crime but due to internalized racial and criminal discourse from adults even outside of the prison system, they felt that they were unable to connect properly which in turn, reinforced the behaviour. The only time in the prison that students were able to overcome the negative discourse was in the creative writing class where they were referred to as being “likeable” and a “normal kid”. Mr. Smith and the other creative writing staff were thought as having control over the students in the class, but the control perceived had more to do with the respect and treatment unlike that which a criminal would receive. Students were also given the chance to form their academic identities and hopes. If adult-youth interactions were changed in everyday discourse it might be possible to change the discourse of youth as threats.

**Selected Theory**

Institutions such as prisons, businesses, schools, and churches can be understood as techniques of power that are a form of “power/knowledge” that observes, monitors, shapes, and controls the behaviour of people within these institutions (Besley 2010). These are all influences of the State that force us to internalize the forms of power that are exercised through these institutions. Due to the widespread policies and features of neoliberalism, which have been around for the last couple decades, the State withdrew some of its responsibility and placed it onto the individual. This created a self-regulating population so that people are now subjected to more risk and responsibility through the added responsibilities.

Governmentality is the link of “govern” and “mentality”, it is the idea that one’s mental attitude, mindset, outlook, beliefs, rationality, way of thinking – helps an individual or a social institution interpret and respond to situations. Govern in this sense is not in relation to the government or politics, but instead it is related to the “art of governing”, it is the “conduct of conducts” for interacting with one’s environment (Besley 2010). Governmentality is a form of power that cannot be pinpointed as coming from only one source; rather it is coming from within and all around us. It often appears as a form of “guidance” instead of power, this is how it acts as a way to regulate society. We internalize this guidance and take it as improving ourselves thinking it is helping our welfare, instead of seeing it as a type of control, we think of it as being our best selves (Fournier 2018).

Everyone is self-regulating, even the youth population; in the ethnography, the youth populations are students who are between 15 to 17 years old and attending school within prison. The youth population is subjected to governmentality as well, but unlike an adult they are being governed by outside forces more than they are governing themselves. Much of the population considered as youth are either seen as “vulnerable” or as “delinquent” which can be seen as something that oppresses them. They are categorized as risky due to the fact that they have not yet fully developed the means of governing themselves. Much of the youth population are continuously under self-scrutiny as they develop and work on their evolving identities, so during this process of the internalization of self-regulation, they are under more surveillance than their adult counterparts.
Youth are acted upon by socializing factors that teach them that they need to be constantly working on themselves. As they pass milestones they are rewarded through believing they are reaching the end goal, which could be seen as being a ‘docile’ or ‘normative’ adult. Youth who act outside what one may consider the ‘right path’ may be seen as criminal or as threats which causes the State to step in and take action to put them back into their place or place them into a disciplinary institution. Since we are constantly working toward the idea of the ultimate citizen, a citizen who is involved in the many facets of society, such as the family, religion, behavioural patterns, and service, the State retains control. Any behaviour outside the norms is punished or excluded from society through the lived-in communities regulating behaviour.

**Application of Theory to Ethnography**

In this section, I will apply the theory of governmentality, more specifically risk governmentality, to the chosen ethnography “Students as Threats: Schooling Inside a Youth Prison” by Morghan Vélez Young-Alfaro. I have chosen two articles which best address the theory of youth and risk governmentality, “Governmentality of Youth: Managing Risky Subjects” by Tina Besley, which applies the theory of governmentality to youth, and “Government and Control” by Nikolas Rose, which explains governmentality and risk. I will first apply risk governmentality to the prison and educational institutional management of risk before I focus on the adult-youth discourse which frames the institution’s youths as threats. Finally I will address how this risk governmentality causes students to remain on the pipeline to prison.

**Management of Risky Subjects**

To begin, starting with the introduction of the ethnography, it is clear that risk governmentality plays a large role in the lives of youth, especially those from minority populations or those that are considered degenerates. The very first paragraph explains that students of colour and those with disabilities are subjected to a “disproportionate use of zero tolerance policies” (Besley 2010) when it comes to disciplinary actions. This is a present theme within the entire article and according to Nikolas Rose, if someone does not ‘fit in’ with community or society standards, they are put under more surveillance and thus become a risk to be managed through disciplinary acts. Management in this example is to avoid deviance and to separate those that do not conform. Nikolas Rose (2000) states that prisoners are not recruited from only the poor but from the uneducated, unaffiliated, and African-Americans or other minorities.

The ethnography chosen often references the ideologies that are present in everyday society and how these dominant ideologies turn youths into risks that need to be managed. Ideology is understood as being a set of beliefs or values that are normalized within society. Young-Alfaro believes that school institutions are “weaved and crafted, influenced by dominant ideologies and macro-processes” (Young-Alfaro 2017, 301) and that this overlaps with youth prison school institutions. Through her focus on two of the spaces of education within the prison, Young-Alfaro discovered that the school culture had mechanisms in place that used patterned institutional interactions to turn the students into criminals (Besley 2010, 303). These patterned institutional interactions that are in place are strategies of control to manage the excluded or ‘other’ populations which are thought to be too risky for society. This process serves as a way to either reintegrate these risky individuals back into society as self-regulating individuals or puts them at risk through serving as a way to exhibit the penalization of what would happen if one were to “cease to be ‘docile bodies’” (Besley 2010).

In managing the risk “individuals, families, firms, organizations, communities are urged to take upon themselves the responsibility for the security of their property and their persons, and for that of their own families” (Rose 2000, 327). This allows the State to withdraw a lot of their responsibility and place it onto individuals and communities to do the job of managing most of the risks. The management of risk also leads to rationality and decision-making in terms of self-
regulation and ‘responsibilizing the self.’ This is why most youths, especially marginalized youth are thought of as risks, they are thought to be in the process of learning self-regulation, thus any deviation causes worry.

The cultural lens in which Young-Alfaro addresses in the ethnography towards these ‘risky’ youth is similar to that of what Nikolas Rose calls excluded sub-populations or what Besley calls the ‘Other.’ Due to the fact that they come from marginalized populations that already experience negative views from others, these youth are subjected to the same views. Youth as a whole are already portrayed as ‘risky’ subjects, due to much of the discourse placing them in one of two categories on either end of the spectrum ‘good’ or ‘bad.’ It seems that there is no middle ground when it comes to the way adults see youth, since adults see youth as being in a constant state of transition. Youth should not be placed in either one of the categories and by doing so, there is more stress being added to their lives if they cannot conform to the category of being ‘good.’

**Adult-Youth Discourses**

Throughout Young-Alfaro’s ethnography, there are a lot of adult-youth discourses which reiterate racial and excluding ideologies. Terms and phrases such as “their culture,” “their families,” “he’s nothing but a gangbanger,” “you delinquent,” “are you going to be a problem today?” and many other phrases that separate and reproduce the fact that these students are ‘others’ and need to be controlled (Besley 2010). These discourses “redeploy all the moralizing techniques of ethical reconstruction in the attempt to instil the capacity for self-management – ‘naming, shaming, and blaming’–or ‘reintegrative shaming’ as it is more properly known has become a great favourite in these techniques of ethical reconstruction” (Rose 2000, 336). Reintegrative shaming is a shaming exchange that is used within the justice system to distance the offender from the act they committed while still expressing that the act was not acceptable. This type of shaming shows the youth prisoner that although they may have done something unacceptable, they still have the ability to change and self-regulate themselves.

This discourse does more to exclude the students within the youth prison institution. It also causes complicity among these youth. They may seem like they have just allowed themselves to be “beat down” within the system but they do have hope for themselves. They seem to be able to separate themselves within the discourse, from the regular expectations of returning, but many of the youth within the prison institution still return. The ownership of criminalization within the youth discourse seemed to be similar to the adult discourse towards them. Within the ethnography, Young-Alfaro writes about a student named Luke who seems to be confident that he is getting out of the cycle but as he continues talking, he speaks about his peers the same way that the staff of the prison would.

Within the ethnography, Young-Alfaro focuses more on the negative racial ideologies and how that may pertain to the “established identity of ‘criminal.’” Again, I am applying this focus on persons of colour is a similar idea to what Nikolas Rose labelled the excluded sub-populations. Much of the discourse that occurs between the adults and youth relates to the adults expecting the youth to develop the ‘conducts of conducts’ or self-regulation through it. We often use language towards people that might shame them for the sake of steering them the ‘right way’ but in the case with youth, especially excluded youth, racial ideologies play a factor. The racial and negative discourse reproduces and internalizes these negative ideologies.

Within the prison, there was not much of a difference between the language used other than the fact that the senior officers were more comfortable speaking up about their ‘other’ or ‘exclusionary’ views. It did not matter what race the officer was (Young-Alfaro 2017, 307) but the majority of them viewed themselves as better. Within the creative writing spaces, students were able to work on their identities beyond prison. They were given the freedom to think of the future. During the creative writing discourse, the students were asked who they might like to read their work so that
someone could understand them better. Many of them wished that more adults would be able to read their work, and maybe understand them in terms of the realization that they are not threats like much of society believes (Young-Alfaro 2017, 310).

Adults are fine placing the blame on youth for bad behaviour but in reality, many adults act in similar ways and have just as big of a role with the problems arising in society. Besley explains that social analysts view youth today as the 'scapegoat' generation or as the 'fugitive culture.' This comes from the fear that adults have towards youth and this discourse arises from “attempts to control of govern youth” (Besley 2010). Due to this negative discourse towards youth, all of this naming, shaming, and blaming and exclusion, it is ultimately creating a cyclical path through penal system, also known as the pipeline to prison.

**Exclusion and the Pipeline to Prison**

Despite the motive to control and coerce youth into governable subjects or self-regulating subjects, many of the youth that are in the youth prison institution continue to return. Due to being placed into the prison system, they will always be plagued with the label of being a criminal. Thus, setting them up for many obstacles and stressors in life for when they get out. The youth in the study have also internalized the ideological notions that are too present within the adult-youth discourse. This discourse presents itself in the discourse with their peers as well as they repeat the phrases used towards them. They learn to accept this negative discourse and eventually it becomes present in the way they see themselves.

This youth prison institution is described to be all about restriction and surveillance. All behaviour is monitored, and students need permissions to do many things within the youth prison. Similar to other schooling institutions within the United States, this becomes a common theme. These institutions, through restriction and surveillance, are seeking to control and condition students to be more self-regulatory and self-entrepreneurial. Self-regulation and the entrepreneurial-self derive from neo-liberalism and hold the meaning “that one establishes oneself through forms of personal investment” (Besley 2010, 540).

Students of colour are victimized through educational institutions which cause them to receive more attention from security or officers in school and thus, land them into the prison system. Most students that are in the youth prison institution are going to schools that already resemble the prison institutions, there are police officers, metal detectors, and the discourse is similar. Many teachers within inner-city educational institutions are temps or non-educated in teaching which may show the students that they are not worth much. Students internalize the discourse, and this impacts them for their futures of becoming a self-regulating individual.

**Reproduction and Becoming the Entrepreneurial Self**

Many of the students within the youth justice system enjoyed school but due to the racialized ideologies towards them, they were considered risks and it ultimately caused them to become more disconnected. School allowed students to form their academic identities and allowed them to feel ‘normal.’ Within the prison institution, the creative writing space gave the students the opportunities to form this academic identity that they would otherwise be missing out on within the prison system. Mr. Smith, the creative writing teacher respected the students and broke some of the prison practices which gave the impression that he had more control over the students.

Most of the prison practices were focused around treating the prisoners as risky subjects to be managed but the creative writing space worked on helping them to reconstruct their wills to become self-regulating individuals for when they do get out of the system. However, the negative discourse and internalization of it can lead someone back into the pipeline. Since the negative adult-youth discourse is internalized and often reproduced, it can make it harder for students within the prison system to fully become self-regulating individuals. The discourse between
adults and the students act as an accessory to the image of students as threats.

**Limitations of the Theory**

This theory of risk governmentality within the chosen articles does not account for instances of racial ideologies, the discourse between adults and youths and how it reproduces these ideologies, and the cyclical management of ‘risky’ youth through the pipeline to prison. Governmentality is also limited, due to the fact that it seems similar in that it stems from the ideological state apparatuses which are institutions such as the church, media, family, education, and law. These ideological state apparatuses employ hegemony which can become a huge part of governmentality in the sense that they are attempting to control and influence us although, governmentality is more of a guiding influence.

The theory did not account for aspects of racialized ideologies which led to labelling these marginalized youth populations as risky. Many of the youths that are in the justice system are there for minor infractions, but race and ethnicity became a “part of the process of attending school behind bars” (Besley 2010, 310). These racialized ideologies and stereotypes impact what and who are seen as risks. Students of colour were often targeted for expulsion or the youth justice system at a higher rate than their white and Asian-American peers (Young-Alfaró 2017, 301), even if their peers had similar infractions.

Another limitation of governmentality is that it is supposed to be an attempt at regulating the behaviour of populations and creating a self-regulating individual but through utilizing the youth justice system, it often seems to reproduce the risk that they were trying to manage in the first place. This is evidenced in the ethnography through the idea of the ‘pipeline to prison.’ Instead of helping these ‘risky’ individuals, the youth justice system seems to damage them more than anything through being labelled as a criminal. The label often destroys opportunities for these youth to better themselves, so they end up right back in the prison institution because they were unable to make it as a ‘normal’ active citizen.

**Conclusion**

By attempting to control and minimize risk through governmentality, it seems that we are just creating more in the case of the youth justice system and the pipeline to prison. Racialized ideologies are preventing a lot of youth from being able to access opportunities they may have otherwise had due to the management of them as risky subjects. Adult-youth discourses also reproduce these racialized ideologies as well as making the youths internalize much of the negative discourse. Many of the youths are unable to return to society as a self-regulated individual due to the internalized negative discourse and the negative labelling as being a risky individual. Governmentality can be beneficial for society, but it does have its faults in reproducing and creating more risk. If the discourse focused more on helping the students to self-govern then it is possible that the ideologies could be changed for the better.

**References**


